

Allison Schulnik's *Hobo Clown*: grotesque resistance, storytelling metamorphosis

and Franz Kafka

by

william boyd fraser, sculptor

A Major Research Paper presented to OCAD University

in partial fulfillment of the requirements

for the degree of

Master of Arts

in

Contemporary Art, Design and New Media Art Histories

Toronto, Ontario, Canada, April, 2015

© william boyd fraser, 2015

Author's Declaration

i hereby declare that i am the sole author of this thesis. this is a true copy of the thesis, including any required final versions, as accepted by my examiners.

i authorize OCAD University to lend this thesis to other institutions or individuals for the purpose of scholarly research.

i understand that my thesis may be made electronically available to the public.

i further authorize OCAD University to reproduce this thesis by photocopying or by other means, in total or in part, at the request of other institutions or individuals for the purpose of scholarly research.

Abstract

Allison Schulnik's *Hobo Clown* clay stop-motion film is analyzed using a rhetorical triangulation of persuasion. A hybrid method alternates Schulnik, reader and an imaginary Other for three points of view providing comparisons of story perspective. Franz Kafka's *The Metamorphosis* provides an exemplary third person narrative style. A history of stop-motion animation, hobos and clowns, along with animation theory of metamorphosis contribute to a hypothetical null questioning of Schulnik's grotesque as a constructive identity resisting expectation. Mise-en-scène of staging and music provide sensory, visual and auditory description along with primary source materials and theoretical insight for describing a reading of the film's grotesque transformations. The argument for an in between space finds identity unresolved, yet yields features of contemporary grotesque for thinking about *self(s)*. A singular meaning for contemporary grotesque is not determinable, however a contemporary anti-story of resistant through an anti-theory of open-ended subversion suggests perspectives for potential future research.

Keywords: Allison Schulnik, Animation, Anti-Story, Grotesque, Metamorphosis, Stop-motion, Storytelling, Franz Kafka

Acknowledgements

i acknowledge the wisdom that has supported me; found in the lived experiences of those who shared their stories of struggle and the engaging work of Allison Schulnik.

Dedication

in memory of all my ancestors.

Contents

INTRODUCTION	1-15
Chapter I BACKGROUND CONTEXT	16-32
Chapter II STORY	33-47
Chapter III READER	48-65
Chapter IV ANTI-STORY	66-78
Chapter V CONCLUSION	79-86
Bibliography	87-92
Reference Materials	93-94
Appendix A: Mise-en-scène	95-106
Appendix B: Annotative Discography	107-110

INTRODUCTION

... “anti-aesthetic”...a critique which destructures the order of representations in order to reinscribe them ...“anti-aesthetic” also signals a practice, cross-disciplinary in nature, that is sensitive to cultural forms engaged in a politic (e.g., feminist art) or rooted in a vernacular—that is, to forms that deny the idea of a privileged aesthetic realm.

Hal Foster, *The Anti-Aesthetic: Essays on Postmodern Culture*

Grotesque is the real beauty.

Allison Schulnik, *Wild Exaggeration: The Grotesque Body in Contemporary Art*

Human beings, more or less, like to order their world. Categories and classifications, indexed scales and definitions all construct a perception of understanding. Contemporary art history often describes the artistic disruptions of imposed order, including postmodern’s resistance to *self*, as destabilized. A theoretical shift suggests a hybridity of social pluralism and a space in between the collapse of oppositional binaries will find metamorphosis as such a process of uncertain reality. This is fertile ground for research into a marginalized field of animation within cinema studies.¹ Allison Schulnik’s independently produced *Hobo Clown*² is a 5 min. clay stop-motion art animation with numerous metamorphic transformations. Schulnik’s handmade digital film presents an abstracted storytelling of an imagined reality that I argue creates resistance against conformity to expectation. Kafkaesque uncertainty playfully characterizes the unlucky central figure as unfixing reason. In Franz Kafka fashion, *Hobo Clown*, as an

¹ Michael Frierson, *Clay Animation: American Highlights 1908 to Present*, ed. Frank Beaver (Toronto, ON: Maxwell Macmillian, 1994), ix.

² Allison Schulnik, *Hobo Clown*. Clay stop-motion, puppet and clay painting free form, *Grizzly Bear Granny Diner* sound track, 2008, 5:10 min. See, *Allison Schulnik*, accessed July 23, 2013, <http://www.allisonschulnik.com>. See, Grizzly Bear, “Granny Diner,” by Christopher Robert Bear, Daniel Raphael Rossen, Christopher M. Taylor, Edward Droste, recorded November 5, 2007, on *Friend*, Warp Records LC 02070, 2007, compact disc. See, accessed October 16, 2013, <http://grizzly-bear.net/>, accessed September 21, 2014, <http://grizzly-bear.net/music/eps/friend/>. Duration is listed on Grizzly Bear Internet site as 4:49 min.

experimentally oriented music video, plays with satirical contrary to subvert perceptions and widen boundaries for marginalized and disenfranchised Other within contemporary animation. Between the real and unreal the world inside the animated story is a space for conceptual artistic oration. A contemporary art history null theory frameworks an *anti-conventional, grotesque metamorphic* as a disruptive double negative resisting societal norms. Grotesque, as a contrary aesthetic, is an anti-anti resistance premise or constructive anti-theory suggesting a direction beyond positivist or empirical limitations. I propose an experimental triangulation of speculative points of view including author as self, reader as co-creator and a third person Other as a figural subjective of new ontological designation. Ontology describes ideas about being. Each perspective provides insight. As a null hypothesis seeking to define features of contemporary grotesque, this paper will ask, whether Schulnik's grotesque is one of alienation, or paradoxically, a resist to identity through three conceptualized rhetorical forms comparing the contrary descriptions of sensual, visual and auditory elements of Schulnik's storytelling animation.³

A working definition of positive resistance speculates that Schulnik is using the extreme of grotesque in a way suggested through Kafka to create a fuzzy and playful unhinging of storytelling expectation.⁴ The conceptual triangulation of perspective will be explained through classic Greek rhetoric strategy and the comparison reference to Kafka's *The Metamorphosis* supporting the three points of view arguments will be

³ Null hypothesis claims are chance and nullified unless significant evidence can falsify false statements as truth.

⁴ Fuzzy logic or the fuzzy set theory of professors of mathematics, Lotfi A. Zadeh and Dieter Klaua opens a space for the subjective and vagueness of social construct over the formalist structure of binaries. Also see, Frances S. Connelly, *The Grotesque in Western Art and Culture: The Image at Play* (New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 12-13. Connelly suggests *Spielraum* as a deconstructive description of a space of play that is found within the grotesque agency to destabilize perceptions and definitions. Note: Storytelling is used to describe a co-creative process involving author and audience forming meaning rather than narrative semiotic or structuralism categorizes of text.

returned to after a brief outline description of Schulnik's *Hobo Clown*. As a sculptor, I am attracted to impressions made in clay and the fluidity of metamorphosis in clay stop-motion; its intensely intimate and crafted labour I bias as producing personal, inner expression.

Allison Schulnik's *Eager* was awarded *Best Abstract Animation* at the 2014 Ottawa International Film Festival. Schulnik's film education at the California Institute of the Arts (CalArts, BFA 2000, Experimental Animation) and critically recognized career as an internationally ranked artist suggests the importance of grotesque as a contemporary art style.⁵ A close critique adaptation of literary New Criticism found in narrative studies describes a text as using plot, setting, events, gaps, episodes, tone, duration, discourse and story/narrative to name a few elements.⁶ Here, contemporary art history and critical analysis are adapted for discussion. In a neutral positioning, away from narratology's discourse and semiotics intersubjectivity, Schulnik's *Hobo Clown* is considered an storyteller's oratory of voice and vision presenting a series of connected sensual, visual and auditory details that initially can be thought of as describing an interior consciousness or narrative state of mind as qualia observed through sequences of changing realities. In following chapters greater description of Schulnik's media techniques will be expand with observations of the sequences within the film related to sensual, visual, and auditory detail. A general description situates a central Hobo Clown figure undergoing several episodes of questionable traditional beginning, middle and ending logic.

⁵ Allison Schulnik is listed as 500 on a top 1000 artists in the world. *Verfhond's list of NEW MASTERS-2013, 500*, posted December 31, 2012, <http://www.pinterest.com/pin/477522366710533173/>. Found at *Rembrandt's Dog List*, posted January 18, 2011, accessed July 26, 2013, <http://a1000livingpainters.wordpress.com/2014/01/01/allison-schulnik/2-%C2%A0allison%C2%A0schulnik/>.

⁶ David Herman, ed., *The Cambridge Companion to Narrative* (New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2007). Also see, Terry Eagleton, *Literary Theory: An Introduction*, 2nd ed. (Minneapolis, Minnesota: University of Minnesota, 1996).

As an experimental film, *Hobo Clown* starts with its painted faced, central clay puppet character, dressed in black wearing a flowered hat, striped scarf and rose boutonner sitting alone and marginal in a dark alley by a makeshift fire. Brief cycles of silent descriptive shots with non-diegesis (outside the storyworld) music sound-over, reveal aspects of the character's external world while pacing of music and metamorphic transformations involving the Hobo Clown's eyes swirling with colour imply an interior world of thought and/or shift in events. Seated on a wooden box in abject poverty the setting is emphasized with chiaroscuro lighting as an emblematic scene (See, Appendix A: Mise-en-scène: 1-14) running for a duration of almost half the film. Cued by a metamorphosis of the Hobo Clown's eyes, and beginning with a fade in from bright white the Hobo Clown puppet appears transformed as a figure wearing white in a white utopia garden setting filled with idyllic flowers (See, 17-29) running for approximately a minute. A sequence of images involving face and head metamorphoses cue a dark space interpreted as an inserted, interior intellectual montage of the Hobo Clown's mind (See, 30-34). One at a time, three metamorphic heads are presented in succession for a duration of 21 seconds.

Another metamorphosis in the last sequence involves the clay Hobo Clown puppet and a transition motif of clay painting shows an independent mandala form on the ground. This cue having evolving from a montage interior or non-diegesis inserted space formed from the Hobo Clown eventually transitions to a mandala, as it transitions by morphology into a distorted abstracted head upon the Hobo Clown white dressed body featuring green eyes on what can be described as an alien head (See, 35-53) running almost a minute in length. The story has realistic and abstracted developments that flow with the music as it rises and falls with emotive intensities prompting metamorphoses'

cues. Transitions in the film provide the basis for Schulnik's puppet character's multiple narrative realities. Somewhere in between real and abstract *mise-en-scène* and character detail are themes of loneliness, utopia and abrupt actions speculated as telling a story about a personal struggle transforming into a redemptive liberation. The surprise ending appears to present a reduced transcendence in the form of a grotesque. Possible meanings are open to a number of point of view perspectives.

Is Schulnik's grotesque character a signature of first person experience? Is Schulnik storytelling from a first person point of view? Without consideration of the artist's voice, it's speculative considering some deconstructive ideas deny a reliability of first person statements. During a presentation at The Vermont Studios Center, Schulnik shared images of paintings and other works including those specific to the *Hobo Clown* series drawn from for the animated film,

I did another film called *Hobo Clown* and again then I think a lot of them [the Hobo Clown figures in paintings/film] are, I mean, like every painter I think is, you know, paints themselves, so they're probably all self-portraits...Not that one though [laughter from the audience].⁷

Artist's self-portraiture is an important conjecture. An interesting comment that followed Schulnik's distancing from what might have been a grotesque image was "[t]his is a rough girl [painting]. Ya, its funny I think, um, the men I paint are more self-portraits than the women or maybe they're two sides of one person. I don't know."⁸ Attribution to any mystical conception is also conjecture, yet all is possible.

⁷ Allison Schulnik, "Allison Schulnik Artist Talk at the Vermont Studio Center." *The Vermont Studio Center*, Digital, 38:06 min., posted January 23, 2014, accessed February 12, 2014, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=eDncuLL2Bo4>. The quote is found beginning at approximately 27:53-28:18min.

⁸ *Ibid.*, 28:18-28:29 min.

The grotesque as a transcendence of spirit that embodies the immaterial while the frame of the human body grounds the reality of concrete distortions and exaggerated form. Where Schulnik potentially brings these two corporal sensibilities together could be within dream or subconscious manipulations or, through real life observance to become a constructive grotesque aesthetic. One other reference in conversation on the topic of self-portraiture comes between writer Christine Ziemba asking about the source of genesis for the Hobo and Clown, says Schulnik,

They just started to appear in my drawings. I drew Hobo Clown one day. My studio and living space used to be in the heart of Skid Row (in Los Angeles). I came across a lot of amazing transient people on my everyday walk to my studio. I'm sure that seeped into my subconscious. But they also come from myself, people around me. I'm sure there's a lot of self-portraiture going on. Isn't that a saying, 'All art is self-portraiture?'... I also love the theatrical hobo, the macabre and sad tramp. However, to me they are more from the fantastical, than any reality we know.⁹

Schulnik's particular grotesque merges physical and psychic, and potentially other realities as a signature of grotesque theme, especially when found in conversation between Schulnik and Ziemba, says Schulnik,

I seem to be drawn to the forlorn reject. But I'm also intrigued by the brilliant and foolish genius outcast. The animal-like human, and human-like animal. I like drama and sap. I like over-indulgence in material, but also abstention. Control in chaos. The hand-made. I like to make something from nothing.¹⁰

The thesis question presents a tautology of redundancy of paradoxical ideas repeated in numerous ways to demonstrate a collapse of binaries that distance the real from the

⁹ Christine N. Ziemba, "Artist and Alumna Allison Schulnik Talks Hobo Clowns and Grizzly Bear," *24700: News from California Institute of the Arts*, posted April 21, 2010, accessed July 25, 2013, <http://blog.calarts.edu/2010/04/21/allison-schulnik-interview/>. Sourced from Mark Moore Gallery. See, Allison Schulnik, *The Vermont Studio Center*. This transcript quote is located at 17:01-17:16 min. "A lot of the painting... [a] lot of the work I do is based off of people I know, loved ones, family, myself, hum, or random strangers that I see in the street." Also, Schulnik comments within this interview about a 101 Freeway "vagrant pigeon wrangler" as inspirational for a "Bird Hobo" and the eventual incarnation of "Long Haired Hobo."

¹⁰ Ibid.

unreal. It is a sameness between alienation as outsider and a resistance to identity that uses contradiction, absurd or concretely, to discuss the conditions of change and perception while making the arguments for points of view as narrator selves.

Schulnik provides some significance for rhythmic unity between the colourful transformations of the eyes and head of the Hobo Clown with the beat of the music, yet colour, emotions and contrasting settings of black and white, slow melodic pace and the rise above an interpreted keynote E above Middle C (piano scale) suggest a classic, dramatic structure. One of Schulnik's most candid internet interviews was shared with writer akka b. posted on Dragonframe (a stop motion animation software Internet site). Schulnik explains the connection between California School of the Arts' (CalArts) Jules Engel's teaching on dance and colour, says Schulnik, "I like to start with a piece of music, then edit beat-by-beat the shapes, forms, colors and movement of the characters and scenes."¹¹ Schulnik describes a immediate and visceral artistic approach,

My characters are inspired by my need to create something that moves and breathes, whether it's still on canvas or walking on a screen. Their expression and emotions are somewhat gestural, and found in the clay. It's just a guttural straightforward approach to making inanimate things communicate... I think all the films are like wanderings, where what they retain in traditional material and methods, they avoid in narrative structure. To me, they are an uncertain account of what exists somewhere between tragedy and farce.¹²

A flux of certainty, metaphorically as metamorphosis, confuses stability. A story thinks through connected events in a film cued throughout narrative plot of the storyworld or shared world as its internal diegesis.¹³ This dynamic situation can be disrupted.

¹¹ akka b., "Artist Profile: Allison Schulnik," *Dragonframe*, accessed July 26, 2013, <http://www.dragonframe.com/profile-allison-schulnik.php>.

¹² Ibid.

¹³ See, David Bordwell and Kristin Thompson, *Film Art: An Introduction*, 2nd ed. (New York, NY: Alfred A. Knopf, 1986): 384-389. Diegesis: Both visible and presumed action of storyworld. Non-diegesis: Images

Professor of English and Philosophy, Robert C. Evans, writes about Franz Kafka's metamorphosis of the grotesque. Kafka's *The Metamorphosis* and Schulnik's *Hobo Clown* may have several commonalities. Just as Schulnik described a sense of humanity within avoidance to narrative, Evans writes, "Kafka, in other words, achieves a grotesque effect precisely by making Gregor [protagonist] seem pitiable, ugly, laughable, and sympathetic all at once."¹⁴ Evans refers to both literary scholars, Wolfgang Kayser and Geoffrey Galt Harpham, to frame the grotesque in relation to Kafka's story. First, Evans cites Harpham's use of Kayser's idea about estrangement.¹⁵ This is an alien condition of relations; one that Evans engages from an agreement between Kayser and Harpham. Harpham thinks grotesque can be compared to a paradox of contradictions of terms, whether fatiguing on the mind, vulgar or meaningless; it approaches the holy by entering new realms of the unexpected to describe new discoveries of relations, experience and broken rules.¹⁶ The importance of irrationality suits a paradoxical question.

Parameters concerning the grotesque as an action is found in Evans' reference to Harpham's discussion of subverting rather than confirming expectations and Kayser's sense of suddenness and surprise, referenced by both Evans and Harpham as essential

of events from outside the storyworld action. Story: What is perceived as the goings on inside the storyworld, while plot shows the actualization of event actions. A simple distinction between diegesis and narration can be expressed as space versus the telling events conveyed within that space. See, David Herman, ed., "Glossary," in *The Cambridge Companion to Narrative* (New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2007): 274-282. Herman describes the storyworld as the "blueprint" of whom, what, where, why and in what kind of reality. Also see, Hayward, Susan. "Diegesis/Diegetic, Non-Diegetic/Extra and Intra-Diegetic." In *Cinema Studies: The Key Concepts*, 101-102. 3rd ed. New York, NY: Routledge, 2006.

¹⁴ Robert C. Evan, "Aspects of the Grotesque in Franz Kafka's *The Metamorphosis*," in *The Grotesque*, ed. Harold Bloom and Blake Hobby (New York, NY: Bloom's Literary Criticism, Infobase Publications, 2009): 135-144, 137.

¹⁵ Ibid., 136. Also, Wolfgang Kayser, *The Grotesque in Art and Literature*, trans. Ulrich Weisstein (1957; Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1963), 184. Also, Geoffrey Harpham, "The Grotesque: First Principles," *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 34, no. 4 (Summer 1976): 461-468, 462. Sourced through David V. Mason, accessed March 16, 2014, <http://yavanika.org/classes/reader/sources/kilby-aesthetics.pdf>.

¹⁶ Geoffrey Galt Harpham, *On the Grotesque: Strategies of Contradiction in Art and Literature* (1982; Aurora, CO: The Davis group Publishers, 2006), 23.

Kayser grotesque; Kayser's grotesque and its literary device used by Kafka in *The Metamorphosis* present "ominous tension."¹⁷ In short what is alien is an absurd condition of estrangement within an environment or state of Kayser's "abyss" of unknowing (a structure of deconstruction to be will be discussed in a later chapter, *Anti-Story*).¹⁸

Harpham's extension of physical distortion as grotesque defines grotesque as a response to a situation.¹⁹ Two points Evan makes about Kafka's work: the main question is about meaning, whether the story has shown physical change or juxtaposition of the comic and horrific or the inhuman and absurd, and secondly, the answer is found in the grotesque effect to reveal "...deep-seated human anxieties."²⁰ Is it a kind of anxiety or tension to be confronted with the unexpected or illogical? Is grotesque a kind of altered reasoning using the double negative to create the constructive? In Schulnik's *Hobo Clown*, unexpected grotesque provoke an awareness to anxieties that inspire constructive idea(s) for understand this story's narrative or non-narrative. Using imagination's ability, associated images and abstract connections can make reasonable and balanced insight. The model is an adaptable perspective for the field of contemporary art history.

Three points of view and accompanying chapter arguments found in the triangulation of author self in *Story*, co-creator viewer in *Reader* and Other as a subjective third person in *Anti-Story* draw perspectives that require a brief framework explanation. To exercise a kind of anti-theoretical or counter methodology of contemporary art history using a null hypothesis means accepting that there are no proof(s) to answer a paradoxical question. Discussion will reveal conclusions for

¹⁷ Robert C. Evans, *Aspects of the Grotesque*, 136. Also, Geoffrey Galt Harpham, *The Grotesque*, 462. Also, Wolfgang Kayser, *The Grotesque*, 184.

¹⁸ Wolfgang Kayser, *The Grotesque*, 185. Also, Geoffrey Galt Harpham, *The Grotesque*, 462-463.

¹⁹ Ibid. Also, Ibid.

²⁰ Robert C. Evans, *Aspects of the Grotesque*, 142-143.

potential future research into contemporary art and a possible transdisciplinary alignment of multiple research filters to merge as a theoretical lens.²¹ I bias a holistic framework when considering the lack of academic balance presented in art history texts countering anti-foundationalism.²² Constructive strategies can resist homogeneous language or the conceptualization of restrictive societal norms. I think a control theoretical lens is needed

²¹ See, Paul Feyerabend, *Against Method*, 4th ed. (1975; New York, NY: Verso, 2010), 283. Formerly published as *Against Method: Outline of an Anarchistic Theory of Knowledge*; under the topic heading of *Postscript on Relativism*, Professor of Philosophy Paul Feyerabend describes the dichotomy between extreme dogmatic world-views from *Beyond Reason: Essays on the Philosophy of Paul K. Feyerabend*, “relativism is as much of a chimaera as absolutism [the idea that there exists an objective truth], its cantankerous twin.” Also see, Alan F. Chambers, *What is this thing called Science?*, 3rd ed. (1976; Indianapolis, IN: Hackett Publishing Company, 1999), 37. Chambers cautions that experiments can be rejected if there is not sufficient precautions against interference, insensitive collecting measurements, irrelevance for solving the problem, question may become discredited. Also see 65. “A very good theory will be one that makes very wide-ranging claims about the world, and which is consequently highly falsifiable” for the falsificationist. An anti-realism perspective of skepticism balances the extreme of positivist and empiricist methods dependence on experience and sensory data collection and allows a speculative theory to exist as falsifiable strategy for potential discovery of new knowledge. See 155, Chambers describes Paul Feyerabend’s theory of science as “humanitarian attitude” found in *Against Method* (20) described as “liberty” and is important for Chambers’ interpretation of mature research as limited by foundations within fields of studies’ tacit practices of paradigm(s) that potentially reject anomalies (pg. 108-112). See, Amos Vogel, *Film as Subversive Art* (New York, NY: Random House, 1974).

²² See, Donald Preziosi, ed., *The Art of Art History* (1998; New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2009). See, 323-324. Michel Foucault’s article, *What is an Author?* tropes the pronoun “we” for collective identity while proposing a thesis writing’s “total effacement of the individual characteristics of the writer [...]” as an absence or gap of an empty space that awaits “reapportionment”. Also, Michael Hatt and Charlotte Klonk, *Art History: A Critical Introduction to its Methods* (New York, NY: Manchester University Press, 2006). See, 8. Under the heading of *Feminism*, discuss the assertion of a shift to “multi-causal model[s]” that accommodate both the destabilized approach to generalized, universal or metaphysical domination with the balance of “interested method” of a historian’s own views. Also, Anne D’Alleva, *Methods and Theories of Art History*, 2nd (2004; London, UK: Laurence King Publishing, 2012). See, Chapter 5, *Taking a stance towards Knowledge*, 118-150. D’Alleva discusses the decentering of the subject as fragmented and contradictory using the terms postmodernism and deconstruction. Note: M.H. Abrams, *A Glossary of Literary Terms*, 7th ed. (1957; Boston, MA: Heinle and Heinle, 1999). See, 238-243. Literary scholar, M.H. Abrams specifically discusses *Anti-foundationalism* under the heading *Poststructuralism*. Michal Foucault’s anonymous discourse and Jacques Derrida’s deconstruction of language are but two examples of a concertive effort summarized by Abrams as poststructuralists’ challenging, subversion, undermining and destabilization of foundational/traditional Western “logocentric” or potentially essentialist based thinking. The decentering of fact by Continental philosophers included the work of Jacques Lacan, Roland Barthes, Jean-François Lyotard and has broad academic support as exemplified by Marxist critic, Fredric Jameson and historian, Hayden White. It is difficult to reconcile oppositional tendencies within art history directions, however Jae Emerling’s *Theory for Art History: Adapted from Theory for Religious Studies*, by William E. Deal and Timothy K. Beal (New York, NY: Routledge, 2005) and Robert Summers’ review (accessed April 15, 2015, 9780415973649:Books-Amazon.ca) demonstrates potential common ground. See, accessed April 17, 2015, Rhizome.org/profiles/robertsummer1/. Professor Summers is faculty at Otis College of Art and the review of Emerling’s book provokes a question of whether Summers’ praising, critiquing or exercising Queer tactic strategy as Anti-foundational postmodern writing about religious art history theory. As a bias towards a holistic method it is viewed as ethical, and also fair, to write about artists Niki De Saint Phalle or Frida Kahlo while considering their expression of a specific esoteric or earthy experience incorporated into their sensual, feminist spirituality.

to open possibilities for research, against pejorative claims of essentialism towards identity(s), as a push back against any anti-intellectual structuring of postmodern destabilising conceptions of self.

This framework proposes to counter cycles of foundational paradigm(s). While it is important that anti-foundationalism provides theoretical tools to empower disenfranchised groups to talk back to forces that would repress difference(s), linking postmodernism to anti-humanist theories or Continental philosophies of cultural critique can potentially provide the nexus of powerful circular arguments justifying protection from essentialized identity by arguing specifics of identity as essentializing. A veto strategy implying inauthenticity to values or limiting facets of conceptual association exercises a role of dominance. Oral traditions of vulnerable groups, their collective traditions of stories, moral teaching or creation stories of embedded spiritual tradition can become limited in societal or academic participation. An example of limitation suggests art and religion associated in contemporary art history could provide the kind of imbalanced opportunity that disenfranchised and marginal disavowed hobos and homeless encounter when trying to talk to a democracy organized by majority ballot. I respect an ethical inclusion of identities, and decidedly essential perspectives, to ensure mature theories do not become tools for new dominate agendas. Grotesque and poverty are an association not intended to suggest an essential relationship. Schulnik expresses a respect for these subjects and preserves a dignity towards humanity.

Extending this respect to contemporary animation means the struggle to accommodate postmodern literary close critique within the arguments of three points of view to begin opening a gap within postmodern omission of stable identity. Countering

postmodern use of a hegemony of tropic breaks or ruptures from past intellectual, conceptualized meanings of identity allows comparisons of change within the sequences of storyworld to locate three different perceptions of character self. The bodily changes and changes in the continuity of the storyworld settings confuses a single understanding of the usual story beginning, middle and ending. An abstracted and experimental non-narrative approach to features of character categorization takes on the multiplicity of a postmodern conundrum of ambiguous identity(s). *Background Context* positions a historical understanding of hobos and clowns as iconic, stylized identities. Schulnik's *Hobo Clown* is contextualized within the practice of animation's metamorphosis, storytelling and the grotesque. This will locate a description of style using compositional elements in painting, 3-Dimensional work and music to provide complimentary language to film terminology enriching a sensory perspective of Schulnik's diverse creative output and analysis of mise-en-scène description. Metamorphic meaning found through animation writings by scholars of Cinema and Media Studies assists the following chapters within this essay. What will unfold is a method reflecting a triangulation of three concepts of subjective selves narrating the film. Reference to Kafka's *The Metamorphosis* shares a third person exemplary perspective.

Allison Schulnik as an author of *Self* at the centre of a point of view is a first person mode of "I" participating within the story. Self remains consciously ambiguous because of a lack of dialogue. The argument explored throughout Chapter Two as *Story is* Schulnik's grotesque signature style as an oratory voice and vision of auteur expression subverts identity through grotesque metamorphosis reflecting a personal philosophy and perspective of life experience. Schulnik is positioned as the Hobo Clown character taking on an ancient strategy of describing a characteristic spirit or *ethos*. Schulnik's style and

community connections describe Schulnik's diverse interests to support an auteur premise.

Chapter Three, *Reader*, positions the viewer as both an authorial audience and narrative audience, at the centre of a second person point of view.²³ The audiences' role(s) as co-creative narrators is to fill in the unexplained or omitted details to produce coherence. Because film animation can situate a viewer as having a window into the mind of the Hobo Clown character, the construction of meaning can be explored as an emotive speculation, and less than factual reality for making meaning. The appeal to emotions or *pathos* will argue a point of view using particular details found in *mise-en-scène*, including the music, but not withstanding the lack of diegesis or internal storyworld dialogue, to identify the outside audience as the Hobo Clown. Grotesque metamorphosis generalizes a premise of multiple responsive, emotional constructions of self.

Finally, within Chapter Four, *Anti-Story*, there is an experimental "*I*" that is described as a third person, experimentally, shifting the notion of ontological being, understood as a human consciousness, to the position of the Hobo Clown clay puppet as interior narrator and imaginary *self* (an abstract addressee to an imaged presence; an inanimate or person in between reality and imaginary). The Hobo Clown clay puppet is imagined as an impossible perspective of *I*, or unreadable *qualia* or mind within the story expressing in rhetorical *logos* of interior thought connected to its world. This radical idea of an omnipresence standing outside the storyworld, yet telling the story as a detached first person is Kafka's Gregor Samsa character and story paradigm or heterodiegetic

²³ See, David Herman, *Glossary*, 275. An authorial audience may come to a story with a prior schema of knowledge and the author may intend the reception of textual signals, while a narrative audience participates within the storyworld as an observer.

narration used in *The Metamorphosis* as a *reflector* device. Further, associated here with a classic dramatic rhetorical device found in addressing as an aside or turned away dialogue, a present or absent character in *apostrophe* statements.²⁴ What will be argued is that as a postmodern example of inconsistent features and abrupt storyworld shifts its confusing paradox, asks if this Hobo Clown figure is the same character person throughout the film, as a contemporary premise of postmodern unstable self.

The *Conclusion* chapter is intended to find in Schulnik's *Hobo Clown* a thought provoking site for contemporary art history's engagement with the grotesque, narration and metamorphosis within a triangulation of subjective selves. The three arguments each situates a new perspective that considers the continuity or in continuity of the plot or non-plot as presenting a self revealed within the context of the film. Alienation and resistance to identity finds an absurd paradox within Franz Kafka's transforming hybrid figure of Gregor Samsa. It is an in between logic that identifies ontological complexities of being to describe a picture of grotesque as an objective point of view. Schulnik's grotesque signature, reader's multiple meanings and an experimental Other as an *apostrophe* "I" or reflector, collapse the perspectives of the Hobo Clown clay puppet, into an impossible unreadable mind(s). The benefit of this experimental contemporary art history analysis demonstrates a discussion for the possibility of a balance of theory for future research. A

²⁴ See, *Ibid.*, 278, 281. The concept of *Reflector* describes this premise by Henry James cited by Manfred Jahn in *Focalization* as an example of psychological realism and literary impressionism that James's Psychologist brother, William James viewed as a *stream of consciousness* in a modernist phenomenon of subjectivity steeped in the irrational or illogical and unfettered (consciousness/unconsciousness) individual perception. Focalization is associated with Structuralism or Formalist discourse strategy describing the consciousness of a central protagonist as seeing and speaking (Literary theorist, Gérard Genette) about storyworld used by Narratology's discourse predecessor, Mikhail Bakhtin's *fabula* (story) and *sjuzet* (plot). See, Robert Stam, *Film Theory: An Introduction* (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2000), 53. See, Richard A. Lanham, *A Handlist of Rhetorical Terms*, 2nd ed. (1991; Berkeley, CA: University of California, 2008), 20. *Reflector*: a center of consciousness that views perception through a third person narrator. *Qualia*: a sense of the mind (whether of a person or thing) that asks what it is like have an experience.

balanced theory not specifically differentiated, but one as a potentially hybridized and reconciled transdisciplinary lens. The in between of the triangulation is summarized as a space about some playfulness that is constructive in its resistance as an anti-theory of double negative premises revealing the potential for some sameness to emerge. From the diverse and contradictions of rhetorical forms what will be described is a character of features within an artist's auteur, the viewer's associative emotional construction and the Other as an experimental "*T*" of co-mingled selves.

Chapter 1

BACKGROUND CONTEXT

Allison Jean Schulnik was born in San Diego, California in 1978.²⁵ Now living in Los Angeles as an artist making clay stop-motion animation and working in oil paint, ceramics, gouache, drawing, music and performance. One of Schulnik's most unorthodox expressions is playing in a Rock Noise band named Barfth. Internet journalist, Alexander Marver, asked Schulnik whether influences are internal or external, and an eclectic reply, listed daydreams to dirt.²⁶ An example of diverse interest is seen in an early work entitled *Vedma*, rooted in folktale, says Schulnik, "The first real stop-motion film I made was at CalArts in 1999... a medieval tale."²⁷ It is suggested that storytelling narrative, metamorphosis and the grotesque are contrary means to passage between animation worlds describing storyworld(s) in constant flux (See, Appendix B: Annotated Discography) and sensual materials provide the tactile facts for analysis.

A sensual, analytical descriptions of art positions Schulnik as an auteur in material handling. How Schulnik uses forms and material content both as clay and extrinsic sources is crucial for describing a signature style. CalArts animation professor, Maureen Furniss cites sociologist, Howard Becker as locating intense and individualistic ideas about art with a person of gifted talent, making beautiful art, expressing profound

²⁵ Price Latimer Agah, *Art Profile*. It is noted Schulnik is a Libra.

²⁶ Alexandra Marvar, "Mound: Moving Stop-Motion from Allison Schulnik," *HUFFPOST ARTS*, posted November 11, 2011, accessed July 25, 2013, http://huffingtonpost.com/alexandra-marvar/mound-moving-stopmotion-f_b_1085324.html.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, *Mound*. Also, Mark Moore Gallery http://prod-images.exhibit-e.com/www_markmooregallery_com/2011Nov11_HuffingtonPost.pdf. And, Whitehot Magazine, "Keeping it Dirty: A Conversation with Allison Schulnik," *Whitehot Magazine*, posted June 2012, accessed July 25, 2013, <http://whitehotmagazine.com/article/dirty-conversation-with-allison-schulnik/2576>.

collective emotions and values, and the circular justification of particular qualities pointing to talent/talent pointing to quality work.²⁸ Schulnik's quality is a form of grotesque aesthetic. Its beauty within *Hobo Clown* juxtaposes a minimal real world against a fantasy world of abstracted, transforming eyes of colour where surfaces of sculpted clay reveal a depth of both physical and imaginative dimensions.

Professor of animation, Suzanne Buchan suggests, "Puppet animation thus represents a different 'world' for the spectator, something between 'a world', created with the animation technique, and 'the world', in its use of real objects and not representational drawings" indicating a hybrid reality between animated illusion and real existence.²⁹ Buchan extends the metaphor of life as an animation principle to objects and puppetry forming a bodily and emotive enchantment (delight and magical experience). Schulnik's use of material and found objects to animate *Hobo Clown* will be discussed the next Chapter. Ideas about animation in between spaces of reality need not to forget animators' sense of themselves as artists. Experimental filmmaker and CalArts instructor, Jules Engel, has written on the United Productions of America's collection of industry and independent artists; "All of us were active in art. And we intend to make our films as artistic as possible, which was really something new for industry animation."³⁰ This sentiment is echoed by animator Eliot Noyes, Jr.,

²⁸ Maureen Furniss, Maureen Furniss, *Art in Motion: Animation Aesthetics*, rev. ed. (1998; Bloomington, IN: John Libby Publishing, University of Indiana Press, 2009), 21. Note: "Artworld" was an idea Arthur Danto wrote about in 1964 to inform an understanding of institutional apparatuses interacting between art, artist and society. Becker and Danto and contemporary theorists present a pluralistic view of multiple participants as stakeholders in the world of art.

²⁹ Suzanne Buchan, "The Animated Spectator: Watching the Quay Brother's 'Worlds'," in *Animated 'Worlds'*, ed. by Suzanne Buchan (Bloomington, IN: John Libby Publications, University of Indiana Press, 2006): 15-38, 21. Also see, Paul Wells and Johnny Hardstaff, "Re-Engaging Definitions," in *Re-Imagining Animation: The Changing Face of the Moving Image* (New York, NY: AVA Publishing, 2008), 21.

³⁰ Jules Engel, "UPA," in *Animation—Art and Industry*, ed. Maureen Furniss (Bloomington, IN: John Libby Publication, University of Indiana Press, 2009): 151-156, 152.

I view myself as an artist who uses animation the way a painter would use paints and a canvas. The reason I am in animation is that it is a form of self-expression; what I want to get across is mostly a very personal view of the world.³¹

Understanding Schulnik's perspective as coming from that of an artist helps understand the ambiguous question that will be returned to that asks who or what occupies the center of point of view.

Artistically, Schulnik's extended style of impasto paint and thick ceramic glaze technique and animated sequences of clay metamorphoses are arresting with a sense of GOOEY-ness weighted with a sense of a continual state of flux affected by gravity. The sense of tactile or touch harkens to experimental art that specifically engages the senses.³² Schulnik's animation may be contextualized as part of a history of both hobo clown tradition and that of a female aesthetic. This is to suggest Helena Smith Dayton's Renaissance woman interests in everything tactile and expressive is also a subjective personality/artistic trait of Schulnik. It was not until 1917, some twenty years after William Harbutt began producing *Plastercine* in England, that ceramic sculptor, painter, and pioneering clay stop-motion animator, Helena Smith Dayton used clay to produce William Shakespeare's *Romeo and Juliet*.³³ An affinity is clearly expressed best when Schulnik says, "The hand-made. I like to make something from nothing"³⁴ and "[m]aking

³¹ Robert Russett and Cecile Starr, "Eliot Noyes, Jr.," in *Experimental Animation: An Illustrated Anthology* (Toronto, ON: Van Nostrand Reinhold, 1976): 20-22, 20. Also 21. Noyes' *Clay* 1964 is described as "... a metamorphosis of abstract and representational forms."

³² See, Jan Švankmajer, *Touching and Imagining: An Introduction to Tactile Art*, ed. Cathryn Vasseleu, trans. Stanley Dalby (New York, NY: I.B. Tauris, 2014).

³³ Michael Frierson, *Clay Animation*, 32, 79.

³⁴ Christine N. Ziemba, *Artist and Alumna*. Also see, Allison Schulnik, "Hobo Clown and Forest," *Guernica: A magazine of art and politics*, posted January 12, 2010, accessed July 25, 2013, http://guernicamag.com/art/clay_mation_videos/. See, *Galerie Division*, accessed July 28, 2013, http://www.galeriedivision.com/art_allison_schulnik.html.

paintings and things, dance, animation and music are spiritual for me.”³⁵ It has already been observed that Schulnik has empathy for preserving homeless people’s dignity. It is important to recognize this coming together in Schulnik’s philosophy of life and on art,

My fixation on these characters is not intended to exploit deficiencies, but to find valor in adversity. Hobo clowns, misshapen animals or alien beasts, they are typically built upon a human frame, drawing from film and dance. I like to blend earthly fact, blatant fiction and lots of oil paint to form a stage of tragedy, farce, and raw, ominous beauty—at times capturing otherworld buffoonery, and other times presenting a simple earthly dignified moment.³⁶

What is the history of an aesthetic about hobos and clowns that provide reference of characterization for Schulnik and audiences?

Animation scholar, Michael Frierson provides a frame of reference for Dayton’s work as both associated with fine art and its burlesque (grotesque) characterization.³⁷ Dayton’s painted still life flowers and “droll little figures” comparable in its singular style to Schulnik’s thick impasto paint and ceramic glaze technique viewed in the treatment of clay in *Hobo Clown* metamorphoses sequences.³⁸ The image of buffoonery in the grotesque clown and the transient worker hobo or tramp that emerged from the plagues of financial depressions are recorded in the history of trade, immigration and political crises

³⁵ Ashley Baylen, “Top 20 Jews In The Arts- Allison Schulnik.” *UJA Federation of Greater Toronto*, Accessed August 1, 2013, <http://www.shalomlife.com/culture/15092/top-20-jews-in-the-arts-allison-schulnik/>. Also, akka b., *Artist Profile*. Schulnik says in interview, “Their [Schulnik’s characters using a pronoun] expression and emotions are somewhat gestural, and found in the clay. It’s just a guttural straightforward approach to making inanimate things communicate ... I rotate between painting, making film work and all it’s [sic] different processes, sculpture, pottery, drawing, looking, dance, music, etc.

³⁶ Price Latimer Agah, *Art Profile*. Also, Allison Schulnik, “Allison Schulnik,” in *Baker’s Dozen*, ed. Max Presneill. The Torrance Art Museum exhibition catalogue (Torrance, CA: Cultural services Division, 2009): 27. As this statement would precede the LookBooks interview, an important first line includes, “Schulnik paints rejects, misfits and their landscapes.” Also see, Christine N. Ziemba, *Artist and Alumna*. And see, 24, Footnote 55 for an extensive list of similar statements. Note: Carol Cheh, “Allison Schulnik,” *art ltd*. Posted May 2013, Accessed July 25, 2013, http://www.wartltdmag.com/index.php?subaction=showfull&id=1368052874&archive=&start_from=&ucat=28 &. Sourced through Mark Moore Gallery. Schulnik discussed creating *Hobo Clown* after befriending a homeless person.

³⁷ Michael Frierson, *Clay Animation*, 79.

³⁸ *Ibid.*, 76. Frierson cites a December 16, 1916 *Scientific America* article “Motion Picture Comedies in Clay.” See, Anthony Slide, *The Silent Feminists: America’s First Women Directors* (Lanham, ML: Scarecrow Press, 1996), 121-122. This reference is significant in its austere brevity.

from Tutor England to the American Civil War and represent figures that produce laughter at the expense of self-degradation.³⁹ A deep psychological response is surrendered between the act of laughter and its object of release making a hobo clown a powerful cultural icon of unfortunate grotesque misfortune.

The whiteface pantomime or grotesque clown character performed by George L. Fox (1825-1877) described by clown historian, John M. Towsen as “America’s answer to Grimaldi” (Joseph Grimaldi, 1778-1837) began a pantomime called *Humpty Dumpty* in 1868 that eventually ran for 1,200 performances in New York.⁴⁰ European equestrian exhibitions and modern use of the *circus* name is associated with Charles Huges’ *Royal Circus*, circa 1782 England.⁴¹ Clowns, tramps/hobos, early animation’s inspired cultural practices of puppets and toys, and early stop-motion animators are speculated as influential on Schulnik’s development. Jacob Riis’ photograph, *The Tramp in a Mulberry Street Yard* 1887 and Norman Rockwell’s Hobo series for Saturday Evening Post covers in 1924 demonstrate the simulacra of the imaginary real as Schulnik’s studio reveals photos of a street person with preparatory work for hobo clown paintings.⁴²

³⁹ Todd Depastino, *Citizen Hobo: How a Century of Homelessness Shaped America* (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 2003), 4-7.

⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, 160.

⁴¹ John M. Towsen, *Clowns* (New York, NY: Hawthorn Books, 1976), 87.

⁴² Todd Depastino, *Citizen Hobo*, 47-48. See, Nicholas Corich, “Character Study: Allison Schulnik + Daniel Gordon,” *VIP ART Productions*, Digital, 8:27 min., posted August 29, 2012, accessed July 30, 2013, <http://vimeo.com/48462434>. Reference can be found between 2:26 and 2:43 min. See, Allison Schulnik, “Allison Schulnik Studio Visit,” *Beautiful/Decay Magazine, Visual Creatures*, Digital, 4:08 min., posted July 11, 2013, accessed July 30, 2013, <http://vimeo.com/45596562>. “There are a lot of homeless people, um, where I live... I was totally, kinda, inspired by these people, like but they’re kinda amazing and I’ve seen like the most beautiful people, but the work isn’t about homeless people.” Christine N. Ziemba, *Artist and Alumna*. A notable observation is that Schulnik’s Los Angeles representation, Mark Moore Gallery, was previously located at 2525 Michigan Ave. Santa Monica, California in the same building as the Robert Berman Gallery recognized for Robert Berman’s extensive collection of clown painting featured in Diane Keaton’s *Clown Paintings* (New York, NY: lookout books/powerhouse Books, 2002). See page 61. It is a profound statement from Goldie Hawn that highlights the paradox and conundrum of clown performance, “Clowns represent both the light and the dark. They remind us that laughter and sorrow make us whole.” Also, Price Latimer Agah, *Art: Allison Schulnik*. Note photo of Norman Rockwell’s hobo series pinned to the

The A. Schoenhut German Toy Company's *Humpty Dumpty Circus* miniature play set included a miniature Fox whiteface clown, and a Hobo (clown) inspiring an early stop-motion animation.⁴³ Animators, James Stuart Blackton and Albert Smith's Vitascope Film Company magically transformed *The Humpty Dumpty Circus* in 1898, using Smith's daughter's toy, into what is widely considered the first American stop-motion animation made in black and white.⁴⁴ Independent scholar on the history of the homeless, Todd Depastino associates the 'carnavalesque' excesses of grotesque tramp comedy with the rude and body grotesque as exhibiting an aesthetic of contrary taste, exemplified by Nat M. Wills' "the Happy Tramp" clown and Charlie Chaplin's 1914 inspired tramp character, as against working class standards.⁴⁵ Hobos and clowns have become trope entities of performances in circuses and comedic performances.

Panoramas and dioramas dating from the early 19th century in Paris and London entertained spectators during a similar period as the pantomimes and acrobatic clowns of Britain, Continental Europe and United States. Museums and traveling shows captured various scales of imagined realities. The miniature worlds at the 1933 Chicago Worlds Fair and the ubiquitous miniature Disneyworld attractions that followed are examples of a

wall. See, Allison Schulnik, "Wild Exaggeration: The Artists: Allison Schulnik," in *Wild Exaggeration: The Grotesque Body in Contemporary Art*, ed. Tami Katz-Freiman (Haifa, IS: Haifa Museum of Art, 2009), 84. Exhibition Catalogue.

⁴³ Jim Sneed and Judy Sneed. "All About Toys: Schoenhut's Humpty-Dumpty Circus and the Great American Circus," *Old Wooden Toys*, accessed August 26, 2013, http://www.oldwoodtoys.com/american_circus_toys.htm. See, Evelyn Ackerman and Fredrick E. Keller, *Humpty Dumpty Circus from A to Z* (Los Angeles, CA: Era Industries, 1975). Also, Ken A. Priebe, "Appeal and History of Stop-Motion Animation," in *The Art of Stop-Motion Animation* (Boston, MA: Thomson Course Technology PTR, 2007): 3-34. And Donald Grafton, *Emile Cohl, Caricature, and Film* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1990), 129.

⁴⁴ Princeton University, "Stop-Motion," *Princeton University*, accessed January 7, 2014, http://www.princeton.edu/~achaney/tmve/wiki100k/docs/Stop_motion.html. Noted as made 1898 (no known copies). Made using the Schoenhut Toy, *Humpty Dumpty Circus*.

⁴⁵ *Ibid.*, 154-155, 293

transition from make belief theatre to life sized projected entertainment.⁴⁶ Yet, long before the miniature mechanical cities of the future and miniature fantasies of staged dioramas, intricate marionette sets had evolved from cultural traditions around the world. The transition to modeled animation puppets was historically well informed. Audiences and oratory storytellers had been practicing a relationship of triangulated interaction for millennia.

Professor of art history, Anne D'Alleva pictures three worlds of interaction describing Reception theory as a triangulation via literary theorist, Roman Ingarden, involving the relationships between author, reader and the text.⁴⁷ Each world of thought has an internal schema organizing its reality just as doctor and theorist, Sigmund Freud proposed three organizing structures to psychoanalysis: Id, Ego and Superego. I think this infancy of psychology represents a pseudoscience, however, it is an analogy of triangulated subjectivity (shared thought) that helps to explain how multiple perspectives can exist as a single entity. An audience can respond, collectively, at seeing a hobo clown fail miserably at a task. A question of academic paradigm opposes universalized ideals or imposed interpretation that essentializes something, someone or group. Yet, two ideas assist observing and describing grotesque metamorphosis for multiple meaning: surface and particulars.

⁴⁶ Storyboard, "The Miniature Worlds of Walt," *The Walt Disney Family Museum*, posted March 30, 2011, accessed February 14, 2015, <http://www.waltdisney.org/storyboard/miniature-worlds-walt>. Disney's first 3-Dimensional miniature storytelling world was *Granny Cabin* 1952, predating the construction of Disneyland.

⁴⁷ Anne D'Alleva, *Methods and Theories*, 110. D'Alleva cites, Jeff Mitscherling, *Roman Ingarden's Ontology and Aesthetics* (Ottawa, ON: University of Ottawa Press, 1997). See, David Herman, *Glossary*, 275. In narrative studies this complex relationship of real and hypothetical parts organizes the fictional text and its actual or implied author or narrator with similar theories of interpreted audiences.

Animation surfacing, digital construction of painted and textured surfaces, should not be confused with the literary surface *reading* for what is evident and perceived as details representing New Criticism.⁴⁸ Film theorist, Béla Balázs wrote in *Visible Man* 1924, “Film is a *surface art* and in it whatever is inside is outside.”⁴⁹ The idea is that the storyworld reflects the real, sensory world. Filmmaker/theorist, Sergei Eisenstein in *The Film Sense* 1942 wrote, “[...] *particular representation* of the general theme that in equal measure penetrates *all* the shot-pieces” unites filmmaker and spectator through an inductive experience of theme(s).⁵⁰ Film, Eisenstein theorized, can be *form* as the larger whole made up of the smaller parts that piece together meaning from a comparison of conflict or collisions producing concept(s).⁵¹ A comparison of events within the *Hobo Clown* story from the background on the history of hobos and clowns motif or its tropes, and Schulnik’s style of art making will assist in providing some clarity for turning the sensory, visual and auditory into a narrative perspective that can be said to be a feature of Schulnik’s contemporary turn of grotesque meaning.

⁴⁸ See, Stephan Best and Sharon Marcus, “The Turn Away from Marxism, or The Way We Read Now,” *diacritics, Special Edition, Representations* 40, no. 3 (Fall2012): 26-55. doi:10.1353/dia.2012.0009. See, Fredric Jameson, *Postmodernism, or, The Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1991), 6, 12. Jameson’s Marxist interrogation of history and new economic and its “new depthlessness” of relationships leading to “multiple surfaces” of intertextualities describing postmodern repudiation of hermeneutics, false consciousness (ideology, essences), alienation, authenticity and deconstructed language as the collapse of binaries where “truth” could be said to have resided inside or outside a metaphysical model of depth.

⁴⁹ Béla Balázs, “Invisible Man,” in *Béla Balázs: Early Film Theory: Visible Man and the Spirit of Film*, ed. Erica Carter, trans. Rodney Livingstone (1924; New York, NY: Berghahn Books, 2011):1-90, 19. It is important to note that Balázs’ idea of a potential universal language found in cinema also involved the prejudice of Nationalism and racist overtones of white supremacy. See, Béla Balázs, *Invisible Man*, 14. Described as “*first international language*” and “*the unique, shared psyche of the white man.*” Author’s italics.

⁵⁰ Sergei Eisenstein, *The Film Sense*, trans. and ed. Jay Leyda (1942; New York, NY: Harcourt, Brace and World, 1970), 11.

⁵¹ *Ibid.*, 39.

The fictional writing of Franz Kafka (1883-1924) is an important example of a kind of storytelling that emerged from modernist exploration of a detached narrator standing outside the story representing a new narrative strategy of removed participation. Kafkaesque, according to scholar, Richard T. Gray, describes Kafka's subversion of logic where social alienation expressed in the absurd, futile, tragic and distorted are made tonal using paradox, irony and "sudden reversals of action" creating confusion when thinking what is significant inside or outside the storyworld.⁵² The confusion of real and unreal diegesis, or film's storyworld, exists as particular staging and surface characteristics reflect to the viewer an ambiguity of itself. This literary strategy seems compatible with Schulnik's animation of the hobo clown character. Aesthetic theorist, Wolfgang Kayser's ideas about grotesque alienation and "abyss" locates Schulnik's Hobo Clown puppet character within an emphatic; "THE GROTESQUE IS A PLAY WITH THE ABSURD."⁵³ Kayser warns not to define grotesque on its effects; consider Kayser's three ideas: creative process, the work, and its reception as developing a basic aesthetic establishing itself as a grotesque aesthetic category.⁵⁴

The Hobo Clown placed within Kayser's triangulated structure of an "estranged world" of the grotesque engages absurd irrationality as a postmodern threshold following Kayser's denial of any creator's meaning as a loss of poetic influence to the cynical.⁵⁵ The figure as a metaphor of grotesque metamorphosis is a narrative point of view conceived as realism and the abstract. The use of transformation in rhythmic unity with

⁵² Richard T. Gray et al., "Kafkaesque," in *A Franz Kafka Encyclopedia* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 2005): 155-156.

⁵³ Wolfgang Kayser, "An Attempt to Define the Nature of the Grotesque," in *The Grotesque in Art and Literature*, trans. Ulrich Weisstein (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1957): 179-189, 180.

Author's capitalization

⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, 180, 184.

⁵⁵ *Ibid.*, 184-189.

the music cues and the themes of loneliness and utopia are contrasted within the *Hobo Clown* plot of transformations seemingly one inside the other. Contrast of identities seen in the hobo or clown as alien to *normal* selves, and the grotesque of sudden change is a paradox of resistance to identity found in the contrary of *abnormal* as an opposite to familiar expectations.

The inclusion of cultural meaning for hobo and clown and the film form as an inside and intrinsic space represents real and unreal constructed illusion.⁵⁶ Animator, Norman McLaren, quoted by film professor (CalArts), Maureen Furniss, explains; “Animation is therefore the art of manipulating the invisible interstices that lie between the frames.”⁵⁷ The position of professor of film and filmmaker, William Moritz on McLaren’s use of “deconstructions of surrealism” and (commentary on *Neighbours*) wit, human tragedy and absurdity position McLaren as a possible postmodernist, twenty years before architect and theorist, Charles Jencks’ postmodern disillusionment with binaries, and is oriented in the same direction as that of Jules Engels and contemporaries in pursuit of accessible and popular non-objective animation.⁵⁸ Moritz sees McLaren’s work fitting into the space of the postmodern.⁵⁹ This surface at play in the space McLaren plays within between motion projector film frames transforms both the temporal and perceptual.

⁵⁶ David Bordwell and Kristin Thompson, “Style as a Formal System: Summary,” in *Film Art: An Introduction*, 2nd ed. (New York, NY: Alfred A. Knopf, 1986): 261-284.

⁵⁷ Maureen Furniss, *Art in Motion*, 5. Also see, George Sifianos, “The Definition of Animation: A Letter from Norman McLaren,” *Animation Journal* 3, no. 2 (Spring 1995): 62-66. Furniss speculates in the endnotes that Sifianos may have been familiar with André Martin, *Les cineastes d’animation face au mouvement* (Poitiers: Imprimerie Daynac, n.d.). See, Donald McWilliams, ed., *Norman McLaren on the Creative Process* (Montreal, QC: National Film Board of Canada, 1991). Also, Charles Solomon, ed., *The Art of the Animated Image: An Anthology* (Los Angeles, CA: AFI, 1987), 11. Solomon is referenced by Paul Wells, *Understanding Animation* (New York, NY: Routledge, 1998), 10. Also, Ernest Callenbach, “The Craft of Norman McLaren: Notes on a Lecture Given at the 1961 Vancouver Film Festival,” *Film Quarterly* 16, no. 2 (Winter 1962-63): 17-19, 17. Cited by Karen Beckman, “Introduction,” in *Animating Film Theory*, ed. Karen Beckman (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2014): 1-22, 20. Endnote 11: McLaren said, “What is the essence of animation? It is what happens between each frame of film—this is what is important.”

⁵⁸ William Moritz, “Norman McLaren and Jules Engel: Post-modernists,” in *A Reader in Animation*, ed. Jayne Pillings (Bloomington, IN: John Libby Publishing, University of Indiana Press, 1997): 104-111.

⁵⁹ *Ibid.*, 110.

Schulnik expresses a similar auteur working methodology; “I love that as an animator, you can, if you want, make an entire film by yourself”; important because the modernist individual may be reconcilable to postmodern absence of the maker.⁶⁰

Following the postmodern space of McLaren’s “invisible interstices,” Tom Gunning, professor of cinema, describes animation as “*playing* with the production of animation” and as professor of art history and film studies, Alan Cholodenko cites McLaren through George Sifiano to denote “animatic” as an “in-betweener” space where the illusion of life is the play of life itself, “itself” is the “in-between space”, “between life and death, motion and non-motion.”⁶¹ Cholodenko’s “ur” (technologically animated life) is a foundational “life” of the object where the radical Other as a hyperform describes the death of the animator and inserts media (e.g. animation as an ontological sense of being) as Cholodenko’s *animatic* as living dead collapses distinctions between life/death, human/non-human, “world” and “subject” are a “death of death” hyper-izing an absent maker and removing the human from animation’s story.⁶² This view is oppositional to the significance of artists and an example of anti-foundationalism working as anti-humanism theory.

A singular, mature focus of theory does not seem to accommodate the diversity and complexity of both abstract and experimental animation with the intensely human sensitivity towards everything real as empirical versus metaphysical idealism of otherworldly forces. The list of West coast animators working with 3-dimensional,

⁶⁰ akka b., *Artist Profile*.

⁶¹ Tom Gunning, “Animating the Instant: The Secret Symmetry between Animation and Photography,” in *Animating Film Theory*, ed. Karen Beckman (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2014): 37-53, 40. Also, Alan Cholodenko, ““First Principles” of Animation,” in *Animating Film Theory*, ed. Karen Beckman (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2014): 98-110, 101-106.

⁶² *Ibid.*, 107, 104-5, 107.

experimental, clay stop-motion (oil based, polymer clay), clay painting and musically inspired abstraction, including the grotesque is long. Some notables include Art Clokey (*Gumbasia*, 1955), David Daniels (*Buzz Box*, 1985), Joan C. Gratz (*Mona Lisa Descending a Staircase*, 1992), Will Vinton (*The Little Prince*, 1979. Notable Claymation ® credit), Phil Tippet (*Coneheads*, 1993 and *Mad God*, 2013. Notable *Go Motion* credit) and Portland, Oregon based Laika directors Anthony Stacchi and Graham Annable (*The Boxtrolls*, 2014). Although, the specific names of those associated with work may also have involved collaboration and tells only a limited perspective of credit for production. This short list of animation artist's points to a historical context of innovators working in animation storytelling and expressing diverse senses of abstracted worldviews.

Animation scholars, Paul Wells and Johnny Hardstaff express a neo-romantic notion about the auteur process “[t]his sense of complete control is common to most animators and chimes with a need to create a particular world that reflects their own preoccupations, memories and level of consciousness.”⁶³ It is not surprising that animation scholar, Tom Gunning both recognizes Michael Frierson’s 1991 reference to clay animation’s ‘marginalized’ history while Gunning differentiates a potential for theorizing a collapse of time within animation as ‘play’ between perception and wonder.⁶⁴ The status of animation as a serious contemporary art produces substantial questions for inquiry important for contemporary art history studies, including serious discussion on

⁶³ David Bordwell and Kristin Thompson, *Film Art*, 15, 148. Bordwell and Thomson describe this extreme autonomy as, “Indeed, the animated film constitutes the extreme limit of the director’s control of mise-en-scene—the most controlled sort of film there is.” Also, Paul Wells and Johnny Hardstaff, “Artist Animation?,” in *Re-Imagining Animation: The Changing Face of the Moving Image* (New York, NY: AVA Publishing, 2008): 84-85, 84. Also, Wells and Hardstaff, *Re-Imagining Animation*, 87.

⁶⁴ Tom Gunning, *Animating the Instant*, 35, 51. See, Michael Frierson, *Clay Animation*, ix.

feminine aesthetics.⁶⁵ Considering the outcome of the 87th Academy Award in 2015, for Best Animation. Predictably, *Big Hero 6*, a computer animated feature, won over *The Boxtrolls*, a stop-motion film, for top honours, audience ratings and box office financial return based on previous historical shifts to celluloid 2-Dimensional orthodoxy.⁶⁶

Schulnik's film auteur is the emotions and drama of a human narrative rooted in a labourous art that can lack greatly in incentive.

Animation artists represent a linear development of storytelling within microcosm spaces of miniature worlds whether 2 or 3-Dimensional (Cel drawn and painted or sculpture and relief or a hybrid of digital software). Wes Anderson (*Fantastic Mr. Fox*, 2009), Tim Burton (*The Nightmare Before Christmas*, 1993) and Mark Osborne (*More*, 1998 and *The Little Prince*, 2015) are a few crossover contemporary successes of stop-motion that hybrid the use of technological software advances broadening the digital evolution of constructed worlds. Schulnik's interview responses to influences include mention of Jan Švankmajer (*Alice*, 1988), Bruce Bickford (*Prometheus' Garden*, 1988) and Ray Harryhausen (*The Beast From 20,000 Fathoms*, 1953. Notable *Dyanimation* credit), and Jules Engels (Co-Director, *The Little Prince*, 1964) indicating diverse influences and appreciation for ways of sharing's an orator's voice and vision.⁶⁷ Of

⁶⁵ Suzanne Buchan, ed., "Introduction: Pervasive Animation," in *Pervasive Animation* (New York, NY: Routledge, AFI Film Reader, 2013): 1-22, 19. Also, Jayne Pilling, *Women and animation: a compendium* (London, UK: British Film Institute, Exhibition and Distribution Division, 1992). See, Maureen Furniss, *Art in Motion*, 241. Maureen Furniss suggests that the idea of a "'feminine sensibility'" is a question worthy of important consideration when examining the "representation of women, or women's experiences, in animation" although, Furniss astutely refuses to reduce a women's sensibility to a reduction for all women.

⁶⁶ See, *IMDb*. "Big Hero 6," accessed February 28, 2015, <http://www.imdb.com/title/tt2245084/>. Also, *IMDb*. "The Boxtrolls," accessed February 28, 2015, <http://www.imdb.com/title/tt0787474/>. Also, Dorothy Pomerantz, "'The Boxtrolls' And Why It's Crazy To Do Stop-Motion Animation," *Forbes*, posted September 26, 2014, accessed February 28, 2015, <http://forbes.com/sites/dorothypomerantz/2014/09/26/the-boxtrolls-and-why-its-crazy-to-do-stop-motion-animation/>. Also, Paul Wells, *Understanding Animation* (New York, NY: Routledge, 1998), 35.

⁶⁷ *Whitehot Magazine, Keeping it Dirty*. Also, Christine N. Ziemba, *Artist and Alumna*.

course what is significant is that clay stop-motion tradition and innovative personalities are integral to establishing a contemporary tradition. The important tradition highlighted in Schulnik's work is the animation technique of metamorphosis.

A discussion of Schulnik's metamorphoses as grotesque include images of eye, face, head or body that have a regularity or predictable form and then undergo changes that can be perceived as exaggerated beyond a state of conventional expectations. Four animation scholars: Michael Frierson, Paul Wells, Tom Gunning and Norman Klein contribute to language delineating metamorphosis. In, *Clay Animation*, Frierson identifies Eisenstein's writings on Walt Disney as attributing a postmodern quality of instability as film's transforming "plasmaticness" upon form.⁶⁸ Metamorphosis is described by Frierson as having been accredited by animation historians as the "key" to experimental animations "enduring power" and that clay's playful quality through experimentation, plasticity and its metamorphic "visual incongruity" and "cognitive dissonance" provide the "magic" experienced in viewing a world in animation's contrary behaviours to reality.⁶⁹ For scholar, Paul Wells metamorphosis is an important device for narrative even as an abstract method to destabilize image as it makes fluid properties of physical space and form, paradoxically, inform the conflation of oppositional states.⁷⁰ Illusion and the deconstruction of the picture into nonsense is an enjoyable experience that may extend itself beyond rational description.

Tom Gunning is interested in the intersection of an indexed hierarchy of film cinema, historically considered superior to animation and the movement of frames or

⁶⁸ Michael Frierson, *Clay Animation*, 21.

⁶⁹ *Ibid.*, 21.

⁷⁰ Paul Wells, *Understanding Animation*, 69.

stills where Gunning's "Ur-ground" is a sort of playful in between world of photographic technology turning photographic stills into mutable motion through the perception of "magical" metamorphosis.⁷¹ This language comes into play as an expression, not of poetic mysticism, but as Gunning's grounding of a logical transition from pre-cinema theatre magic shows to post-cinema technologies to redefine magical metamorphoses trickery using computer generated imaging (CGI) software. Gunning uses a rhetorical *commutatio* exchange, closing with the conclusion "[f]orm is motion; motion is form" to underscore the image and its manipulation as metamorphosis and itself; as synonymous.

Further, metamorphosis as a pattern of distortion can be an event plot device or as a radical ellipsis of omitted moments of immediate shape shifting pace of the transformation of form, in relation to setting within the storyworld description, could indicate multiple concepts. A list of grotesque categories includes the *altered eyes* (See, 6/7, 8, 13/14, 50) *transitions* (See, 15/16, 27-29, 30-31, entire field of the screen *surface faces* (14, 32, 50), *heads* (See, 31, 34, 35, 36, 37, 52/53), *botanical/floral unity* (See, 27-29), and *mandala* (See, 15, 30, 39, 41-43, 45-47). Gunning's form and motion are linked through the change of still through frames per minute to become the in between, perceived as a unity of motion. Schulnik's in between stages of metamorphic motion is perceived as a growing unity or sameness between human thought and the exterior world.

Completing Frierson, Wells and Gunning's development of metamorphosis is Norman Klein's analogy of animation's controlled anarchy of traditional Baroque narrative and altered perspective as a chaos that has become an "Electronic Baroque" where "in-between" moments of paused exaggeration, disproportion and extreme

⁷¹ Tom Gunning, "The Transforming Image: The Roots of Animation in Metamorphosis and Motion," in *Pervasive Animation*, ed. Suzanne Buchan (New York, NY: AFI, Routledge, 2013): 52-70, 53-54, 56.

transformations locating an “anti-logic” rhythm of “hyper-extended cycles” is associated with Franz Kafka’s *The Metamorphosis*.⁷² Similar to Kafka’s Gregor Samsa’s alienation of self from the body; the loss of identity with animation’s process through technology is expressed as a loss of familiarity with a sense of time, body and space; Klein ascribes metamorphosis with its own story of broken unity and exposed internal.⁷³ While shape shifting, inside out impossibilities are both baroque and narrative in plot as illustrated by Klein’s refers to filmmaker, Jan Švankmajer, when discussing the baroque animation of objects and the hesitation of unstable realities.⁷⁴

The importance of baroque puppetry discussed by Klein through Švankmajer and “computer-generated imagery” as a speculated means of overcoming the realities of an external world is as a kind of described haunting or “hesitation” technologically generated in animation.⁷⁵ This description resembles the unstable space within Schulnik’s work as collapsed life, memory, figure and identity. Metamorphosis plays as an anti-aesthetic joining a real world perception with the fantastic animated world through a sense of shifting non-objective abstraction or the emotion of abstract expressionism. The formalist language of abstract art analysis applied to the Schulnik’s animation metamorphoses provides both a painterly and sculptural vocabulary. Geometric language of abstract formalist elements of design and composition is associated with surface character and staging particulars. Line, colour, texture, shape and intensities ground surface elements as dynamic actions of media design. The particulars of positive and

⁷² Norman M. Klein, “Animation as Baroque: Fleischer Morphs Harlem: Tangos to Crocodiles,” in *The Sharpest point: Animation at the End of Cinema*, ed. Chris Gehman and Steve Reinke (Toronto, ON: YYZ Books, Ottawa International Film Festival, Images Festival, 2005): 27-46, 27-30. Klein’s reference to Kafka comes via Caroline Leaf’s *The Metamorphosis of Mr. Samsa* 1977.

⁷³ *Ibid.*, 32.

⁷⁴ Whitehot Magazine, *Keeping it Dirty*. Also, Norman M. Klein, *Animation as Baroque*, 40-41.

⁷⁵ *Ibid.*, 43-46.

negative space or light and dark or foreground and background are observed as compositional spatial reality. Proportion and the relations of volumes, framing and extended edge, opaque and transparent layers contribute to conceptualizing fact and fiction of a work of art as a narrative/non-narrative abstract story from the mind of an artist to a viewer with a playful mix of reality and illusion. This is a blatant mix of perceptions of subjective and objective points of view.

The Hobo Clown character is found within the body of the film as a figuration both of persona as a role and as an independent entity being of the film. The Hobo Clown fits into one role as a homeless person and as three roles, each divided by abrupt events that occur in the film changing settings challenging continuity to the film as one story. The Hobo Clown as a narrator is a self. Three narrator perspectives of point of view will provide the opportunity for this speculation to use comparisons of analysis to discuss whether there is any sameness for describing the Hobo Clown as an example of Schulnik's grotesque for contemporary art history's future research into the body as self or multiple selves. The heterodiegetic narration of a reflector suggests the Hobo Clown is looking at itself as the third person narrator. Removed from participation in the story the mind that is viewed may be one of memory or other such complicated philosophically ontological realities. Simply, can thinking experimentally about the Hobo Clown as an imagined being and subjective mind help imagine a meaning for the film. The being of the Hobo Clown and the learning that will come from the following chapters discussing conceptual rhetorical persuasions will suggest contemporary art grotesque features.

Chapter 2

STORY

Allison Schulnik is positioned within the storytelling world of the *Hobo Clown* as a first person narrator. Schulnik as Hobo Clown will appeal to the *ethos* or description of a characterized storyworld diegesis. The grotesque auteur signature of changing form can be considered as subverting a sense of stable identity, and as constructing a personal perspective of the artist's life experience. If the incongruence of the plot or the abstracted animation is only considered as non-narrative, then not much more could be discussed about Schulnik's persona characterized as a homeless person or the dramatic evolution of the music video having an auteur premise. It is important to allow some assemblance of events and the linearity of sequences of a storyworld to express a language through the sensual material handling for the sake of personal storytelling. The idea, is that an animated oration of the author's voice and vision within this work's metamorphoses' stop-motion, provokes mental pictures of material movement as does the sound and action of onomatopoeia language. Goopy, gob, icing and thick all sound out the visceral density of paint and volume of sculpted clay.

Contrarily, artist, Wassily Kandinsky informs a relationship between colour and form as an experiential engagement of spiritual inner discovery without narrative or story.⁷⁶ Here, another perception for considering meaning focuses on the abstract as content. The use of colour and drawing or form is an interior tension helps to identify the shapes of colour moving against each other. The tension attracts the viewer's eye. Its optics search for a revealed reality, or from another perception sees a non-narrative, non-

⁷⁶ Wassily Kandinsky, *Concerning the Spiritual in Art*, trans. M.T.H. Sadler (Don Mills, ON: Dover Publications, 1977), 51.

representational, and non-objective is a subject for meaning. Schulnik's metamorphic eye sequences where colour comes forth from the pupils and swirls mix is suggested as a metaphor of thought as a tension of incoherence. What is made is a pattern of significance (See, Appendix A: Mise-en-scène: 6-7, 13-14, 32-36, 50-53). The sensory and its empirical experience substantiate this point of view as a shared logic within the story.

The sensual elements of narrative will help to focus the tactile quality of clay found in Schulnik's film. Schulnik's illusion of seeing the Hobo Clown thinking and the surface of the eyes and enlarged eye socket area as a blending of colour and swirl of edges and texture of clay prompt an association with Schulnik's impasto oil painting. The relief surface of paint and that of clay and the pixillated movement of animation seem to have a unity of that orator voice and vision. A vibration of motion is oddly otherworldly or unfamiliar. Schulnik's imagination, hands and images seems more romantically inclined than modernistically formalist, says Schulnik, "My relationship to the subjects I'm painting never really changes between mediums. I also feel the same way about all the different mediums I work in, because one cannot exist without the other."⁷⁷ Schulnik's ideas take shape through a process,

I tend to be drawn more towards the handmade. I guess I am a purist in that sense. I like to see the thumbprint and all the imperfections that only the human hand can create, but I am pretty open at the same time. Really it's about if it's good or not, not about the medium it was made with, for me.⁷⁸

⁷⁷ Alex Ebstein, "Piled-up: Q&A with Allison Schulnik by New American Paintings," *New American Paintings > Blog*, posted November 18, 2011, accessed September 4, 2013, <http://newamericanpaintings.wordpress.com/2011/11/18/piled-up-qa-with-allison-schulnik/>. Sourced from Mark Moore Gallery, accessed July 25, 2013, <http://www.markmooregallery.com/artists/allison-schulnik/>.

⁷⁸ Emerson Rosenthal, "Allison Schulnik Pushes Claymation To Its Psychedelic Limit," *the Creators Project*, posted November 22, 2011, accessed July 25, 2013, Sourced from *Mark Moore Gallery*, <http://markmooregallery.com/artist/allison-schulnik/>. See, http://prod-images.exhibite.com/www_markmooregallery_com/2011Nov22_CreatorsProject.pdf.

Schulnik has said that, “For me, I work to liberate monsters. I see the paintings as monuments to the rejected, forlorn or foolish. The works are sanctuaries and I am happy to provide that. Happiness and balance is the goal.”⁷⁹ Materials are Schulnik’s means.

This is supported by Schulnik’s comments to writer and broadcaster, Robert Enright’s question about “Do your characters play into your personal sense of self or are they an entirely invented body of characters?” to which Schulnik replied,

I think they’re both. They are based in reality, but I think a lot of the time it’s otherworldly place. I think a lot of the time it’s impossible for me not to slip into the characters. I use pictures of people around me, and I take a lot of pictures of the hobos near where I live. I also find pictures in books or on the net. To make it stay in reality rather than become complete fantasy. I’ll sometimes take a picture I really love of somebody and use that as a reference. I’d say it’s probably 50/50.⁸⁰

Schulnik turns the human frame and the binaries of opposing human conditions into form and colour metamorphoses. The representation of the central character can mean an emphasis on poverty of the human condition transformed by representing internal thoughts or societal values reflected in the action of metamorphosis as a microcosm device. These miniature worlds may exhibit resistance and a lack of coherence between figure and setting making definitive descriptions complicated, if not impossible.

The discussion of Schulnik’s animated use of colour, form and movement to arrive at a descriptive combination of fine art and animation language may be found in Schulnik’s self described working method,

⁷⁹ Joey VeltKamp, “Say hello to Allison Schulnik,” *BEST OF: A Northwest-centric art blog*, posted June 13, 2011, Accessed August 27, 2013, <http://joeyveltkep.bogspot.com/2011/06/say-hello-to-allison-schulnik.html>. See, *Painter’s Table: Contemporary Art Magazine*. <http://painter-table.com/link/best/allison-schulnik-interview>.

⁸⁰ Robert Enright, “Brilliant Reject: An Interview with Allison Schulnik,” *BorderCrossings* 28, no. 3 (119). *Mark Moore Gallery*, posted by accessed July 25, 2013, http://prod-images.exhibit-e.com/www_markmooregallery_com/4be7ff2e.pdf. See, Allison Schulnik, *Allison Schulnik Artist Talk*. This transcript quote is located at 17:01-17:16 min. “A lot of the painting... [a] lot of the work I do is based off of people I know, loved ones, family, myself, hum, or random strangers that I see in the street.”

Color is quite key in my work, it can take on certain emotional qualities that are potent to me. Color functions similarly to music: it can move us, and it can bring very specific sensorial associations, memories, or corporeal reactions. It lends itself to the plasticity of the medium, and it really is the flesh of the work. I don't think the work could exist without it.⁸¹

The importance of a kind of synthesis of reality and imagination, previously expressed as a balance between real and fantasy worlds in between, may again be crystallized with Schulnik's inspiration, "[m]aking paintings and things, dance, animation and music are spiritual for me."⁸² If Schulnik's story is experimental non-narrative, a useful theory on the dynamics of form and colour, rhythm and expressive painting of the non-objective is provided by Kandinsky to present yet another triangulation. In Kandinsky's view conventional beauty and literary elements such as "“story-telling”" and "“anecdote”" are "useless" and that music, whether its harmony or counter-point comes from a beauty of "inner spirit"; beauty comes from this inner reality alone.⁸³ Kandinsky's "dance-art" or "stage-composition" is proposed as a "new theatre" that result is a triangulation of "(1) Musical movement (2) Pictorial movement (3) Physical movement" and with "interwoven" combination, whether with harmony or "discord" results in Kandinsky's idea of "spiritual movement."⁸⁴ Whether this is Schulnik's thinking is speculation. Schulnik's beauty and counter point performs as the film's combination of colour and music through the movement of clay.

⁸¹ Allison Schulnik, "Allison Schulnik Statements." *Mark Moore Gallery*, accessed July 25, 2013, http://prod-images.exhibit-e.com/www_markmooregallery_com/14_Schulnik_opt.pdf. See, Allison Schulnik, Mark Moore Gallery, Mike Weiss Gallery. *Schulnik*. Los Angeles, CA, Mark Moore Gallery; New York, NY: Mike Weiss Gallery, 2008. Sourced from Mark Moore Gallery, accessed July 30, 2013, <http://www.markmooregallery.com/artists/allison-schulnik/>.

⁸² Ashley Baylen, *Top 20 Jews In The Arts*.

⁸³ Wassily Kandinsky, *Concerning the Spiritual in Art*, 51.

⁸⁴ *Ibid.*

Extrinsic implies the maker's responsibility.⁸⁵ The Grizzly Bear, Indie Rock band sound track is integral. The central musical cue comes from an E keynote above middle C with initial timbre and emotive tone of a solo banjo resembling a sombre waning. Metamorphosis anticipates each rise in cord complexities and loudness (volume) dropping into spaces of sound pauses of lollid, drawn out cords strumming or plucking. A synthesized reverberation spaces timbre in patterns of limited range during several phases of increasing complexities where layered instrumental sound paralleling clay complexities and eventual lyrical sound over ends with the end of abrupt change. Schulnik's real and unreal are similar to those constructed by animators that are perceived as film form in formal and stylistic features used as storytelling features of plot events.

The grotesque celebrates in some ways the monstrous (counter to Kayser's need to subdue the demonic).⁸⁶ The grotesque as a dignity and important variation on the theme of humanity comes from Schulnik's participation in the catalogue for *Wild Exaggeration: The Grotesque Body in Contemporary Art*, an exhibition at Haifa Museum of Art, Haifa, Israel in 2009. Curator, Tami Katz-Freiman introduces the theme of the exhibit as showing the "chaotic, distorted and damaged" crosses over to the world of imagination as a critical tool for conceptual and socio-political consciousness... both as a "zeitgeist" (referencing Robert Storr) of the times and at its extreme, ambiguous form;

⁸⁵ Jerrold Levinson, "Film Music and Narrative Agency," in *Post-Theory: Reconstructing Film Studies*. ed. David Bordwell and Noël Carroll (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 1996): 254-88. Scholars Portal Books, accessed January 22, 2014, doi: 10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199206179.003.0010. Also, *Film Theory and Criticism*, 7th ed., ed. Leo Braudy and Marshall Cohen (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2009): 402-417.

⁸⁶ Wolfgang Kayser, *The Grottesque*, 188.

“**monster**” is a boundary-less and fluid identity that attracts and disgusts as creative and chaotic imagination.⁸⁷ This is a response distinction. Schulnik is aware of the dichotomy,

My fixation on these characters is not intended to exploit their deficiencies but rather to find valor in adversity. There is something honest and true about imperfection, something real about imperfection, something real about the shunned outcast. Someone who chooses to stay outside the realm of normal society or is forced there against his [her] will. The grotesque character is always that. All of my characters incorporate the grotesque in one way or another. They are often sad, pathetic creatures built upon a human frame, a fact that results in an awkward and sometimes surprising earthliness. Though often mutated, blemished or tarred and feathered, they are characters both admirable and flawed. Grotesque is the real beauty.⁸⁸

Katz-Freiman’s supplementary comments on Schulnik’s *Hobo Clown* highlights colour and transformation in the suggestion of homelessness continuity with the damaged psyche of alcoholism giving rise to a conflicting creation/chaos binary that Katz-Freiman links with grotesque embodiment and enchanting drama to “...fleshy textures and a flowing motion from form to amorphousness.”⁸⁹ Schulnik has collapsed these binaries.

The previous four quotes by Schulnik provide rich underpinnings for future research into the close critique of variations on several themes of art and humanity as soul/harmony/beauty and grotesque/blemished/metamorphosis. Here the more complete collapse and also differentiated representation of the body has situated itself as less than perfect in a less than perfect world. What are significant to continue this investigation into grotesque metamorphoses as alienation or resist to identity is the language of dignity, sensory and an anti-aesthetic of humanistic values.

⁸⁷ Tami Katz-Freiman, “Exaggeration is Twice as Real,” in *Wild Exaggeration: The Grotesque Body in Contemporary Art*. July 18, 2009- January 9, 2010. (Haifa, Israel: Haifa Museum of Art, 2009): 106-102. Exhibition catalogue. Author’s italicized and bold emphasis.

⁸⁸ Allison Schulnik, *Wild Exaggeration*, 84.

⁸⁹ *Ibid.*, 84.

A brief extension of these linked ideas can be found in the writings of Schulnik's CalArts instructor, Jules Engels. Engels lays down a blue print for interpreting Schulnik's point of view within the work. In *Experimental Animation: The Joy of Movement*, Engel writes, "Experimental animation is a personal vision—a concrete record of an artist's discovery of himself [herself]" and "the filmmaker's talent gives movement an aesthetic expression."⁹⁰ The anti-aesthetic of the grotesque collapse of high and low art into the movements of metamorphoses is interpreted through Engel's ideas of movement as a content of aesthetic and "an emotive experience" where the phases of pause, silence, emerges, disappearances and action describe here—metamorphoses' transformations.⁹¹ Engel is describing the "shapes/forms" choreographed in the movement within space and time along with exterior rhythm to experimentally, abstractly, yet organically, induced inner feelings between images and music.⁹²

The sensual themes that Schulnik is working with are experienced as settings within the film. The Hobo Clown in the dark alley and white garden of flowers and dark room of three heads and the metamorphoses of the figure into a mandala into an abstracted figure. The cues for transformation are linked to the rise and complexity of the music and the pace of sequences share sensitivity to each event. How the sensual handling of clay material then communicates Schulnik's personal philosophy or experience of life may be described as a relationship between the paradox of change and the contrary Hobo Clown identities reflecting a potential for metaphors constructing a series of stories or a story. It is a speculative premise.

⁹⁰ Engel, Jules. *Experimental Animation: The Joy of Movement*, accessed August 2, 2013, <http://www.centerforvisualmusic.org/library/JoyMove.htm>.

⁹¹ Ibid.

⁹² Ibid.

If Schulnik's diegesis or internal animated world is an interior imagination of auteur animation form, then according to animation scholars and filmmakers, Robert Russett and Cecile Starr, Schulnik's identity as an experimental animator may hinge on personalized staging and techniques that can be described as painterly or musical sensibilities.⁹³ Russett and Starr make note in their introduction of the personal motivation of artistic animators to bring their imagination to life, through traits of "fascination, often compulsion", within a space and time beyond definition; as experimental.⁹⁴ Starr refers to fine art cinema's inherit roots in modern art movements exemplified by Dadaists or Futurists and lists personality traits; working solo, with stubborn determination and little return in way of money and fame as indicative of experimental patience and inventiveness.⁹⁵ Potentially, conceived as an imaginary microcosm Schulnik's animated world suggests an animated stylization of the grotesque, retelling a form of resistance to the subjectivity of imposed representation.

For Schulnik the idea of a "mini-world" previously referenced from cultural writer, Tom Christie's LAWEEKLY Blogs, describes an intimate experience of the artist in the process of auteur control over art animation production including gallery installations.⁹⁶ When fingerprints are observed upon the surface of the clay during extreme close-ups what is significant is a kind of self-reflective presence of the invisible author and the reality of human presence in absence. Film and media professors, Terry Lindvall and

⁹³ Robert Russett and Cecile Starr, "Preface," in *Experimental Animation: An Illustrated Anthology*, ed. Robert Russett and Cecile Starr (New York, NY: Van Nostrand Reinhold, 1978): 7-8, 7.

⁹⁴ Robert Russett and Cecile Starr, "Introduction," in *Experimental Animation: An Illustrated Anthology*, ed. Robert Russett and Cecile Starr (New York, NY: Van Nostrand Reinhold, 1978): 9.

⁹⁵ Cecile Starr, "Fine Art Animation," in *Animation—Art and Industry*, ed. Maureen Furniss (Bloomington, IN: John Libby Publications, Indiana University Press, 2009): 9-11, 9. Previously published in *The Art of the Animated Image: An Anthology* edited by Charles Solomon in 1987.

⁹⁶ Tom Christie, "Exclusive Interview with L.A. Artist Allison Schulnik About Her Claymation Video for Grizzly Bear," *LAWEEKLY Blogs*, posted November 18, 2009, accessed July 25, 2013, http://bolgs.laweekly.com/westcoastsound/2009/11/alison_schulnik_grizzly_bear.php. Sourced from Mark Moore Gallery

Matthew Melton embrace literary scholar, Mikhail Bakhtin's subversive gestures of laughter and collapse of high/low art distinctions to affirm animated cartoon as the clown mockery of authority using self as a metaphor of social rebellion situating the medieval comedic as a self-reflective auteur.⁹⁷ Lindvall and Melton's consensus on the auteur includes animation historian, Steve Schneider's opinion that "animation is probably the ultimate auteurist cinema" and that the auteurist is a discourse of authorship subverting materialist theory that would negate personal voice or perhaps its thumbprint.⁹⁸ Although much of Lindvall and Melton's writing reflects modernist individualism, postmodern anti-foundational discourse of intertextual pluralism is discussed as double-coding and the carnival comedy coming from an author (Caroline Leaf and Eliot Noyes, Jr. are referenced as personally invested animators), suggesting however, that as personal narration, postmodern rejection of authorship, is resisted by an addendum of reflexivity.⁹⁹

It is difficult to only prescribe the character of the Hobo Clown as reflective of Schulnik's signature. Adaptation of Rockwell's *Hobo* series presents an intertextual encounter. However, what is significant is Lindvall and Melton's interpretation of the cartoon as a microcosm where the author may reside as a tracing of self or where a disruption of coding opens up new perspectives.¹⁰⁰ Wolfgang Kayser defines grotesque as an "esthetic category" forming part of the three aspects of process, art and reception.¹⁰¹

Literary scholar, Philip Thomson's rhetorical method to compare the subtle differences of

⁹⁷ Terry Lindvall and Matthew Melton, "Towards a Postmodern Animated Discourse: Bakhtin, Intertextuality and the Cartoon Carnival," in *Animation—Art and Industry*, ed. Maureen Furniss (Bloomington, IN: John Libby Publications, Indiana University Press, 2009): 63-77, 63. Previously published in *Animated Journal* 3, no. 1 (Fall 1994): 44-64.

⁹⁸ *Ibid.*, 65-70.

⁹⁹ *Ibid.*, 71. For a reference to intertextual pluralism and intersubjectivity see Julia Kristeva, *Semiotike* (Paris, Fr: Editions du Seuil, 1969), 146.

¹⁰⁰ *Ibid.*, 70, 74, 76.

¹⁰¹ Wolfgang Kayser, *The Grottesque*, 15, 31, 185, 17, 180. Geoffrey Galt Harpham, *On the Grottesque: Strategies of Contradiction in Art and Literature* (1982; Aurora, CO: The Davis Group Publishers, 2006), 3.

grotesque categories to delineate an ever more careful understanding of the grotesque finds a problem with looking a psychological effect of the grotesque. Thomson agrees with Kayser's "exorcising the demonic" as the disarming effect of disgust and horror through the use of the comedic, yet previously Thomson is cited as stating an effect of grotesque is "*alienation*."¹⁰² How does this relate to *Self* reflected in the play of contradictions and subversion Harpham discusses in relation to expectations previously, when Harpham explains grotesque as a resist to idealization or generalization. Is Schulnik's unpredictable expectation throughout the film constructing any feature that can be said to be a grotesque resistance?

Harpham may help understand auteur signature through the key essence of art as contradiction, "operating by laws peculiar to itself" and "form itself resists" as metaphor where absurdity is an independent grotesque figure of meaning.¹⁰³ A brief closure on story as narrative and film picks up on the metaphor of figure as a character found in the *mise-en-scène* of black and white contrasting clothes as well as staging of environments to suggest the picture within the film uses colour for sensual meaning. Schulnik has said that the work would not exist without colour and Engel's philosophy supports this as "[m]ovement is the feeling", "[m]y work is abstract, but it contains an organic element that brings people close to their inner feelings", and "[c]olor is energy", "[i]t is a process of perception, a process of creative discovery."¹⁰⁴ What Engel's bring to viewing Schulnik's work and the transformable quality of animating shape shifting's "ephemeral

¹⁰² Philip Thomson, *The Grotesque*, ed. John D. Jump (London, UK: Methuen and Company, 1972), 59. Thomson's italics

¹⁰³ Geoffrey Galt Harpham, *On the Grotesque*, 216-218.

¹⁰⁴ Jules Engel, "Jules Engel Statements," *The IotaCenter*, accessed date unknown, <http://www.iotacenter.org/visualmusic/profiles/engeljulesfolder/statements>. This statement came from Engels's exhibition at Tobey C. Moss Gallery, March 10, 2001.

form” is Engel’s utopia optimism; “The potential is infinite.”¹⁰⁵ Where form resists itself and its boundaries suggests comedic or tragic are two variations of grotesque human emotions that can be ambiguous.

Schulnik provides some direction,

I love animating; building, I love it all... Of course there is nothing like projecting it for a live audience. It’s the best to get to see your work on a huge screen, every little thumbprint, fingernail mark and hair-in-the-clay...getting them seen online is great! And I have been lucky enough to show them in galleries and museums. It’s fun to create an installation of a video piece in a room, and create a conversation from painting to video to—‘thing’ on a pedestal... [advice to aspiring animators/artists] Keep your integrity, stay true to yourself, work hard, let go when needed, don’t listen to people you don’t trust, and don’t take shit... [Biggest artistic influences] Everything. There is so much out there to be influenced by—I love borrowing—I love a lot from the long dead past. I love to collect stuff. I am a collector of collections and I am inspired by relics, once loved, but then discarded. I give them new love. Sometimes they end up in some form in my work; I could go on and on. I just like things.¹⁰⁶

Schulnik appears to enjoy life as a maker. The artist expresses an exterior or extrinsic outside world placed within the interior or intrinsic diegesis of the animated world of the *Hobo Clown*. Within more than one sequence of extreme close-up, fingerprints, can be seen (See, 7, 14, 25, 29, 44, 48*, 50). Schulnik’s emotive connection between music and performance and visual arts extends into film projections inside galleries or on giant outdoor digital screens.¹⁰⁷ Scale and apparatus of installation facilitate an intimate relationship between artist and the viewer sharing in greater detail the sensuality of the material and its metamorphoses. This sensuality of experience on scale is amplified.

¹⁰⁵ Ibid.

¹⁰⁶ akka b., *Artist Profile*.

¹⁰⁷ Allison Schulnik, *Schulnik*, 4. “Music is really important to me because I want to have the same sense of immediacy and emotional potency... There are definitely certain visual themes that creep into my work, various structures and patterns...” *Barfth* is based out of Los Angeles, crudely described as a shock performance heavy metal band. Also, AT 44 ½, “Emerging Artists 2010.” *Creative Times Presents*. Digital, 4:32 min., posted June 15, 2010, accessed January 24, 2014, <http://creativetime.org/programs/archive/44half/emerging2010.html>. Video Art on the HD screen in Times Square, New York.

It is important to observe Schulnik's delight in watching the Hobo Clown on large projections and specifically the references to details of the process leaving behind a maker's trace. The minute and pains taking practice required to animate the illusion of action is personal to the artist. It is absurd to see the eyes of a figure become abstract clay paintings. Unusual signature forms found upon the Hobo Clown head above the left and right brows are the black and white tubules with bulbous ends (See, 1, 8 and 24, 23) plainly evident in the *Wild Exaggeration* catalogue.¹⁰⁸ Schulnik is considered as working at play. It would be perilous to describe an interpretation, suffice that grotesque forms are not always public language. Here an *ethos* that the character of self and auteur, and contemporary *zeitgeist* form within an in between space of art animation story is telling about some themes that need discussion. A paradox expressing alien as an identity of grotesque resistance or an ambiguous and equivocal resist to finding a preserved autonomous self, escapes a common definition as a feature that is resisting expectations.

The discussion of body and personal history is particular to Kafka's story of Gregor Samsa waking up one morning as a "monstrous vermin" and subsequent self-discovery that Samsa undergoes to realize the details of transformation in all its outward appendages, oozing fluids and internal shift in mentalization or cognitive perceptions of the world.¹⁰⁹ While Kafka implies awakening from an unsettling dream, Schulnik's Hobo Clown puppet also appears to awaken from meditatively induced metamorphosis from staring into the fire; ultimately, transformed into a world far removed from the previous reality only to melt and blend with the next object of glaze, the rose, into metamorphoses inside the intellectual montage of faces and heads (See, 30-37). This black room

¹⁰⁸ Tami Katz-Freiman, *Wild Exaggeration*, 60.

¹⁰⁹ Franz Kafka, *The Metamorphosis*, trans. and ed. Stanley Corngold (1972; New York, NY: Bantam Classics, 2004): 3-55.

represents an inserted aside of mental images made sensorial. If this entire work is a plot of smaller events to tell one character's story then each shift continues a single overarching story. But, if the radical changes split up the narrative into three individual plots then each is a visionette to be associatively reckoned with. What this means for discussing themes is that if the film is reduced to abstracted form the emotive feelings found in shapes and colour to designate a sensual meaning a formal association of ideas then the film involves objective non-narrative. However, if a conceptualization of meaning includes more from Schulnik, then an expectation of represented identity or features of the grotesque involves a subjective narration perspective. Schulnik's as the same person and mind of the Hobo Clown shares a mind's eye of imagination or memory or the emotive manifestation of personage between author and spectator.

What is Schulnik expressing through the sensory of the material and the colours of the setting and the rhythm of the music? What feeling of belonging exists here and to what? Is it identity or alienation or resist to being labelled or is the label one that is made metaphoric? The paradox of these questions is found in considering the binary of conscious or unconscious states as the source for reading the film. Dreams and surreal collage or an imagination of death or a spiritual awakening are the subconscious irrational that could explain a relationship of disjoint events. Why did Franz Kafka's metamorphosis of Gregor Samsa awake from a dream to life as a vermin?

Kafka's *The Metamorphosis* is critiqued by literary scholar, Helmut Richter as one example of Kafka's heroes' struggle with "bourgeois acquisitive life" that produces an inhumanity and inferiority regardless of a testament to effort or virtue of self-sacrifice as

incongruence between a just humanity and the human world.¹¹⁰ Schulnik's Hobo Clown clay puppet can be seen as an icon of performative entertainment recognized as a fourth order of clowning to be the victim of circumstances, marginalized by sentimentality and poverty, experiencing misery and misfortune receiving the applause of the audience's approval.¹¹¹ Within Schulnik's cascading sensory clay and colour forms a contrary condition of comparisons of psyche include thinking about the Hobo Clown persona as an experience of real Los Angeles homeless or as an inspired adaptation of a movie or book. The themes of isolation, utopia and abstracted grotesque extreme all bring the discussion back to Schulnik as the first person point of view perspective. Similarly, Kafka's storytelling provokes a comparison of real and unreal self within authored stories.

Wolfgang Kayser suggests, "Kafka's grotesques are also cold grotesque" and that grotesque reception belongs to all "monsters" yet, as a tragedy genre Kayser writes, "[t]he creator of grotesques, however, must not and cannot suggest a meaning."¹¹² As absurd storyline, Kafka's vermin connects to Schulnik's metamorphosis. Kayser's interpretation of dream worlds ("oneiric") confusion with reality, whether ridiculous or mystical, Surreal or Romantic finds a feature in an eeriness identified as, "[...] the unity of perspective in the grotesque consists in an unimpassioned view of life on earth as an empty, meaningless puppet play or a caricature marionette theatre" where the artist's ability to animate and the animation of life becomes an alien world unto itself.¹¹³ Two

¹¹⁰ Helmut Richter, "The Metamorphosis," in *The Metamorphosis*, trans. and ed. Stanley Corngold (1962; New York, NY: Bantam Classics, 2004): 186-188. This essay comes from *Franz Kafka—Werk and Entwurf*, Berlin: Ruetten und Loenig, 1962.

¹¹¹ John H. Towsen, *Clowns*, 286-298.

¹¹² Wolfgang Kayser, *The Grottesque*, 148, 181, 186.

¹¹³ *Ibid.*, 186. See, Mikhail Bakhtin, *Rabelais and His World*, trans. Hélène Iswolsky (1965; Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1984), 37. It is of interest that Bakhtin describes the importance of the carnival folk culture as a democratic ownership performed as folk theater, especially as puppet shows and fair events of entertainment.

points: first, Kafka's character is telling a narrative from inside a mind inside an alien body; a mind Samsa's character experience through Kafka and secondly Schulnik's artist statements do not indicate an unimpassioned mind.

The contrary condition within Kafka's story according to Richter is the quality of human condition versus the condition of the surrounding world that becomes the embodied conflict or contradictions of reality in the flaws or tragic weakness of the hero.¹¹⁴ Anti-thesis Hobo Clown existence in a dark alley is transformed by both white garments the white garden settings of utopia. Richter asks what meaning can exist for those, like Kafka, who tragically, cannot identify with the Bourgeois world. Schulnik is speculated as presenting an anti-thesis of constructive features of empathy emerging from abject poverty, transcending misery and defying description as an abstracted figure because the *resistance feature is a grotesque extreme speculated as belonging to a character of self-discovery.*

¹¹⁴ Ibid., 187.

Chapter III

READER

The role of the viewer of Allison Schulnik's *Hobo Clown* film is to invent meaning. A co-creative role is described by professor of humanities, Karl Kroeber, as a reader's opportunity to discern the misunderstanding of storytelling as a site homogeneous, or unified parts, for sensing story narrative that allows for a "radical self-questioning" to expose the critical "universals" that limit the heterogeneous, or diversely constructed meanings.¹¹⁵ Making the reader a second person point of view of narrator situates the emotive centre of the Hobo Clown character and its state of mind as an argument of *pathos* for a premise of a responsive self. As a rhetoric strategy this appeals to an audience's emotional influence upon the making meaning of content suggests the visual elements of the film have powerful agency. The question of whether Schulnik has made a work that is about alienation, or paradoxically, as resist to identity, uses an inductive process to describe particulars of staging as suggesting a wider and more generalized surface for reading meaning. Flat characters become rounded with meaning in a literary sense. What is found in the tonal shifts of the staging and music are contrary realities that connect *mise-en-scène* elements with emotions to assist in suggesting features of a constructive identity for grotesque metamorphoses. The *diegesis* is a term of film analysis that has been defined as the internal world of the film. In the Appendix describing *mise-en-scène* staging elements of camera framing and the lighting and props establishes details of particular actions and music variation, along with the changing surfaces of metamorphic transformations as a visual reading.

¹¹⁵ Karl Kroeber, *Retelling/Rereading: The Fate of Storytelling in Modern Times* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1992), 3-5.

Suzanne Buchan writes about two experimental stop-motion animators, Timothy Quay and twin brother, Stephen Quay.¹¹⁶ Specifically, Buchan describes the idea that within the animated film there exists a “world” created by the animator(s) where the experience of these “interior realms of the metaphysical” as cinematic worlds entered into by the viewer as a spectator is a site for thinking about reality, technology and the “intrinsic differences” between 2-D and 3-D puppet animation.¹¹⁷ Buchan located the phenomena of experiencing inanimate 3-D objects as particular to puppet stop-motion where the audience can perceive the unique life of inanimate objects or materials once cinema worlds become projected and haptically appear to have form and exist as movement.¹¹⁸ Spectator responses to a reality of an unreal, illusion of movement, emotionally, suggests a paradox that Buchan’s has sourced from professor of film history, Malcolm Turvey and professor of film and media, Torben Grodal to distill cognitive relationships between the point of view of the characters and the audience’s desire for meaning about the storyteller’s perspective as a paradox of relating to the imaginary.¹¹⁹ The need to have coherence and a cognitive sense of order was suggested in the beginning as more or less what people like to do or achieve as a form of identification.

¹¹⁶ See, Suzanne Buchan, *The Quay Brothers: Into a Metaphysical Playroom* (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2010).

¹¹⁷ Suzanne Buchan, *The Animated Spectator*, 16-17. Also see, Suzanne Buchan, “A Cinema of Apprehension: A Third Entelechy of the Vitalist Machine,” in *Pervasive Animation*, ed. Suzanne Buchan (New York, NY: AFI, Routledge, 2013): 143-171, 157-158. Buchan describes co-creative process of shared metaphors as coming about through negotiating differences between old and new interpretations of meaning as “disturbances” of the “re-described” metaphor.

¹¹⁸ *Ibid.*, 19.

¹¹⁹ *Ibid.*, 22, 29-30. See, Malcom Turvey, “Seeing Theory: On Perception and Emotional Response in Current Film Theory,” in *Film Theory and Philosophy*, ed. Allen Richard and Murray Smith (Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 1997): 431-457.

Schulnik uses a clay puppet and inanimate objects like fake flowers or materials for a fire act as the mimesis of physical properties in a microcosm miniature of the real. The reality is that between animated and the real worlds there exist two contexts of the haptic, physical properties of material recognized for its paradox of real and illusion of life through animation.¹²⁰ For Buchan, the goal is to find filmologist, Etienne Souriau's "well-made language" to describe the spectator response to projected worlds that elicit emotions by asking questions about the experiential difference between interactions grounding objects in reality and the same object animated in the world of an animator.¹²¹ Buchan refers to Paul Wells and filmmaker, Lev Kuleshov. Wells is cited by Buchan as writing about the "subject", as the connective "individual", unique to animation and the lack thereof of an explanation of cognitive understanding.¹²² The extrinsic effect upon interpretation is described by Wells as "[a]nimation self-evidently reaches large audiences, appeals to them, and has an effect, but the specificity of this effect needs further research... for example, that audiences are reclaiming and revising the meanings of animated films... by addressing post-modern reflexivity" where "critical interpellation" or identity engages the text in different ways.¹²³ This is where contrary responses form multiple meanings from the contrasting visuals of scenes. Is this one film and one hobo clown or are there three? Depending on a viewer's perspective of features that are significant the possibilities are many.

¹²⁰ Ibid., 33.

¹²¹ Ibid., 36. See, Suzanne Buchan, "Introduction," in *Animated 'Worlds'*, ed. Suzanne Buchan (Bloomington, IN: John Libby Publications, University of Indiana Press, 2006): vii-xiii, vii.

¹²² Ibid., 25. Also, Paul Wells, *Understanding Animation*, 223.

¹²³ Paul Wells, *Understanding Animation*, 223.

Wells has undertaken quantitative research to use evidence in supporting animated environments and exaggerated characterization, and the representation of “Otherness” as a means to prompting responses that educate the viewer through projections, mental play and reconciled emotions, and representation to achieve an understanding of self identity.¹²⁴ The hypothetical null of possibilities suggests identity is ambiguous and exemplified here. It exists not as an author’s intrinsic idea about form, but as the extrinsic content of a social construct. Buchan refers to the Kuleshov effect as an explanation for animated puppet point of view achieving experimental animation’s ability to convey a realness or humanness within its world.¹²⁵ Kuleshov, theorized point of view is interpreted by Buchan as a structure of edited fragments of multiple images (montage) that can describe meaning. For example, match up sequences of shots where a character is looking or gazing at something and then the object is shown and then a cut back to the character reflects in images a dialogue of internal thought and also gives an audience an opportunity to co-create meaning by filling in meaning. Within the particulars of Schulnik’s film there are clay puppet close-ups and extreme close-ups of the Hobo Clown’s face, hands and object close-ups of the fire, rose and painted clay surfaces providing images as historical context and focus for viewer’s attention.

Schulnik’s film is an intense observation of an emotional setting of one isolated figure fixing their gaze on the meditated objects within the setting. The idea that a spectator can enter into film diegesis through literary theorist, Mikhail Bakhtin’s history of words or Schulnik’s suggested history of objects or Kroeber’s historical storytelling function means that mentalized responses have connections with previous experience

¹²⁴ Ibid., 232-242. Also, 233. Wells describes four structures as dominate themes: empathy and identification, fear and concern, treats and occasions, code of contentment.

¹²⁵ Susanne Buchan, *The Animated Spectator*, 31.

even if it is only a personal history. These images linked together in match ups and as cues for metamorphoses can be found with the fire (See, Appendix A: Mise-en-scène: 2, 5,10-12), rose (See, 19-25) and the mandala (See, 39-48). The close-ups of the hands as a small part of the whole deepens the intensity of the mood of loneliness, cold, poverty and story of life read upon the character of the hands. All these images are edited to communicate those important literary questions of time and space for plot, representation, emphasis action and value meanings. The story may not even be discernable but the narrative of these element are overarching in creating an emotive response as a discourse between the visual images and the viewer. The audience fills in the meaning through their perceptions of assembled fragments of multiple images.

Any discussion of edited sequences of montage would be neglectful not to involve Sergi Eisenstein's conflict between the fragments or cells of a montage sequence that is different to Kuleshov's shots as assembling montage, and its association of juxtaposed elements that link pieces of film's external dialectical or logical ideas as substance for emotion and meaning.¹²⁶ According to Eisenstein, montage's "*collision*" of cells or molecules gives rise to "concept."¹²⁷ Logically, for the most part, when listening to a story it is pieced together from a beginning, middle and end to achieve a conceptual understanding of the narrative. The Hobo Clown character is presented using images of abject poverty, utopia garden, metaphysical mandala, and finally leaving a sudden and surprising abstracted head upon the Hobo Clown's figure. Although this description has already been presented it is important to restate the images because now the viewer is the

¹²⁶ Sergi Eisenstein, *Film Form: Essays in Film Theory*, trans. and ed. Jay Leyda (1949; New York, NY: Harcourt, Brace and World, 2001), 36-37.

¹²⁷ *Ibid.*, 53, 111.

narrator thinking as the Hobo Clown and answering the qualia question of what it is like to experience what the first person's mind is experiencing as the second person telling oneself the story. Emotions towards these images and a conceptualized Hobo Clown mind will depend on viewers' perspective. The test for self-discovery that was identified as Schulnik's grotesque resistance and feature of grotesque experience will depend on viewers' logical ideas about beauty and the illogical extreme of a grotesque (aesthetically pleasing or not). These two contrary philosophical perspectives have infinite potential and also exemplify why the hypothesis is a null double negative is a constructive anti-theory.

What Buchan and Kuleshov and Eisenstein all agree upon is the production of an emotive response to images. Yet, Eisenstein regarded Kuleshov's thinking about external description as outdated, perhaps because collision and conflict is Eisenstein's thesis of film form and montage and was for Eisenstein the most powerful compositional means of telling a story as in inner monologue of conceptual, intellectual cinema.¹²⁸ Buchan's emphasis on point of view as a force of animated puppetry to produce spectators' emotive response may be an analysis strategy similar to Eisenstein's *Principle of Comparison* describing an understanding of a synthesis of dialectical, spatial counterpoint of graphic art and temporal counterpoint of music.¹²⁹ These ideas about editing together a perspective that an audience sees through the eyes of cinema's internal vision is important to a counterpoint or contradiction seen in the imagery of Kafka's *Metamorphosis*. Features of grotesque, imaged as unreal against the real images of everyday normal or familiar experiences are both Kafkaesque and Hobo Clown-esque.

¹²⁸ Ibid., 111, 53, 129.

¹²⁹ Susanne Buchan, *The Animated Spectator*, 31. Also, Sergei Eisenstein, *Film Form*, 52.s

Schulnik's counterpoint of reality locates a grotesque metamorphoses perspective as speculated emotive sites for the viewer.

What emotions does grotesque provoke? Is it fear, anxiety, or is it curiosity and playfulness? Can Hobo Clown-esque resist idealization by causing a feeling of resistance? Is that feeling an emotion of empathy or its contrary — rejection? A viewer's personal and sociological perspectives are two separate views if it is agreeable not to collapse the two as the same. If cinema, as Wells and other scholars have identified, promotes socio-culturally dominant perceptions then how animation becomes a form of subversion, following Wells, is by performing a radicalized counter-cinema using the audience as its subject, manifesting a cognitive paradox to support the illusion, while engaging in postmodern reflexivity for co-creative meaning.¹³⁰ This is interpreted as a comparison of the viewer's experiences with those of a broader society or those presented in Schulnik's film as multiple subjective perspectives.

Both Wells and Hardstaff want to express that “[a]nimation is repeatedly underestimated... to stress the importance of understanding animation within contemporary society... it remains crucial to remember what animation might deliver as a language of free expression and possible subversion.”¹³¹ The image of a changing hobo clown figure is a powerful agency readers read for meaning. The language of metamorphosis and grotesque body come together within the writings of professor of philosophy, Sara Cohen Shabot, to argue philosophical connections of being and knowledge are intertwined with subject and identity as grotesque is a combination of

¹³⁰ Ibid., 222-223.

¹³¹ Paul Wells and Johnny Hardstaff, *Re-Imagining Animation*, 60.

hybrid animate and inanimate worlds.¹³² Shabot argues grotesque as an intersubjectivity of a hybrid body represented as a feature of bodily flesh formed in ambiguity that provokes an anxiety action of the grotesque as both an ongoing shape shifting and an emotive state that refuses abstracted perfection.¹³³

The grotesque of the Golden Palace or Domus Aurea attributed to Nero circa 64 A.D. found underground in 1480 Rome lent itself to grotto cave as *Grottesche* that eventually became a specific reference to the grotesque ornamentally inspired designs of the Renaissance.¹³⁴ Human bodies and botanical mixing of form is an arabesque of grotesque union between animate and inanimate that blurs definitions through a metamorphic, doubleness hybrid. Shabot describes the ambiguity as an “undifferentiated wholeness” that describes Bakhtin’s mingled paradox of blended body containing this world with the cosmic; a degraded high with the material low of contradictory parts is an image that “[...] reflects a phenomenon in transformation, an as yet unfinished metamorphosis, of death and birth, growth and becoming.”¹³⁵ The idea of a visual grotesque language may be Bakhtin’s language, not of a historically ornate surface decoration transforming gathering spaces or Cathedral gargoyle statuary, but an exaggerated language of cultural folk humor from the carnival space in between high religious piety and a sensual low of ritual and spectacle.¹³⁶ Grotesque metamorphosis is playful anti-aesthetic joining anti-thesis worlds.

¹³² Sara Cohen Shabot, “The Grotesque Body: Fleshing Out the Subject,” in *The Shock of the Other: Situating Alterities*, ed. Silke Horstkotte and Esther Peeren (New York, NY: Rodopi, 2007): 57-68, 57.

¹³³ *Ibid.*, 60, 64.

¹³⁴ Geoffrey Galt Harpham, *On the Grotesque*, 27-32.

¹³⁵ Sara Cohen Shabot, *The Grotesque Body*, 59, 61. See, Mikhail Bakhtin, *Rabelais and His World*, 19, 23-24.

¹³⁶ *Ibid.*, 57-58.

Bakhtin's carnival mask of the romantics' as void, but behind the folk grotesque mask, is an "inexhaustible and many-colored life."¹³⁷ Bakhtin is grounded in an earthy body that Shabot thinks is essentially, intersubjectively, about being and suggests that a paradox of "deformation, intersubjective hybridity and excess" resists universal or systematic ideals of representation; the classical or Romantic doesn't fit into the grotesque ambiguity of "in between" binaries.¹³⁸ The binary of internal and external has been the discussion of a space within the triangulation of rhetorical argument persuading through the character of self as author and now the emotive sense that grotesque provokes amongst spectators.

Shabot proposes the grotesque body as constantly changing (embodied, ambiguous, hybrid, open) referencing Bakhtin statement, "The grotesque body... is a body in the act of becoming. It is never finished, never completed; it is continually built, created, and builds and creates another body."¹³⁹ Shabot's perspective is a postmodern pluralism refuting even philosophical reductions, resisting categories and definitions of grotesque, and normal to present alterity of intersubjectivity between other and self as the figure of grotesque. This is Shabot's conclusion to another essay stating, "The grotesque and monstrous are always here, within us, even if often we have a burning desire to flee from them and the things they expose to us."¹⁴⁰ This is a perspective of psychoanalytical and profound metaphysical significance of the immaterial upon the perception of the grotesque.

¹³⁷ Ibid., 40.

¹³⁸ Sara Cohen Shabot, *The Grotesque Body*, 60-61.

¹³⁹ Ibid., 64. Mikhail Bakhtin, *Rabelais and His World*, 317.

¹⁴⁰ Sara Cohen Shabot, "Notes on the Grotesque Body," in *Wild Exaggeration: The Grotesque Body in Contemporary Art*, ed. Tami Katz-Freiman (Haifa, Israel: Haifa Museum of Art, 2009): 101-96, 98. Exhibition catalogue.

Schulnik's Hobo Clown puppet character embodies both Bakhtin's multi-coloured face and blended body as Schulnik's statement in the *Wild Exaggeration* catalogue confirms a character like the Hobo Clown is just one of the many, "... creatures built upon a human frame."¹⁴¹ How the subject of Bakhtin's work, doctor and Renaissance writer, François Rabelais's (1494-1553) adventures of Gargantua and Pantagruel demonstrate conflict between social hierarchies provides contrary incidences of humour and horror that are associated with the grotesque. *How Gargantua Had the Abbey of Thélème Built for the Monk* is a succinct example of turning upside down or topsy-turvy the world of order into hierarchal chaos to reform a new figuration of the world. Schulnik's topsy-turvy transformation of the Hobo Clown character from lonely, sad Hobo Clown dressed in black to a serene figure dressed in white resembles a Topsy-Turvy rag doll. These handmade cloth toys present a figure usually in a long dress that hides the head and torso belonging to an opposite character beneath the skirt. Once turned upside down the revealed figure becomes an absurd surprise as both a novel and suggestion of a connective relationship observed within daily lives. It is the role of the spectator to invent metaphor.

Kroeber argues storytelling has a power of retelling to make narrative anew, and as such, meaning resists becoming dogma by Kroeber's "social negotiation" or the "social transaction" story achieves for the receiver's relationships to modifying or re-enforce wisdom, ethics and actions through the language of story.¹⁴² When Schulnik's metamorphic Hobo Clown grotesque is blended as animate and inanimate, an exchange

¹⁴¹ Allison Schulnik, *Allison Schulnik*, 84

¹⁴² Helmut Richter, *The Metamorphosis*, 188. Also, Karl Kroeber, *Retelling/Rereading*, 177, 188-193. See, 188. Significant for Kroeber to the idea of an "authentic narrative art" is feedback from an addressee, such that a panhuman or depersonalizing of storytelling exchange ruptures this process. *Feedback* is a term associated with I.A. Richards' understanding of sensual response from a spectator, reader, audience, etc.

of match-up edits recognizing several confounding worlds of binary collapse, and becomes a unity of differences. Kroeber concludes that a configurative comprehension is available to “rereading” a narrative in both the visual and verbal because for Kroeber the story is never static and its process of changing consciousness is equivalent, just not the same.¹⁴³ Within the *Hobo Clown* film visual unity becomes a mandala and the audio sound-over music becomes a lyrical otherworldly one-sided dialogue. This is a significant development for the metaphoric Hobo Clown personage for viewers to consider the visual images as identifying an alien or rejected or defiant character of grotesque.

How the reader is to co-create a response to narrative meaning through an appeal of *pathos* can prompt emotions until now not discussed. Is the Hobo Clown a figuration of postmodern hopelessness? Is this a rupture or paradigm shift in critical analysis? Within Schulnik’s film the lyrical one sided dialogue excludes a respondent and a choice that an audience can make is to insert themselves as Hobo Clown into that space left to be occupied. Kroeber’s “accidental particulars” turns on the predicate that images that represent moments of the familiar are pre-existing in the viewer’s past experience of imagination, so that when a particular becomes a complicated revisited extension of metaphors or allegorical in the mind of the viewer the “accidents” Kroeber calls “gaps” between signified concept and signifier form (linguistic theory by Ferdinand de Saussure 1857-1913) are the sites within narratives to be recognized by the audience as evolving story and “social sharing” and not anti-story actualities.¹⁴⁴ This is a viewer opportunity to fill in omissions or unexplained parts to meet their own expectations about a story.

¹⁴³ Karl Kroeber, *Make Believe*, 45-54. See page 211, Ultimately, for Kroeber it is the sense of control over the intellectual rendering of time, events and the conscious consideration of verbal storytelling’s ability to cause a socialization and interrelation between self and community.

¹⁴⁴ Karl Kroeber, *Retelling/Rereading*, 138.

Conceptually, the reader as a central figure of triangulated relations creates the metaphors and allegories not as universal but as mutable worlds of self as second person. The difference between one person's meaning and another's can be a gap; accidents for narrative as a pluralistic activity of active thinking. The difference between a second person narration of Schulnik's *Hobo Clown* film as one continuous film about one hobo clown and the viewing of multiple stories about three hobo clowns of different form and meaning revolves around the mind of the viewer inserted into reading experience. Culture and shifting agreement or resistance to beliefs, ideologies or even stability contribute to the diverse potential for making meaning by an audience. If multiplicity or pluralism defines postmodernism and anti-foundationalism thinking, its not predictable whether the *Hobo Clown* is a self on a journey or whether the opposite description of a shared gap of omitted details about grotesque are a feature of the potential for lost expectations.

Postmodern interpretations of intertextuality or Bakhtin's heteroglossia (multiple voices) discuss this pluralism of shared texts and voices, respectively, for a blended outcome of socially constructed meaning. Particular staging opens gap for voicing a reply to the lyric and the surface characteristic of mandala may be a metaphor of memory. Kroeber's accidents may be a kind of story rupture here between before and after without a dialogue explaining cause and effect. A gap in reason leaves the spectator grappling for a logic. Once logic is suspended or simply assimilated into the viewer's schema of experiences, illogical narration can be said to situate the reader into the center of meaning making to carry the story through to its end as co-creator. Is this Shabot's interior monster of the grotesque or Kafka's monstrous vermin that forms similar content about the grotesque? It is unknown what Schulnik's form of the grotesque means other than previously expressed in interviews as empathy and inspiration. If the reader thinks

monster, then grotesque is monster, if readers think it themselves, then the grotesque may be their own subconsciousness.

The familiar world that puppets mimic is neither real nor totally unreal, especially since the material reality is consistent, yet the metaphor of life brings together both an animate and unanimated—strangely. The unexplained reasoning behind grotesque metamorphoses and transformations exists with *mise-en-scène* of music influences within animation. Professor of English and Film Studies, Kathryn Kalinak suggests music is a key aspect of film's narrative and that aesthetic philosopher, Jerrold Levinson's test for musical form's relevancy is to ask if the film's narrative content would be perceived differently without the music.¹⁴⁵ The music in Schulnik's film comes from outside the film as a paradigmatic, non-diegetic sound and is integral in creating mood atmosphere within the settings.¹⁴⁶ Kalinak describes music's power to work with the elements of a film for an audience to create meaning from the film music and receive the important substance that music generates as emotional responses to maintain a film movement through sequences and "gaps in time" both preserving and contributing to narrative.¹⁴⁷

Besides thinking about the rise and fall of music relative to a keynote as creating a pattern of movement that precedes or follows sequences of metamorphosis, it is the tonal relation of viewer to music that is also individual. Significant developments of the classic drama of storytelling where musical elements like volume, melody, rhythm and harmony operate as a tonality. This generates narrative dynamics as convention or as a disruption of coherence creating patterns internal to the film's story. This describes thinking an

¹⁴⁵ Kathryn Kalinak, *Film Music: A Very Short Introduction* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2010), 16, 21.

¹⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, 18.

¹⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, 18-21.

audience or film critic provides as a perspective for creative direction when planning a film.¹⁴⁸ If instrumentation is non-narrative and lyrics or spoken word is narrative, then Levinson's test may require further consideration. Levinson's interest with sound-over music from outside the film's world or diegesis considers music as an integral component of a film's narrative which, in the case of Schulnik's *Hobo Clown* interview discussions with akka b. reveals Schulnik built the film abstract colour and character movements around the music of Grizzly Bear's *Granny Diner*.

One of Levinson's questions about music's function within film narrative seeks to differentiate between music adding a compositional quality to film and music making a significant contribution through a list of fifteen criteria; some of which are imparting a character's psyche, emphasizing a situation, heightening a deeper sense of what is happening, expressing feeling or involving the audience in appreciating the film aesthetic and its meaning.¹⁴⁹ If music is going to make a significant difference in the narrative then according to Levinson the music needs to reveal the inner lives of the characters or the fictional world of the diegesis.¹⁵⁰ The *Hobo Clown* film music is driving mood initially, until the one-sided dialogue forms. It is almost an outside or subconscious element, as sound-over, contrasting a reality of expected narrative against a style of abstracted and incoherent contrast.

¹⁴⁸ See, Emerson Rosenthal, "Allison Schulnik Pushes Claymation to its Psychedelic Limit," *the creators project*. posted November 22, 2012, accessed July 25, 2013, <http://the-creatorsproject.vice.com/blog/Allison-schulnik-pushes-claymation-to-its-psychedelic-limit>. Sourced from Mark Moore Gallery. Schulnik describes a working method describing a character, musical piece and the planning of animatic movements as a sequence of narrative or non-narrative (abstracted movements) involved in the choreographing of both stop-motion and the unity of music and planned movements, or visa-versa.

¹⁴⁹ Jerrold Levinson, *Film Music and Narrative Agency*.

¹⁵⁰ *Ibid.*

The significance of the song, as a separate work, is that it is as conceptual in complexity as Schulnik's thinking. Schulnik's metamorphoses play out like the song in its melodic tone and instrumentation of narrative. The banjo plucking an E keynote above middle C (piano scale) at intervals as a rhythmic cue indicates volume rise with layered metamorphic activity and reflected harmonies of mood. The music's impact on an audience is a combined significance of Schulnik's visual images generated from the choreographing of sound beats or rhythmic sections and the movements of colour and form for creating a responsive, filling in of meaning, by the viewer. The parallel sequences of match-up exchanges preceding or following the intensified mixing of sound with vibrate surface transformations produces images of a story about transformation that move fluidly from one sequence to another with contrasting results.

Once the music and sequences of transformation become out of synch, with regards to pacing, what is noticed as the metamorphoses speed up is a counterpoint to the music's continued rhythm of pedantic slowing narrative time as a foreshadowing of a climax. Upon reaching this disunity an ellipsis or omission of further continuity redesigns the storyworld as an action of a final metamorphic clay painting transition. When abrupt change reaches an infinity of narrative speed the viewer is left in a state of imbalance or disorientation with respect to time and space and the traditional story plot expectations are replaced with the reader of the film needing to co-create the linkages of plot to maintain a sense of internal logic of story connections. What about ceasing to care about a story? Is this the moment of abstract collapse of subject into the object of a flattened screen of formal elements for enjoyment? Is this the abstract animation experience or emotive perspective?

For Levinson it comes down to whether music is additive or narrative and whether it functions to “reveal, confirm, or make precise a character’s feelings or attitudes towards something or other in the story.”¹⁵¹ How does this view imagine the Grizzly Bear’s music as important to Schulnik’s film? How is this music about the Hobo Clown or is it just about colour and form? Levinson wants to know when non-diegetic film music is a compositional element at the command of the filmmaker and when it is an instrument conveying an act of narration as cinematic narrator. The answer Levinson surmises is applicable to all the other elements of filmic elements, leaving the rhetorical triangulation of *ethos* (auteur character), *pathos* (reader) and *logos* (Other) as a balanced methodology of perspective for describing a feature of the grotesque at work in the film. Schulnik’s choice of music presents a counterpoint of a dialogue of conflict where depressed, melodic tone of slow and drawn out instrumentation and synthesized reverberation is interrupted by the non-diegesis or intra-diegetic internal voicing over describing an argument over domestic duties (See, speculated voice at 32-33 and clear vocals from 41-50). The music is speculated as a linear narrative in movement, making the abstractions convey inner character and otherworldly meanings.

Schulnik’s use of the music’s otherworldly lyrics or spoken words, “Why don’t you do any dishes... why... I always clean up the kitchen... fine” (See, 41-50) situates a voice from outside the character and film form —or— may be the Hobo Clown’s memory, a voice inside a dream, half a dialogue heard from an open window or as an inductive device that situates the general spectator as having experienced the particular lyric inside the diegesis. Each viewer fills in this meaning. Remembering the Hobo

¹⁵¹ Ibid. Also, Levinson cites, Noël Carroll, *Mystifying Movies* (New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 1988): 216-223.

Clown is a clay puppet the audience is really filling in the belief in the animation's ability to be perceived as really occurring as more than light movement upon a screen and incorporate a sense of metaphor to its meaning.

This Hobo Clown metaphor is rich in potential speculation as an animated person photographed or befriended by Schulnik. It provides for an or audiences' inserted experience. The in between space situates the reader as co-creating meaning of the story as a narrator thinking the language of visual and musical metaphor representation. Two Modernist film theorists: Sergi Eisenstein and Béla Balázs were referenced at the beginning for their perspective on particulars and surface, respectively. Eisenstein understands the different triangulation of author, director and actor with the audience in the center as a spectator's perception assembling meaning.¹⁵² Balázs writes,

More than any other art, film is a social art, one that in a sense is created by the audience... In the case of film, the audience's taste and talent will be the decisive factors... Your great mission lies in this collaboration. The destiny of a new art... And, when we have learnt to understand the art of film, we, the audience, with our ability to experience enjoyment, shall have become its maker.¹⁵³

It is ironic that such hope was expressed as democratic by a theorist who recognized film as a new language of an "*embodied human being*" in-between the invisible body made organic matter by a shroud of "over-ridged concepts" versus a visible body of gestures raised up by film.¹⁵⁴ It is interesting that Balázs claims film over dance as the new language making visible the human body and it is words that Balázs claims to be the alienation of abstracted concepts.

¹⁵² Sergi Eisenstein, *The Film Sense*, 31.

¹⁵³ Béla Balázs, *Visible Man*, 8.

¹⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, 11. Author's italics.

The reader is of course narrating to self and if the response is one of radical self-questioning then it is conjecture to speculate about the constructive feature(s) of the grotesque or resistance to alienation or any identity that exists privately. How does an audience, as reader, imagine thinking about the Hobo Clown and the metamorphoses sequences? Would a reader of Kafka's work think differently or the same about Schulnik's film? Thinking as an objective narrator to recognize the feature of an evolving self, whether one or more characters of Hobo Clown meaning, is affected by interacting with the setting and its engagement with those elements of emotion that surround the self (i.e. sound, colour, level of lighting and props). A suggested interpretation of a grotesque *resistance feature is one of sympathetic feeling expressed as an image of self unresolved.*

Chapter IV

ANTI-STORY

What is an anti-story? When grotesque resistance is explained as a contrary to expectations it is easy to include story as having contrary expectations of a beginning, middle and ending logic as an anti-story of counter conventions. There are few scholarly works that discuss story as anti-story. Professor of english, Mary Rohrberger developed a three part historical perspective of short story as a “peculiarly American form” that evolved into a contemporary mode as featuring the collapse of worlds of the everyday with dream, leaving reality for the imaginary, stories as artifices of knowledge, and disconnection and incongruence as underpinning anti-story literary technique.¹⁵⁵ Who is the third person narrator presenting an anti-story point of view for discussing the grotesque and metamorphoses, and its potential feature(s). There is only the music of Grizzly Bear providing the auditory element of narrative throughout this animated film. It is important that the unexpected and non-diegesis dialogue at the end of the film situates an imaginary Hobo Clown character with an imaginary intra-diegetic inner voice at the center of an imaginary storyworld(s) within an imagined conflict with an absent person as foil. That both *self-discovery* and the *unresolved* have been identified as features of the psyche seen in Allison Schulnik’s grotesque aesthetic means a balance of imagined perspective is intended to open an ontological or definition of being to broaden the premise of a *logos* or use of auditory text to suggest a physical self exists as the Hobo Clown. It is a radical idea to make the Hobo Clown character an omnipresence and define it as a detached narrator of contrary, anti-story device. The double negative presents a

¹⁵⁵ Mary Rohrberger, *Story to Anti-Story* (Boston, MA: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1979), xii, 7. See, Philip Stevick, *Anti-Story: An Anthology of Experimental Fiction* (New York, NY: The Free Press, 1971).

constructive perspective for discussing the grotesque.

Narrative paradigm describes a heterodiegetic narrator strategy as lacking participation in the story. From a rhetorical position, *logos* as language refers to self and mindful thoughts, and concepts of the world. The minimal language found in the film underpins a conceptual animated world. Where empirical sensory experience and positivist factual descriptions assisted the discussion of a paradoxical identity of the grotesque as psyche, within this chapter the argument seeks to understand abrupt change and shifts against story as the postmodern expression of unstable contemporary self to suggest further features of grotesque resistance seen in the metamorphoses.

Briefly, the rhetorical strategy of an *apostrophe* statement represents an absent addressee from dialogue spoken traditionally in an aside or turned away fashion to indicate an imaginary or real presence of the recipient exists outside the context frame. The response in this situation as an ellipsis ([...]) of omitted dialogue by the Hobo Clown. The Hobo Clown as *I* and Other, occupies the interior of Schulnik's *Hobo Clown* and as a thought experiment the rhetorical device of *apostrophe* within the Grizzly Bear's lyrics, "[Go away now! (Speculatively)] Why don't you do any dishes? Why? I always clean up the kitchen! Fine!" becomes the softly floating sound or voice-over addresses in between pauses and gentle, countering exclamations towards a stand in absence (See, Appendix A: *Mise-en-scène*: 32-50). Spaces in between ([...]) become a personified presence that does not speak directly.

Franz Kafka's *The Metamorphosis* has already been described as an exemplary of a reflector narrator or third person expressing a heterodiegetic narration. The Hobo Clown found in Schulnik's film has been given the subjectivity of a person expressing a

perspective of self from outside the anti-story and any speculation about the qualia of this mind comes from a perception of *I* or Other as describing animated life as a clay puppet. The opposite sense of author of oratory voice and vision belonging to Schulnik finds in the Hobo Clown the source of these qualities. Who is Hobo Clown is and where did she/he come from isn't important because the multiple identities of this figure may include animate and inanimate categories consistent with grotesque aesthetics. As previously discussed, metamorphosis has been referred to by Michael Frierson as key to animation, while Paul Wells identifies its function as making fluid the "*abstract*" transition between states of matter or images to "resist logical development" and "determine unpredictable linearities (both temporal and spatial)" as it collapses, destabilises, conflates physical space, images and binaries of emotions, perception and reason.¹⁵⁶ The limits of empirical and positivist sources of information is expanded here to include the hypothetical and experimental point of view of an imagined subjective third person self located only within its animated animation.

The puppet animation of Jan Švankmajer's vocabulary of animation contextualizes Wells' thinking as a liberating subversion uniquely apart from live-action film. Similarly, Suzanne Buchan's senses the Quay Brothers' auteur style generates meaning through a socio-cultural standpoint and neo-formalism, yet is contrary to Well's idea of text in that puzzling narratives or anti-narratives produces a sense of alien diegesis resisting both an audiences reading and identifying identity.¹⁵⁷ When Well's discusses Švankmajer or Buchan the Quay Brothers a question of disagreement rests with socially constructed understanding of how animated inanimate or anti-story resist as subversive vocabularies

¹⁵⁶ Ibid., 69. Author's italics.

¹⁵⁷ Paul Wells, *Understanding Animation*, 11. Also, Susanne Buchan, *The Animated Spectator*, 27-28.

and meanings. The grotesque as Wells's liberating or Bachan's non-narrative languages of grotesque cannot solve the problem of experiencing a quality of emotive animation induced experience. Yet, metamorphosis has already been identified as utilizing materiality to create both story and experimental humanness and non-humanness, according to Wells, it is puppet animation that "carry metamorphic and symbolic meaning" and that is a mechanism for the "representation of human thought, human creativity and human feeling."¹⁵⁸ The *I* and Other as storyteller situated within an in-between void of suspended reason, maintaining an animated reality, suspends reason to give life to the inanimate as being, and again situates an anti-thesis of double negative as a constructive postmodernism skeptical unknowing.

How does a double negative work constructively? An continuity found by Rohrberger in the reading of anti-story mode of writing is irony as a plot device describing a "...merge reality with illusion... abandoned reality and move to fantasy...an attempt to make authentic the act of knowing ...plots [are] truncated or distorted, or abandoned" signal the anti-story."¹⁵⁹ Rohrberger goes on to identify the stories as strange and the convoluted symbols and metaphors as turning in upon themselves. Rohrberger thinks extraordinary and ordinary represent surrealistic moments or unity that are the representations of meaning turning inwards.¹⁶⁰ For Rohrberger, reading a story is presumed to bring together the harmonious parts of a whole to reveal meaning and impart a "governing principle" used to create a totality and its content beneath its surface.¹⁶¹ Here lies the problem of anti-story and its elements of a story.

¹⁵⁸ Ibid., 64.

¹⁵⁹ Ibid., 9, 7.

¹⁶⁰ Ibid., 7, 8.

¹⁶¹ Ibid., 9, 10.

Rohrberger's analysis of internal facts inform an idea about story that becomes countered by the resist to story conventions.¹⁶² Conventions can be subverted with counter strategies making an anti-story process a turning of these elements against the rule of structure. The anti-art movements associated with Dada as against high art canon or abstract painters' collapse of form and colour as the non-narrative subject against realistic representation are two example of counter cultural turning points in forms of art driven by rejecting convention for different principled reasons. Schulnik reserves an expressed adherence to principles of human representation as auteur artist while also abstracting finite boundaries of grotesque representation.

For the purpose of this analysis where the grotesque has been described as the blur between biological and botanical, this chapter's ontological definition of Hobo Clown as author, combine metamorphic physiognomy of *itself* as known only to itself. Postmodern's destabilizing strategies are at conflict with past interpretations of storytelling function. Karl Kroeber twenty years ago suggests that a good story "deserves" to be told, and that the response of an audience is the meaningfulness or "point" of story, making Kroeber critical of contemporary criticism that overlook the aspect of story that is affective, citing Oscar Wilde, for the abandoned importance of ethical considerations.¹⁶³ The tendency for modern painters to resist narrative in the collapse of representation of a subject into object is considered by Kroeber as the effect of emptying painting of narrative subject, shifting the participation of a viewer's imagination from story and any inclusion of moral or ethical judgments, as a modern

¹⁶² Ibid., 14, 15.

¹⁶³ Karl Kroeber, *Retelling/Rereading*, 32. Author's italics.

decision “*against*” story.¹⁶⁴ Significant is Kroeber’s discussion of modern painting analysis lending its vocabulary to this contemporary art film analysis. Kroeber has not accepted the subjectiveness of outer and inner, as nothingness encountered is a useless form.

For Kroeber the oral and visual narrative have a shared purpose as a story needs a storyteller to tell the story, achieve self-sufficiency, and play its role as a traditional socio-cultural function.¹⁶⁵ Kroeber argues the traditional function of storytelling is a relevant means for negotiating contemporary, socially constructed ethics (Kroeber’s underpinning), including “*identity*” and its subjective experience of spiritual awakening, while adhering to modernist painting’s ideals of individual or autonomous experience of reading to produce responses including self-sufficient, subjective empathy.¹⁶⁶ The shared participation of an author and the audience in a particular setting (apparatus) of storytelling is an important dynamic. The conflict that Kroeber acknowledges is positioned by referencing Oscar Wilde’s modern *aesthete* defining persons as free from ethical engagements with art as a formalist collapse of narrative subject. This is similar to theory(s) of formalist painting (subjectivism) or postmodern theory that de-historicize, de-individualize and de-socialize audience, according to Kroeber’s critique.¹⁶⁷ Is Kroeber describing an anti-foundational theory rupture of storytelling’s familiar, making the storyteller an unfamiliar antinomy?

¹⁶⁴ Ibid., 32, 34, 15. Author’s italics.

¹⁶⁵ Ibid., 38, 34, 38-39. See 190. Kroeber describes this point as “gesture without content can signify anything.”

¹⁶⁶ Ibid., 192, 144-145. Author’s italics.

¹⁶⁷ Ibid., 145. Emphasis added.

A paradox as anti-story and anti-identity conventions as meaningless-ness suggests an answer for the alienation versus resist to identity paradox of grotesque features representing an unstable contemporary self.¹⁶⁸ Grotesque is not the societal norm. Philip Thomson notes that this feature should not dominate a definition but that the “*unresolved clash of incompatibles in work and response*” marks the abnormal as ambivalent, so that the grotesque may be thought of as “*the ambivalently abnormal.*”¹⁶⁹ Alienation has already been described as estranged, and resist to identity denies an essential characterization. Ambivalent is neutral. Alien is outside familiar and belonging, yet belongs to *itself*.

The grotesque as alienation is ambivalent to classifications, order and normal. It is difficult to address all these ideas simultaneously, so Kafka’s *The Metamorphosis* may assist as an immediate example of modernist de-constructive perceptions of the world as fact and fiction. Grotesque as disruption may ultimately work as a method to answer the paradox. Alienation as estranged or de-personalized, is after all, a form of identity. Ambivalence can describe Kafka’s *I* as Samsa the third person reflector self as consciousness center. Does *Hobo Clown* exist in Schulnik’s film as ambivalent consciousness or a subjective gaze looking out? Possessing gaze can be described as match shots directed towards the internal staging turning ambivalence into simply being.

A space in between a world of understanding, as one’s believes it to be, and a world as truth can present contradictory form. Self as a personal consciousness and knowledge of truth and a singular *I* reality enters into the grotesque.¹⁷⁰ Schulnik’s *Hobo*

¹⁶⁸ Ibid., 125.

¹⁶⁹ Philip Thomson, *The Grotesque*, 27. Author’s italics.

¹⁷⁰ Ibid., 98-99.

Clown puppet elicits numerous stereotypes as a down and out marginalized homeless person, tragic figure and a metaphor for the depression of Post-American Civil War and Great Depression collapse of the American dream of individualism's triumph over deterministic classism. An allegory of the grotesque may be that the *dream* leaves the marginalized distorted as grotesque, exaggerated forms, to become the symbolic consequences of being left behind or trampled upon by the powerful forces of capitalism. This causal effect suggests an affinity with decadent fin-de-siècle, end of the century repertoire of grotesque images, appropriate to painter James Ensor's caricatures.¹⁷¹ How this relates to the Hobo Clown as narrator is through imagining the counter convention of anti-story abruptly making changes in mood through the music that accompanies the shifts in colour, form, setting and ultimately, an alienated, insect head surprisingly appearing from sequences of abstracted metamorphoses at the closing.

Kafka is quoted by literary scholar Stanley Corngold as writing about *The Metamorphosis* ending as "Unreadable."¹⁷² In the final Schulnik metamorphosis of the Hobo Clown clay puppet into a figure with a blocked head, green pinched ovals eyes of ambiguous alien or insect shape, asks if this grotesque is unreadable. The ontology is not between worlds of real and fiction but fiction as reality/reality as fiction. If Hobo Clown inhabits storyworld as a being, of grotesque beauty, consistent with Schulnik Haifa Museum of Art catalogue statement, then a silent counter action and paradox of grotesque transformation also transforms a diegesis point of view. Silence transcends the voice-over otherworldly communication.¹⁷³ Geoffrey Harpham theorizes that a function of the

¹⁷¹ See, Xavier Tricot, "James Ensor, Painter of the Macabre and Comic Grotesque," in *The Grotesque Factor*, ed. José Lebrero Stals (Malaga, SP: Museo Picasso Málaga, 2012): 123-108. Publication accompanying exhibition of the same name.

¹⁷² *Ibid.*, 159.

¹⁷³ Timothy Corrigan, *A Short Guide to Writing About Film*, 8th ed. (2004; Toronto, ON: Pearson, 2012), 73.

contrary grotesque when, compared to anything, act as turning against itself, never achieving certain knowing.¹⁷⁴ The grotesque Hobo Clown loses more and more of the particular identity of a lonely homeless person as the film progress. Is this action of expanded identity, whether considered one person or a collection of three, a turn of character flatness occurs with becoming a multiple of self (selves). Is a greater sense of a rounded character developed? Should grotesque features be perceived as contributing to roundness as the question becomes whether a feature of grotesque is dimensional.

What is beautiful about the Hobo Clown clay character is its transformation into a figure of multiple possibilities. The void at the center as anti-story occupies the perspective of metamorphic as an anti-logic to reality. Norman Klein describes animation as transforming time and disunities where the “in-between” of frames within the structure of cinematic apparatus, according to Klein, operate as a “mode of *trompe l’oeil*” or visual illusion.¹⁷⁵ Tom Gunning has previously described a reduction of “magic” illusion of movement as metamorphosis and itself,

Modern animation of motion as seen in the flipbook both derives from the magical possibility of metamorphosis and transformation and differs from it... Thus animation may move towards a capturing of the movement of the world, but it may also return us to the wonders of transformation and magic.¹⁷⁶

The mental experiment of an *apostrophe* Hobo Clown as an imagined *I* identity as an ambiguous and equivocal meaning is preserved in the sense of undefinability and unknowing. This important space of anti-story is strange.

¹⁷⁴ Geoffrey Galt Harpham, *On the Grotesque*, 23-24.

¹⁷⁵ Norman Klein, *Animation as Baroque*, 30. Author’s italics.

¹⁷⁶ Tom Gunning, *The Transforming Image*, 66.

It is also a paradox, both as absent and animated life. Gunning thinks animation as images made to move as opposed to movement made into images; animation uses stills in a sequence and motion-picture photography uses continuous stills.¹⁷⁷ This idea for Gunning begins with referencing Alan Cholodenko's assertion that "every encounter with film is an encounter with animation" and it is here that animation as "*playing*" with the production of motion or "*playing* with movement" also aspires to question how, and to wonder at animated movement.¹⁷⁸ Gunning stops time and space to consider the instant of a movement within a still photograph as a mastering of motion and its destruction by making movement static.¹⁷⁹ Following Gunning's still as the root of animation "[t]he instant embodies the potential to move between the regimes of stillness and motion... they produce the experience of the instant... our experience of time and motion in defamiliarizing manner... produce the instant of wonder."¹⁸⁰ How this is a collapse of images as fact and fiction, real and unreal resembles Cholodenko's collapse of separation between animation and live action movement.

Stopped movement is a frame of space that Furniss associated to what McLaren called hesitations of action (think pixillated frames per second). Schulnik presents a pixillated average of 18 frames per second footnoted in the Appendix A: *Mise-en-scène*. Several notable sequences show movements as a flicker or quivered hesitation (See, 8, 9, 44, 10, 41) of unfamiliar time and form. Here is a site of metamorphosis and the grotesque acting as connective for sequences of stills moving as the disruptive destruction of movement/form unity. Whether formal narrative or abstract stylization, grotesque is an

¹⁷⁷ Tom Gunning, *Animating the Instant*, 37-53, 36.

¹⁷⁸ *Ibid.*, 40. Note, Gunning's citation is from a published article by Cholodenko, *The Animation of Cinema* 2008, however, Cholodenko edited *The Illusion of Life: Essays on Animation* 1991 and stated in the introduction this assertion as the first principle of animation. Author's italics.

¹⁷⁹ *Ibid.*, 41, 46

¹⁸⁰ *Ibid.*, 47, 51.

estranged discontinuity cued by something unknown or unknowable found observed in a new expression of movement. Cholodenko and Gunning have ideas about cinema as a media that has disrupted notions about the stability of time and reality. Gunning's animated magic is a confusion of pre-cinema's understanding of movement that is fantastical as apposed to post-cinema's technological metamorphosis ability to transform movement into fantasy.

Where Cholodenko's "ur" describes this ability of "*animatic apparatus*" is summarized as animate of the illusion of life becoming Cholodenko's life of the illusion.¹⁸¹ There appears to be a continuity of thought between Gunning's Form is motion: motion is form. Where perceptions of "ur" are destroyed from seeming alive a re-animation of animation is "itself" according to Cholodenko's "in-between" space of life and death that creates motion and its non-motion as a "living dead" (included is spectatorship as one of the possible confounding oppositions) anti-thesis of "*psyche is anima*": spectator is soul; *ur* is spectership: *spectership* is ur.¹⁸² Spectator's expectations seem linked to the illusion and life of animation. This is Cholodenko's foundational theory underpinning all cinema and movies, that is, the act of the cinematic apparatus experience and the object of that experience as the "life" of its illusion."¹⁸³

Cholodenko's human/nonhuman world inside the diegesis of hyperforms reanimating the world of subjects within itself seems an affinity with Modernist painting formalism and the situated Hobo Clown self as *I* within the thought experiment's Other *apostrophe*.

¹⁸¹ Alan Cholodenko, *First Principles*, 101. Author's italics.

¹⁸² *Ibid.*, 103-104. Author's italics. The anima of Plato's psyche is associated with the air, breath, soul, spirit, and mind as an ontological sense of being linked with André Bazin's association with Homer's psuché referring to a simulacra specter wandering or ghostly life/dead state of consciousness. Another literary example of this device is Dante's *The Divine Comedy*.

¹⁸³ *Ibid.*, 103, 105-106.

What about associating Schulnik's Hobo and Clown to historically marginalized figures as uniquely American folk hero tramp as vagabonds regaled as having elevated degrees of sophisticated thinking as social critic.¹⁸⁴ The bulbous, rosaceous nose of Schulnik's Hobo Clown, its silent pantomime, ill fitted clothes and exaggerated grotesque make-up display rotund lips, resemble vaudevillian and circus performers. Silent tramp clown, Joe Jackson (1873-1942) is a close resemblance. While the fate of life is the cruel reality of misadventures for Otto Griebing's (1896-1972) or Emmett Kelly's (1898-1979) hobo clowns, one of Jackson's routines finds the clown in illegal possession of a self deconstructing bike that Jackson's character improves a resurrection of mechanical metamorphosis into a new creature of adapted transportation.¹⁸⁵ Between the clown and bike, both become new identities. The bike works again, but grotesquely, and the tramp, once a bike thief is now a grotesque innovator. What is real and what is imagined in narrative can become collapsed into one unity as its own postmodern truth and authenticity. Schulnik's Hobo Clown once lost to a dark alley and then found in a utopia garden is in turn made an authentic alien illusion of self to itself.

Corngold writes that Kafka's bug is a "literalized metaphor, soul of literalization."¹⁸⁶ This literalization of the metaphor means developing a one to one meaning of bug as a bug. This means that the Hobo Clown as a person is no longer transparent because as a multi-dimensional character there is an opaqueness to its metaphor resisting an identity as alien or any identity other than self. This is similar to Cholodenko's collapsed living dead becoming itself as an erased distinction between

¹⁸⁴ John H. Towsen, *Clowns*, 283-284.

¹⁸⁵ *Ibid.*, 290-291.

¹⁸⁶ Stanley Corngold, "Introduction," in *The Metamorphosis*, ed. Stanley Corngold (1972; New York, NY: Modern Library, 2013): xi-xliii, xlii.

reality and illusion. Schulnik's work as an anti-story places the Hobo Clown 'Other' at the center of a Grizzly Bear's *Granny Diner* song. The *apostrophe* Hobo Clown and imaginary *I* argue for a disruption of social identity. Paradoxically, the Hobo Clown is an imaginary *I* and transhuman life within the film. As it, he, her, alienation or identity apart from identity, the Hobo Clown can also be part of an identity known only to self or a plural of selves.¹⁸⁷ What is resisted is yielding to the evolution of changing images as the metamorphoses move through exceeding exaggeration.

Within the *mise-en-scène* the link between the entire frame of painted clay mandala (See, 41) and the Hobo Clown's final metamorphosis into a transformed figure without a recognizable identity (See, 52-53) cannot answer the question of paradox as a sudden and surprising anti-story ending. Alienation as anti, and resist as anti coalesce, reside as the imaginary identity of *I* as a contemporary art anti-story. This action has been described as continuous and the grotesque body found in Schulnik's *Hobo Clown* completes the null hypothesis, speculated as unanswerable, from the beginning. It is constructed from adding an unstable identity as a *resistance feature of the grotesque paradox of sameness completing self with multiple facets*.

¹⁸⁷ See, Emerson Rosenthal, *Allison Schulnik Pushes Claymation*. Within Schulnik's replies to a question on the animation process of the character figures the answer helps to highlight ambiguity of gender; "I will come across a figure in my painting that I really want to see move and breath, so I will make him/her/it of clay."

Chapter V

CONCLUSION

A conceptual null hypothesis that grotesque as alienation or a resist to identity is self-contradictory has provided a paradoxical working anti-thesis. In discussing three points of view coming from first, second and third person narrators of Allison Schulnik's *Hobo Clown* film the construction of sensual, visual and auditory elements of narrative have described three features as grotesque resistance to expectation. Constructive features emerging from images seen as abject poverty, utopia revelation and sudden abstracted, grotesque figuration story tell a transcended misery, yet defy a certainty of meaning. The Hobo Clown character is described by *features of grotesque extreme speculated as belonging to a character of self-discovery* and as having *sympathetic feeling expressed as an image of self unresolved*, and a *sameness completing self with multiple facets*. These features are as self-contradictory as the changes that alter the exterior representation of the Hobo Clown as speculated interior views of the character's mind or qualia present an experience of metamorphoses and transformed realities. Potential for future contemporary art history research and scholarship involving grotesque as metaphor, between worlds outside and inside animated film is proposed as centrally a concept about humanity, and a domain to think about for new knowledge.

The point of view that Schulnik as the first person, I, narrates as an expression through an *ethos* of character describes the sensorial, tactile forms and colourful clay of the film's appeal. The argument that an empirical experience of the senses as a logical way into understanding a perspective of story from an incongruent series of transforming events and evolving self or selves within the film found self-discovery as an underpinning

of meaning. Schulnik described the building of each character on a human frame. Whether as an identity of it, he or she, or as shared form with plant and animal, compounding ambiguity of assured classification is complicated while manifesting the mixing of being into forms of the grotesque. The sensory appeal is a logical connection between worlds, imagined realities, and a form of discovering self at the extreme of engagement of belonging to a body and its environment.

A second person positioning of readers as narrators viewing images as the elemental for arguing positivist, observations from *mise-en-scène* staging and diegesis storyworld details, describe a perspective about unresolved self. The *pathos* of rhetorical persuasion presents an appeal to images and diegesis elements. A co-creative process fills in the dialogue exchange and orders a schema of mentalized relationships responsible in a rational way for irrational disjointed elements within the broken text. Similarly, a story can have as many ideas about meaning as there are readers. The main character may or may not be multiple characters. Any designation of completeness or unity or predictability is open to fracture. Thinking through the association of images to construct a narrative of self was discussed as an unresolved feature sympathetic to the feeling of homelessness or grotesque misshapeness.

A third person narrator as an omnipresent, center of consciousness, within the storyworld, observes and describes action. Yet, does not participate. Its role is a uniquely *reflector* literary device. The *logos* of dialogue are almost entirely isolated in a short burst of one-way exchange at the end of the film. Imagining the Hobo Clown as an *apostrophe* rhetorical device, absence in words and effectual two-way communication, only exaggerates the grotesque situation of a marginalized and disenfranchised emblematic

opening shot of a lonely figure living in an alley. Registering internally, the transforming Hobo Clown thought experiment is positioned as a subjective ontological being, figural in its ability to express as *I*, a mentalization of its own perception. The discussion of imagined identity is not to essentialize a poverty sense of self. The multiple selves of multiple facets provide ample diversity and complexity to begin summarizing the benefits of a transdisciplinary methodology for the purpose of reconciling different but similar lenses into a compatible unity of perspectives. In a sense of sameness as opposed to the desperate poles of thesis and anti-thesis becoming a synthesis in Hegelian terms; sameness as a transdisciplinary lens means preserving unique qualities of animation, art history and storytelling oration to find both a language and a disposition that will accept new conceptualizations of a worldview.

Schulnik's worldview has been discussed at length from sourced Internet articles and catalogue essays and artist statements. What is similar in continuity and dissimilar in the variation of the same worded themes provide an example for future close critique of the subtle differences as seeds of grotesque inspiration in comparison to other artists speculated as working with this particular style of expression as a form of subversion or resistance to identity. The null hypothesis cannot be explained as having significant information to confirm speculations, however a collapse of differences in between human and technological imaginary self could locate the computer environments of program language as sites of the grotesque as glitches for future research considerations. The writings of Norman Klein about hesitations, Alan Cholodento's "ur" and Tom Gunning's consideration of still images are all potentially magical reversals to digital fracture describing somewhat contrary playful resist to perfection operations of expectations.

Distorted bodies resembling the figure of humanity and/or its prosthetic transhuman self has features of self-discovery. The unresolved and multiple facets expressed digitally as alienation or an identity of disenfranchisement can appear unexpectedly describing the sudden altered state that can repulse or prompt a response. Exaggerated forms from an incompatibility of code is an example of misshapen parts and ambivalent conditions mixing a language of extreme and feeling and sameness proposed in the features to be reworded appropriately for transdisciplined lenses that could include mathematics or computer sciences and its fuzzy sets. A microcosm suggests the interior world of a story reflects the exterior world (on a smaller and perhaps metaphorical level). How invisible technological worlds produce examples of grotesque aesthetics is a promising subject for scholarship in contemporary animation and art history.

A constructive double negative anti-thesis reverses laws for considering experiences of life as including transhuman, art plastic surgery and religious paradigms. Some psychology theories triangulate self. Kafka explains,

Hence the world was for me divided into three parts: one in which I, the slave lived under the laws that had been invented only for me and which I could, I did not know why, never completely comply with; then a second world, which was definitely remote from mine, in which you lived, concerned with government, with the issuing of orders and with the annoyance about their not being obeyed; and finally a third world where everybody else lived happily and free from orders and having to obey.¹⁸⁸

Here Kafka explores the three aspects of psyche that Sigmund Freud called Id, Ego and Superego. One is child, and adult and the ultraistic. This is an intersubjective triangulation of personal identity between conscious and subconscious theory from psychoanalysis theory.

¹⁸⁸ Franz Kafka, "Letter to his Father," *John Guy Pollick*, posted May 12, 2014, accessed December 10, 2014, <http://johnguypollick.com/tag/grotesque/>.

Wolfgang Kayser described a triangulation of relationships between the process, object and reception of the grotesque. Meaning, according to Kayser is not the projection of the maker, and it is interpreted as an understanding of estrangement or alienation that is not the turning away of the artist but it is the spectator, who in turn, accepts the response. Potentially, Schulnik uses responses to form microcosms and the associated relationship of desperate influences to produce grotesque features. Norman Rockwell's Hobo series circa 1920's, Martha Graham dancing in Schulnik's *Mound* or Patterson-Gimlin's Bigfoot and a Rendlesham Forest UFO in Schulnik's *Forest* or Joseph Cornell's *East of Borneo* solar eclipse presented as a new moon at the end of *Forest* and *Eager* are all are possibilities of postmodern simulacra playfulness—in miniature.

Kayser discusses “Kafka’s universe of strangeness” as not coming from “Self, but from the nature of the world and the discrepancy between world and Self” as explaining the separation of the two as an incompatibility and desire for withdraw to an “idyllic or anchoritic” constructed reality that is thwarted by the external world’s influence.¹⁸⁹ More than one excluded voice of philosophical or traditional imaginative practices, for example, can assist in (re)framing new thinking about animation to describe how animation differentiates a co-creative approach of active viewer engagement with artists’ imagination to discover *something*. Grotesque metamorphosis can be subversive.

Artists engaged with spiritual themes may choose in similar ways to subvert convention. Is there grotesque contemporary religious art? I think so. Where does contemporary art history discuss the murgence of the unexpected association with the

¹⁸⁹ Wolfgang Kayser, *The Grottesque*, 146-147.

everyday as grotesque and otherworldly beyond the sublime or ironic? There are situations where the blur between real and illusion merge in everyday episodes of other worlds. Who is Michael Richards? Richards, the actor, played Cosmo Kramer on television's *Seinfeld*.¹⁹⁰ In Diane Keaton's book, *Clown Paintings*, Richards' "[T]hrough the image of death, the jester's light upon the fate of man becomes the ultimate joke on us" is manifest in the character Kramer who suffers from Coulrophobia (the fear of clowns). Grotesque is the inside out reversal of contemporary conventions and secondly, the disruption of story demonstrates both the subversion of form built upon the human frame, as Schulnik has suggested, resisting conventions and permanence of transmogrification.¹⁹¹ Metamorphosis is a playful anti-aesthetic joining the before and after worlds of contemporary vocabulary discussing perception.¹⁹² Schulnik's *Hobo Clown* is grotesque at play and also a thought-provoking site for discovering a consciousness about humanity. Each viewer can decide the Hobo Clown's narrative as story or anti-story.

A constructive double negative anti-thesis reverses laws associated with metaphysical ethic into something that cannot be naturalized. As a paradox of opposing philosophies within grotesque forms its discussion of multiple perspectives is an imperfect feature. Turning grotesque into something metaphysical begins with rejecting a sense of Western laws of binary nexus using good and evil as subjective judgment. A puzzling contemporary art history question is proposed to consider a grotesque

¹⁹⁰ Michael Richards, "The Ultimate Joke," in *Clown Paintings*, ed. Dianne Keaton (New York, NY: lookout book, powerHouse Books, 2002): 87.

¹⁹¹ Transmortification: A humorous, surprising or magical transformation.

¹⁹² See, Frances S. Connelly, "Introduction: Entering the *Spielraum*," in *The Grotesque in Western Art and Culture*, 1-23, (New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 12. *Spielraum* is described by Connelly in relation to Geoffrey Galt Harpham's "Interval" as a space occupied with play. See, Harpham, *On the Grotesque*, 17-22. Harpham describes perceiving the grotesque as a state of flux and process where the illusion of ambiguity is not experienced as itself.

metaphysical experience of clay as a subjective being. Is a transcendent experience seen as also immanently viewable in digital files showing animated clay, or is it closer to [a] truth of abstracted reality when watching a documentary of an artist, such as Schulnik, interacting with clay or painting in oil or dancing in space?¹⁹³ Clay, paint and space, as beings, are involved with an action of becoming a new reality. An unknowable state of belonging is posed as grotesque aesthetic. This feature of dignity for the impoverished seems appropriately ironic for art and artists. Two “I”s come together as a meeting in between maker and material, I as auteur first person, and *I* omnipresent third person center of consciousness as Hobo Clown, redefine [a] humanity as an otherworldly animation. The viewer participates or makes their own grotesque, dignity and expectation from the features of an experience of witnessing diverse ontologically proposed realities.

Art critic, Walter Klepac addressed the Toronto symposium, *High Stakes: A Global Crisis in Art?*, and remarked that some of the postmodern concepts about art might be considered myth and discussed how and why many contemporary ideas have influenced perception about art making and art object appreciation. Klepac’s closing remarks shared Toronto New New Painting painter, Joseph Drapell’s thoughts on contemporary avantgarde’s adherence to acceptance and conformity as reigning art world paradigm opposed to the old ideas of resistance.¹⁹⁴ Grotesque resistance found in the metamorphosis of media features the imperfect and the subversive self.

¹⁹³ “Credits,” *Boxtrolls*, directed by Anthony Stacchi and Graham Annable (Portland, OR: Laika, 2014), DVD.

¹⁹⁴ Walter Klepac, “Remarks on a Symposium: High Stakes: A Global Crisis in Art?,” *CCCA Canadian Art Database*, accessed July 23, 2013, <http://ccca.concordia.ca/c/writing/k/klepac/klep009t.html>.

It is surprising that Schulnik returned to a non-conforming life style of creating studio animation and ventured into the art world of institutional exhibitions and art market at the beginning of the Global Financial Crisis (circa. 2007) offering works of grotesque aesthetic. Los Angeles based writer and curator, Carol Cheh was aware of previous statements by Schulnik concerning the appearance of this style looking “sloopy” and asked if Schulnik had ever entertained the notion of pursuing a more realistic style, Schulnik responded,

Sloppy is my primary mode. I’m not capable of making work that is seamlessly realistic. I just have no interest in it. Perfection is an unhappy venture. I love all kinds of work. I like things that are done with care and love. But I do love seeing the thumbprint in the clay, and the brush in the paint. It’s just a natural way for me to work to best get my characters across. The character is most important. I don’t think about medium too much.¹⁹⁵

Suffice that this statement from a reversed perspective of the subjective Hobo Clown would rearrange relationships as hypothetically, becoming the best thumbprint, while not thinking about the artist too much.

¹⁹⁵ Cheh, Carol. *Allison Schulnik*. Note: Stephan Maine, “Allison Schulnik: Mike Weiss,” *Art in America: Exhibition Reviews*, accessed July 25, 2013, http://prod-images.exhibite.com/www_markmooregallery_com/bf655183c.pdf. Sourced from Mark Moore Gallery. This article was published in March of 2009 and is included only as a reference for its perceived lack of care and serious consideration for the level of commitment and dedication an artist can have while still deciding to paint “sloopy.” It is noteworthy to list a few quotes from Maine’s writing as a historical document demonstrating the potential for any review to dismiss an artist in the early stages of building a career. Writes Maine, “Schulnik is also into lowbrow taste, to judge from the mawkish conventions of her pathetic portraits”, “The pinup tradition turns toxic in *Girl with Animal #2*, in which a bodacious, wide-mouthed blond assumes the slinky squat of a sexual predator and offers her rosy ass to the crouching tiger behind her; both creatures regard the viewer with something like alarm”, “... *Hobo Clown*, a 3 ½-minute claymation [Registered Trademark] video from 2000.” Need there be any further comment— one more. Maine concludes the article with a scathing assessment; “Schulnik has set her career off to an auspicious start. How long she can retool kitche is another question, but for the moment her light burns bright.” Also, Actor Ernie Coombs, better known as children’s entertainer “Mr. Dressup” was presented a honorary doctorate by Trent University in Peterborough, Ontario. Looking to Coombs’ 2001 convocation ceremony address to faculty and graduates for some applicable advice relevant to hierarchal struggles found in art criticism’s superfluous gibberish; “Keep an open mind, and an open heart. Don’t take life too seriously— it doesn’t last forever, you know.”

Bibliography

The bibliography lists primary sourced works that have contributed to the writing of this paper. A secondary category of *Reference Material* has been included for the benefit of readers and scholars seeking recommended sources cited as support documents and through primary sources' footnote, endnote or bibliography contributions to scholarship.

- 44 ½. "Emerging Artists 2010." *Creative Times Presents*. Posted June 15, 2010. Accessed January 24, 2014.
<http://creativetime.org/programs/archive/44half/emerging2010.html>.
- Abrams, M.H. *A Glossary of Literary Terms*, 7th ed. Boston, MA: Heinle and Heinle, 1999. Originally published in 1957.
- Ackerman, Evelyn and Fredrick E. Keller. *Humpty Dumpty Circus from A to Z*. Los Angeles, CA: Era Industries, 1975.
- akka b. "Artist Profile: Allison Schulnik," *Dragonframe*. Posted n.d. Accessed July 26, 2013. <http://www.dragonframe.com/profile-allison-schulnik.php>.
- Agah, Price Latimer, ed. "Art: Allison Schulnik and Eric Yahnker." *LOOKBOOKS*. Posted February 28, 2012. Accessed July 26, 2013.
<http://lookbooks.com/marketplace/lookbooks-interviews/news/art-allison-schulnik-eric-yahnker>.
- Art Agenda. "Allison Schulnik: Fools, Rejects and Sanctuaries," *Art Agenda*. Posted n.d. Accessed July 28, 2013. <http://www.art-agenda.com/shows/allison-schulnik-fools-rejects-and-sancturaries/>.
- Bakhtin, Mikhail. *Rabelais and His World*. Translated by Hélène Iswolsky. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1984. Originally published in 1965.
- Bartlett, Mark. "Socialimagestics and Cinemasymboisi: The Materiality of A-Realism." In *Pervasive Animation*. Edited by Suzanne Buchan. 197-223. New York, NY: AFI, Routledge, 2013.
- Balázs, Béla. "From Theory of the Film." In *Film Theory and Criticism*, 7th ed. Edited by Leo Braudy and Marshall Cohen. 273-281. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2009.
- _____. "Invisible Man." In *Béla Balázs: Early Film Theory: Visible Man and the Spirit of Film*, 1-90. Edited by Erica Carter. Translated by Rodney Livingston. New York, NY: Berghahn Books, 2011. Originally published in 1924.
- _____. *The Spirit of Film*, in *Béla Balázs: Early Film Theory: Visible Man and the Spirit of Film*, 91-234. Edited by Erica Carter. Translated by Rodney Livingston. New York, NY: Berghahn Books, 2011. Originally published in 1930.
- Baylen, Ashley. "Top 20 Jews In The Arts- Allison Schulnik." Accessed August 1, 2013. UJA Federation of Greater Toronto. <http://www.shalomlife.com/culture/15092/top-20-jews-in-the-arts-allison-schulnik/>.
- Beckman, Karen. "Introduction." In *Animating Film Theory*, 1-22. Edited by Karen Beckman. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2014.
- Bordwell, David and Kristin Thompson. *Film Art: An Introduction*. 2nd ed. New York, NY: Alfred A. Knopt, 1986.
- _____, "Glossary." In *Film Art: An Introduction*, 384-389. 2nd ed. New York, NY: Alfred A. Knopt, 1986.
- _____. "Style as a Formal System: Summary." In *Film Art: An Introduction*, 261-286. 2nd ed. New York, NY: Alfred A. Knopt, 1986.

- Buchan, Suzanne. "Introduction." In *Animated 'Worlds'*, vii-xiii. Edited by Suzanne Buchan. Bloomington, IN: John Libby Publications, University of Indiana Press, 2006.
- _____. "Introduction: Pervasive Animation." In *Pervasive Animation*, 1-22. Edited by Suzanne Buchan. New York, NY: Routledge, AFI Film Reader, 2013.
- _____. "The Animated Spectator: Watching the Quay Brothers' 'Worlds'." In *Animated 'Worlds'*, 15-38. Edited by Suzanne Buchan. Bloomington, IN: John Libby Publications, University of Indiana Press, 2006.
- Cheh, Carol. "Allison Schulnik," *art ltd*. Posted May 2013. Accessed July 25, 2013. http://www.artltdmag.com/index.php?subaction=showfull&id=1368052874&archive=&start_from=&ucat=28&.
- Cholodenko, Alan. "First Principles" of Animation." In *Animating Film Theory*, 98-110. Edited by Karen Beckman. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2014.
- Christie, Tom. "Exclusive Interview with L.A. Artist Allison Schulnik About Her Claymation Video for Grizzly Bear." *LAWEEKLY Blogs*. Posted November 18, 2009. Accessed July 25, 2013. http://blogs.laweekly.com/westcoastsound/2009/11/allison_schulnik_grizzly_bear.php
- Mark Moore Gallery markmooregallery.com/artists/allison-schulnik/.
- Corich, Nicholas. "Character Study: Allison Schulnik + Daniel Gordon." *VIP ART Productions*. Posted August 29, 2012. Accessed July 30, 2013. <http://vimeo.com/48462434>.
- Corngold, Stanley. "Introduction." In *The Metamorphosis*, xi-xliii. Edited by Stanley Corngold. New York, NY: Modern Library, 2013. Originally published in 1972.
- _____. "Kafka's *The Metamorphosis*: Metamorphosis of the Metaphor." In *The Metamorphosis*, 158-196. Translated and edited by Stanley Corngold. New York, NY: Modern Library, 2013.
- Corrigan, Timothy. *A Short Guide to Writing About Film*, 8th ed. Toronto, ON: Pearson, 2012. Originally published in 2004.
- "Credits." *Boxtrolls*. DVD. Directed by Anthony Stacchi and Graham Annable. Directed by Portland, OR: Laika, 2014.
- D'Alleva, Anne. *Methods and Theories of Art History*, 2nd ed. London, UK: Laurence King Publishing, 2012.
- Depastino, Todd. *Citizen Hobo: How a Century of Homelessness Shaped America*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 2003.
- Ebstein, Alex. "Piled-up: Q&A with Allison Schulnik by New American Paintings," *New American Paintings>Blog*, Posted November 18, 2011. Accessed September 4, 2013. <http://newamericanpaintings.wordpress.com/2011/11/18/piled-up-qa-with-allison-schulnik/>.
- Eisenstein, Sergi. *Film Form: Essays in Film Theory*. Translated and edited by Jay Leyda. New York, NY: Harcourt, Brace and World, 2001. Originally published in 1949.
- _____. *The Film Sense*. Translated and edited by Jay Leyda. New York, NY: Harcourt, Brace and World, 1970. Originally published in 1942.
- Engel, Jules. *Experimental Animation: The Joy of Movement*. Accessed August 2, 2013. <http://www.centerforvisualmusic.org/library/JoyMove.htm>.
- _____. "Jules Engel Statements," *The iotaCenter*. Accessed September 6, 2013. <http://www.iotacenter.org/visualmusic/profiles/engeljulesfolder/statements>.

- _____. "Reflections: Graphic Choreography." *Center for Visual Music*. Posted n.d. Accessed October 15, 2014. <http://www.centerforvisualmusic.org/library/Reflections.htm>.
- _____. "UPA." In *Animation—Art and Industry*, 151-156. Edited by Maureen Furniss. Bloomington, IN: John Libby Publication, University of Indiana Press, 2009.
- Enright, Robert. "Brilliant Reject: An Interview with Allison Schulnik," *BorderCrossings* 28, no. 3 (119). Posted by Mark Moore Gallery. Accessed July 25, 2013. http://prod-images.exhibit-e.com/www_markmooregallery_com/4be7ff2e.pdf.
- Evan, Robert C. "Aspects of the Grotesque in Franz Kafka's *The Metamorphosis*." In *The Grotesque*, 135-144. Edited by Harold Bloom and Blake Hobby. New York, NY: Bloom's Literary Criticism, Infobase Publications, 2009.
- Furniss, Maureen. *Art in Motion: Animation Aesthetics*. Bloomington, IN: John Libby Publishing, University of Indiana Press, 2009. Originally published 1998.
- Frierson, Michael. *Clay Animation: American Highlights 1908 to Present*. Edited by Frank Beaver. Toronto, ON: Maxwell Macmillian, 1994.
- Gehman, Chris and Steve Reinke. "Introduction." In *The Sharpest Point: Animation at the End of Cinema*, 6-8. Edited by Chris Gehman and Steve Reinke. Toronto, ON: YYZ Books, Ottawa International Film Festival, Images Festival, 2005.
- Gray, Richard T. et al. "Kafkaesque." In *A Franz Kafka Encyclopedia*. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 2005.
- Grizzly Bear*. Accessed October 16, 2013. <http://grizzly-bear.net/>. Accessed September 21, 2014. <http://grizzly-bear.net/music/eps/friend/>.
- Gunning, Tom. "Animating the Instant: The Secret Symmetry between Animation and Photography." In *Animating Film Theory*, 37-53. Edited by Karen Beckman. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2014.
- Harpham, Geoffrey Galt. *On the Grotesque: Strategies of Contradiction in Art and Literature*. Aurora, CO: The Davis Group Publishers, 2006. Originally published 1982.
- _____. "The Grotesque: First Principles." *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 34, no. 4 (Summer 1976): 461-468.
- Hawn, Goldie. "The Light and the Dark." In *Clown Paintings*, 61. Edited by Diane Keaton. New York, NY: lookout books/powerHouse Books, 2002. Originally published in 1996.
- Herman, David. "Glossary." In *The Cambridge Companion to Narrative*, 274-282. Edited by David Herman. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2007.
- Herman, David, ed. *The Cambridge Companion to Narrative*. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2007.
- IMDb*. "Big Hero 6." Accessed February 28, 2015. <http://www.imdb.com/title/tt2245084/>.
- _____. "The Boxtrolls." Accessed February 28, 2015. <http://www.imdb.com/title/tt0787474/>.
- Kafka, Franz. "Letter to his Father." *John Guy Pollick*. Posted May 12, 2014. Accessed December 10, 2014. <http://johnguypollick.com/tag/grotesque/>.
- _____. *The Metamorphosis*, 3-55. Translated and edited by Stanley Corngold. New York, NY: Bantam Classics, 2004. Originally published in 1915.
- Kalinak, Kathryn. *Film Music: A Very Short Introduction*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2010.

- Katz-Freiman, Tami. "Exaggeration is Twice as Real." In *Wild Exaggeration: The Grotesque Body in Contemporary Art*, 106-102. Edited by Tami Katz-Freiman. Haifa, Israel: Haifa Museum of Art, 2009. Published in conjunction with exhibition of the same name, shown at Haifa Museum of Art, Haifa, Israel.
- _____. "Wild Exaggeration: The Artists: Allison Schulnik," in *Wild Exaggeration: The Grotesque Body in Contemporary Art*, 84. Edited by Tami Katz-Freiman. Haifa, Israel: Haifa Museum of Art, 2009. Published in conjunction with the exhibition of the same name, shown at the Haifa Museum of Art in Haifa, Israel.
- Kayser, Wolfgang. "An Attempt to Define the Nature of the Grotesque." In *The Grotesque in Art and Literature*, 179-189. Translated by Ulrich Weisstein. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1963. Originally published in 1957.
- Klein, Norman M. "Animation as Baroque: Fleischer Morphs Harlem: Tangos to Crocodiles." In *The Sharpest point: Animation at the End of Cinema*, 27-46. Edited by Chris Gehman and Steve Reinke. Toronto, ON: YYZ Books, Ottawa International Film Festival, Images Festival, 2005.
- Klepac, Walter. "Remarks on a Symposium: High Stakes: A Global Crisis in Art?" *CCCA Canadian Art Database*. Accessed July 23, 2013. <http://ccca.concordia.ca/c/writing/k/klepac/klep009t.html>.
- Kroeber, Karl. *Make Believe in Film and Fiction: Visual vs. Verbal Storytelling*. New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2006.
- _____. *Retelling/Rereading: The Fate of Storytelling in Modern Times*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1992.
- Levinson, Jerrold. "Film Music and Narrative Agency." In *Post-Theory: Reconstructing Film Studies*, 254-288. Edited by David Bordwell and Noël Carroll. Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 1996. *Scholars Portal Books*. Accessed January 22, 2014. doi: 10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199206179.003.0010.
- Lindvall, Terry and Matthew Melton. "Towards a Postmodern Animated Discourse: Bakhtin, Intertextuality and the Cartoon Carnival." In *Animation—Art and Industry*, 63-77. Edited by Maureen Furniss. Bloomington, IN: John Libby Publications, Indiana University Press, 2009. Originally published in 1994.
- Marvar, Alexandra. "Mound: Moving Stop-Motion from Allison Schulnik," *HUFFPOST ARTS*. Posted November 11, 2011. Accessed July 25, 2013. http://huffingtonpost.com/alexandra-marvar/mound-moving-stopmotion-f_b_1085324.html.
- McLaren, Norman. "Animated Films." In *Experimental Animation: An Illustrated Anthology*, 122-123. Edited by Robert Russett and Cecile Starr. New York, NY: Van Nostrand Reinhold, 1978.
- Modern Edition Profile*. "Allison Schulnik," *Spotlight: Contemporary Artists We're Loving*. Accessed July 23, 2013. <http://www.moderneditions.com/spotlight-art/contemporary-artists-01.html>.
- Moritz, William. "Norman McLaren and Jules Engel: Post-modernists" In *A Reader in Animation*, 104-111. Edited by Jayne Pillings. Bloomington, IN: John Libby Publishing, University of Indiana Press, 1997.
- Pomerantz, Dorothy. "'The Boxtrolls' And Why It's Crazy To Do Stop-Motion Animation." *Forbes*. Posted September 26, 2014. Accessed February 28, 2015. <http://forbes.com/sites/dorothy-pomerantz/2014/09/26/the-boxtrolls-and-why-its-crazy-to-do-stop-motion-animation/>.

- Princeton University, "Stop-Motion." Accessed January 7, 2014.
http://www.princeton.edu/~achaney/tmve/wiki100k/docs/Stop_motion.html.
- Rabelais, François. *The Portable Rabelais*. Translated and edited by Samuel Putnam. New York, NY: The Viking Press, 1960. Originally published in 1929.
- Richter, Helmut. "The Metamorphosis." In *The Metamorphosis*, 186-188. Translated and edited by Stanley Corngold. New York, NY: Bantam Classics, 2004. Originally published 1962.
- Rohrberger, Mary, ed. *Story to Anti-Story* (Boston, MA: Houghton Mifflin, 1979),
- Richards, Michael. "The Ultimate Joke." In *Clown Paintings*, 87. Edited by Diane Keaton. New York, NY: lookout books/powerHouse Books, 2002.
- Russett, Robert and Cecile Starr. "Eliot Noyes, Jr." In *Experimental Animation: An Illustrated Anthology*, 20-22. Edited by Robert Russett and Cecile Starr. Toronto, ON: Van Nostrand Reinhold, 1976.
- _____. "Preface." In *Experimental Animation: An Illustrated Anthology*, 7-78. Edited by Robert Russett and Cecile Starr. New York, NY: Van Nostrand Reinhold, 1978.
- _____. "Introduction." In *Experimental Animation: An Illustrated Anthology*, 9. Edited by Robert Russett and Cecile Starr. New York, NY: Van Nostrand Reinhold, 1978.
- Schulnik, Allison. "Allison Schulnik." In *Baker's Dozen*, 27. Edited by Max Presneill. Torrance, CA: Cultural services Division, 2009. Published in conjunction with exhibition of the same name, shown at the Torrance Art Museum in Torrance, CA.
- _____. "Allison Schulnik," in *Wild Exaggeration: The Grotesque Body in Contemporary Art*, 84. Haifa, Israel: Haifa Museum of Art, 2009. Published in conjunction with exhibition of the same name, shown at Haifa Museum of Art, Haifa, Israel.
- _____. "Allison Schulnik Artist Talk at the Vermont Studio Center, January 23, 2014." *The Vermont Studio Center*, Posted February 12, 2014. Accessed December 30, 2014. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=eDncuLL2Bo4>.
- _____. "Allison Schulnik Statements." Mark Moore Gallery publication. Accessed July 30, 2013. http://prod-images.exhibit-e.com/www_markmooregallery_com/14_Schulnik_opt.pdf.
- _____. "Eager." Accessed November 27, 2013. *Nieves*.
<http://nieves.ch/catalogue/allisonabout.html>.
- _____. *Hobo Clown*. Clay stop-motion, puppet and clay painting free form, *Grizzly Bear Granny Diner* sound track, 2008. 5:10 min. Accessed July 23, 2013.
<http://www.allisonschulnik.com>.
- _____. "Hobo Clown and Forest," *Guernica: A magazine of art and politics*. Posted January 12, 2010. Accessed July 25, 2013.
http://guernicamag.com/art/clay_mation_videos/.
- _____. Mark Moore Gallery, Mike Weiss Gallery. *Schulnik*. Los Angeles, CA, Mark Moore Gallery; New York, NY: Mike Weiss Gallery, 2008. Mark Moore Gallery. Accessed July 25, 2013. <http://www.markmooregallery.com/artists/allison-schulnik/>.
- Sneed, Jim and Judy Sneed. "All About Toys: Schoenhut's Humpty-Dumpty Circus and the Great American Circus," *Old Wooden Toys*. Accessed August 26, 2013.
http://www.oldwoodtoys.com/american_circus_toys.htm.

- Starr, Cecile. "Fine Art Animation." In *Animation—Art and Industry*, 9-11. Edited by Maureen Furniss. Bloomington, IN: John Libby Publications, Indiana University Press, 2009.
- Storyboard. "The Miniature Worlds of Walt." *The Walt Disney Family Museum*. Posted March 30, 2011. Accessed February 14, 2015.
<http://www.waltdisney.org/storyboard/miniature-worlds-walt>.
- Shabot, Sara Cohen. "Notes on the Grotesque Body." In *Wild Exaggeration: The Grotesque Body in Contemporary Art*, 101-96. Edited by Tami Katz-Freiman. Haifa, Israel: Haifa Museum of Art, 2009. Published in conjunction with the exhibition of the same name, shown at the Haifa Museum of Art in Haifa, Israel.
- _____. "The Grotesque Body: Fleshing Out the Subject." In *The Shock of the Other: Situating Alterities*, 57-68. Edited by Silke Horstkotte and Esther Peeren. New York, NY: Rodopi, 2007.
- Thomson, Philip. *The Grotesque*. Edited by John D. Jump. London, UK: Methuen and Company, 1972.
- VeltKamp, Joey. "Say hello to Allison Schulnik," BEST OF: A Northwest-centric art blog. Posted June 13, 2011. Accessed August 27, 2013.
<http://joeyveltkep.blogspot.com/2011/06/say-hello-to-allison-schulnik.html>.
- Verfhond. *Verfhond's list of NEW MASTERS- 2013, 500*. Posted December 31, 2012.
<http://www.pinterest.com/pin/477522366710533173/>. Found at *Rembrandt's Dog List*.
 Posted January 18, 2011. Accessed July 26, 2013.
<http://a1000livingpainters.wordpress.com/2014/01/01/allison-schulnik/2-%C2%A0allison%C2%A0schulnik/>.
- Visual Creatures. "Allison Schulnik Studio Visit." *Beautiful/Decay Magazine, Visual Creatures*. Accessed July 30, 2013. <http://vimeo.com/45596562>.
- Kandinsky, Wassily. *Concerning the Spiritual in Art*. Translated by M.T.H. Sadler. Don Mills, ON: Dover Publications, 1977. Originally published in 1914.
- Wells, Paul. *Understanding Animation*. New York, NY: Routledge, 1998.
- Wells, Paul and Johnny Hardstaff. "Artist Animation?" In *Re-Imagining Animation: The Changing Face of the Moving Image*, 84-85. Edited by Paul Wells and Johnny Hardstaff. New York, NY: AVA Publishing, 2008.
- Whitehot Magazine*. "Keeping it Dirty: A Conversation with Allison Schulnik." *Whitehot Magazine*. Posted June 2012. Accessed July 25, 2013.
<http://whitehotmagazine.com/articles/dirty-conversation-with-allison-schulnik/2576>.
- Ziamba, Christine N. "Artist and Alumna Allison Schulnik Talks Hobo Clowns and Grizzly Bear," *24700: News from California Institute of the Arts*. Posted April 21, 2010. Accessed July 25, 2013. <http://blog.calarts.edu/2010/04/21/allison-schulnik-interview/>.

Reference Materials

- Barasch, Frances K. *The Grotesque: A Study in Meanings*. Paris, FR: Mouton, 1971.
- Best, Stephan and Sharon Marcus. "The Turn Away from Marxism, or The Way We Read Now," *diacritics, Special Edition, Representations* 40, no. 3 (Fall 2012): 26-55. doi:10.1353/dia.2012.0009.
- Buchan, Suzanne. "A Cinema of Apprehension: A Third Entelechy of the Vitalist Machine," in *Pervasive Animation*, 143-171. Edited by Suzanne Buchan. New York, NY: AFI, Routledge, 2013.
- _____. *The Quay Brothers: Into a Metaphysical Playroom*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2010.
- Carroll, Noël. *Mystifying Movies*. New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 1988.
- Cholodenko, Alan. *The Illusion of Life: Essays on Animation*. Sydney, AU: Power Publications, Australian Film Commission, 1991.
- Connelly, Frances S. "Introduction: Entering the *Spielraum*." In *The Grotesque in Western Art and Culture: The Image at Play*, 1-23. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2012.
- Callenbach, Ernest. "The Craft of Norman McLaren: Notes on a lecture given at the 1961 Vancouver Film Festival," *Film Quarterly* 16, no. 2 (Winter 1962-63): 17-19.
- Chambers, Alan F. *What is this thing called Science?*, 3rd ed. Indianapolis, IN: Hackett Publishing Company, 1999. Originally published in 1976.
- Eagleton, Terry. *Literary Theory: An Introduction*, 2nd ed. Minneapolis, Minnesota: University of Minnesota, 1996.
- Edwards, Justin D. and Rune Graulund. *Grotesque*. New York, NY: Routledge, 2013.
- Emerling, Jae. *Theory for Art History: Adapted from Theory for Religious Studies*, by William E. Deal and Timothy K. Beal (New York, NY: Routledge, 2005). Accessed April 15, 2015. <http://amazon.ca/Theory-Art-History-Adapted-Religious/dp/0415973643>.
- Feyerabend, Paul. *Against Method*, 4th ed. New York, NY: Verso, 2010. Originally published in 1975.
- Fonorow, Amanda. *Hobohemia: Discovering the American Hero Subculture: An Introduction and Annotated Bibliography*. University of North Carolina, Greensboro. Accessed January 7, 2014. <http://afonorow.files.wordpress.com/2012/04/lis-620-annotated-bibliography.pdf>
- Galerie Division*. http://www.galeriedivision.com/art_allison_schulnik.html. Accessed July 28, 2013.
- Grafton, Donald. *Emile Cohl, Caricature, and Film*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1990.
- Hatt, Michael and Charlotte Klonk. *Art History: A Critical Introduction to its Methods*. New York, NY: Manchester University Press, 2006.
- Hayward, Susan. "Diegesis/Diegetic/Non-Diegetic/Extra and Intra-Diegetic." In *Cinema Studies: The Key Concepts*, 101-102. 3rd ed. New York, NY: Routledge, 2006.
- Jameson, Fredric. *Postmodernism, or, The Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1991.
- Kristeva, Julia. *Semiotike*. Paris, Fr: Editions du Seuil, 1969.
- Lanham, Richard A. *A Handlist of Rhetorical Terms*, 2nd ed. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2008. Originally published 1991.

- Mark Moore Gallery. Accessed July 25, 2013.
<http://www.markmooregallery.com/artists/allison-schulnik/>.
- Mason, David V. Accessed March 16, 2014.
<http://yavanika.org/classes/reader/sources/kilby-aesthetics.pdf>.
- McWilliams, Donald, ed. *Norman McLaren on the Creative Process*. Montreal, QC: National Film Board of Canada, 1991.
- McCormick, Ian. "A Grotesque Bibliography." *A Monster Observatory*. Posted June 19, 2013. Accessed October 02, 2013.
<http://grotesque-observatory.blogspot.ca/2011/07/grotesque-bibliographyhtml>.
- _____. "History of Grotesque," *A Monster Observatory: Encyclopedia of the Monstrous and Grotesque*. Posted June 20, 2013. Accessed April 02, 2015.
<http://grotesque-observatory.blogspot.ca/search/label/grotesque>.
- Mitscherling, Jeff. *Roman Ingarden's Ontology and Aesthetics*. Ottawa, ON: University of Ottawa Press, 1997.
- Painter's Table: Contemporary Art Magazine*. Accessed July 26, 2013. <http://painter-table.com/link/best/allison-schulnik-interview>.
- Priebe, Ken A. "Appeal and History of Stop-Motion Animation." In *The Art of Stop-Motion Animation*, 3-34. Boston, MA: Thomson Course Technology PTR, 2007.
- Pilling, Jayne. *Women and animation: a compendium*. London, UK: British Film Institute, Exhibition and Distribution Division, 1992.
- Preziosi, Donald, ed. *The Art of Art History*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2009. Originally published 1998.
- Rosenthal, Emerson. "Allison Schulnik Pushes Claymation to its Psychedelic Limit." *the creators project*. Posted November 22, 2011. Accessed July 25, 2013.
<http://thecreatorsproject.com>. Sourced from Mark Moore Gallery.
- Sifianos, George. "The Definition of Animation: A Letter from Norman McLaren." *Animation Journal* 3, no. 2 (Spring 1995): 62-66.
- Slide, Anthony. *The Silent Feminists: America's First Women Directors*. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press, 1996.
- Solomon, Charles, ed. *The Art of the Animated Image: An Anthology*. Los Angeles, CA: AFI, 1987.
- Stam, Robert. *Film Theory: An Introduction*, Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2000.
- Stevick, Philip, ed. *Anti-Story: An Anthology of Experimental Fiction*. New York, NY: The Free Press, 1971.
- Summers, Robert. *Rhizome*. Accessed April 17, 2015.
<http://www.rhizome.org/profiles/robertsummers1/>.
- Švankmajer, Jan. *Touching and Imagining: An Introduction to Tactile Art*, Edited by Cathryn Vasseleu. Translated by Stanley Dalby. New York, NY: I.B. Tauris, 2014.
- Tricot, Xavier. "James Ensor, Painter of the Macabre and Comic Grotesque." In *The Grotesque Factor*, 123-108. Edited by José Lebrero Stals. Malaga, SP: Museo Picasso Málaga, 2012. Published in conjunction with exhibition of the same name, shown at the Museo Picasso Málaga in Malaga, SP.
- Turvey, Malcom. "Seeing Theory: On Perception and Emotional Response in Current Film Theory." In *Film Theory and Philosophy*, 431-457. Edited by Allen Richard and Murray Smith. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 1997.
- Vogel, Amos. *Film as Subversive Art*. New York, NY: Random House, 1974.
- ZieherSmith Inc. Accessed September 4, 2013. <http://www.zieherSmith.com/>.

Appendix A.

Mise-en-scène

The established camera position is frontal and static at eye level with occasional aerial perspective. The use of an asterisk [] denotes significant detail descriptions.*

1) 00:00-00:02 The first sequence of Allison Schulnik's *Hobo Clown* opens with a screen shot of an stained wood grained panel revealing a central knot with luminous radiating grain. A highlighted focused on the lower right side of the frame. The audio of a vinyl record, slowly crackling as it passes round the groove.

**Visual: still of backdrop detail*

**Audi: mood of setting is dark and sound of vinyl record spinning reflects the emptiness of the screen*

2) 00:03-00:15 Cuts to a medium close-up of a Hobo Clown against the wood backdrop, eye level frontal framing with a shadow filling in the right side; chest up, (just an upper edge exposed) wearing a variety of flower decorated black hat with yellow band, blue and white striped knitted scarf, red boutonner rose and black coat. The movement is only slightly hesitant with a pixillated feel to the clay movement of eyelids, brow and cheek ridges surrounding black pool eye sockets. The Hobo Clown figure turns its head to a three quarter profile looking left (relative to facing the screen) with small proportioned beaded (necklace bead, see slight rotation at 1:22.8-1:23 min.) white eyes and black dotted pupils; a gentle sway of the white haired head, bending to look down and back, with minimal red make-up on the cheeks and body rocking, white rimmed mouth agar, expressing limited movement of blinking, pupil redirection and eye brow manipulations. The volume of the shoulders to head shot centrally frames a starring face with a small red button (bulbous, roseasa) nose with flower hat extending beyond the upper edge of the frame. Considerable demonstrated technical ability in the use of Coloured modeling clay is seen in the petals of the flowers and diversity of expressed texture in different materials while the rolled forms delineating sections of colour in the scarf show a spontaneity and immediacy of design and form.

**Visual: head and shoulders medium close-up (referred to as repeated composition throughout the film shot list) of a grotesque make-up clown complete with flowered hat, scarf and rose boutonner*

**Audio: continued white sound of needle at the start of a record*

3) 00:15-00:19 Title screen: Cut to black screen with white lettered title. Movie title, hand blocked white lettering all in capitals, HOB0 on one line directly above CLOWN on a black background ambient sound of vinyl record static continues.

**Visual: full screen, black with white lettering*

**Audio: continued crackling/scratch ambient white sound*

4) 00:19-00:42 Cut to emblematic long shot places the fully seated Hobo Clown within a three sided dark stained and exaggerated painted shadowed, forced perspective space resembling an ally. A slow methodical strum and pluck of a banjo accompanies the scene. The metonymy of this scene presents an encoded homeless person as the central character in a realistic setting seated upon a wooden crate in an almost three quarter view opposite

several logs arranged as a fire, oddly stark and minimal of contextual references, surface or identifying detail. Hobo Clown appears to be barefoot. The lighting highlights the Hobo Clown at mid-depth within the staging. A lonely strangeness of mood is immediately one of poverty. Miscellaneous, periphery wooden pieces arranged to the left and right against the boxed walls. The smaller back wall and blacked paint shadows accentuate the edging of the vertical corners to enhance the perception of an elongated and closed in alleyway. The lighting demonstrates an empty seclusion using the atmosphere of chiaroscuro lighting creating a central point of the character dramatically lit, creating dark shadowed borders. The form of the setting is a starkly minimal stage locating the one figure as central to the illusion of reality. A mode of loneliness and isolation or poverty is communicated as the emblematic shot stages conditions of a marginalized existence, however the incongruity of a fully dressed clown in character inhabiting an alley is symbolically illogical, but not an illusion. The point of view continues to observe the character moving to the left of the screen to put a piece of leaning wood onto the arranged pile, shifting to a three quarter positioning.

**Visual: distant full body shot of seated Hobo Clown dressed in black, emblematic shot of hunched figure characterizing both the particularities of minimal subsistence poverty and a characterization of marginalized cues*

**Audio: a slow and methodical keynote E above middle C (piano scale) presented by the pluck of a banjo varies both in tonality rise and fall and timbre (quality of sound) resembling the acoustic resonance of a starkly bare flat surfaced environment*

5) 00:42-01:04 Cut to frontal 'American Shot', knees up (just below knees) perspective against one wall and with the gentle movements, including movement of eye brows up and down. Looking down and back to gaze the viewer, side to side movement of the head and then casting a downward tilt of the head. Match cut with pile of wood.

**Visual: medium close-crop, cropped below the knees, isolation against a dark back drop stages an unseen fire presence by lighting flickering off the wall behind the character, particular detail of multiple textures seen in the hat*

**Audio: the twang and slide of the acoustic instruments resemble the Romantic hobo culture of folk roots creating a melody of depressed or suppressed atmosphere. Note: appropriated radio tuning/voice sound layer*

6) 01:04-01:08 Cut to a medium close-up portraiture from the beginning is repeated using a clay painting technique of colourful swirls from the white bead (yellow, red, black, green, blue, mix) expand outwards to edges of the large black eye sockets. The effect is one of an abstracted eye swirl of colour.

**Visual: head and Shoulders, chest up, repeated close-up eyes metamorphic, the surfacing of colours from beneath successive layers show a clay painting style*

**Audio: addition of scratch white sound of vinyl and a wonky signalling percussion tap on a percussion increases the complexity of sound with the complexity of motion*

7) 01:08-01:12 Cut to a full face close-up of the Hobo Clown head and swirling colour within the eye sockets that transition back to beaded eyes gazing out at viewer. Dramatic evolution of material technique demonstrates an experimental element as abstracted body.

**Visual: extreme close-up of face and metamorphic eyes, clay applications of lines of colour move in a circular fashion at the edges of the socket area to end with black revealed from beneath at the center spreading outwards to engulf the socket and return of*

white eyes (tiny black pupils)

**Audio: continued lumbering lower than keynote instrumental ¼ notes*

8) 01:12-01:24 Cut to medium close-up and return to black, white eye beads as a ‘normal’ eyes looking out at the viewer. Emphasis on central character and staring gaze expression. Movements generally are paced as slower than ‘natural’ imitation. The pixillated clay facial features and sound bites are reflected in small head movements and occasional shadow flicker, although, the features are isolated within a spectator via character flat screen perspective gaze by a lack of any dialogue. Almost inaudible voice sounds, briefly, of radio muffle at 1:18 min. As the abstracted eyes begin to increase in the complexity of movement the sound track also begins to layer banjo with synthesized reverberation.

**Visual: head and shoulders close-up (now pronounced black forms seen as enlarged eye brows of rotund shapes of line and bulbous end above eyes on either side of the head, nose becoming less anatomical), chest up, repeated composition, flicker effect of shadow across face indication of changing light source*

**Audio: cords of notes followed by multi-media and synthesized reverberations produce a drawn out effect of the rise and fall around the suggested plucked banjo E keynote above middle C, rhythm of back and forth melody between a pattern of clunky notes*

9) 01:24-01:34 Cut. Quick, central, extreme synecdoche close-up of a cropped framing of both hands as part of the body demonstrating age, condition and materiality of clay. Moving slowly as a realistically pantomimed rubbing of hands; clay hands multi-coloured in hues of dirty flesh tones looking aged but warm. Detail of anatomy more faithful to the coloured modeling clay, rotund fingers, and use of tooling to inscribe joint knuckle impression. Dark coat and pants appear painted (colour fluid in its mixed surface variation) with wooden box appearing well weathered with enhanced grain ridges, depicting a natural setting.

**Visual: extreme close-up of hands, mid-screen, movement resemble naturalistic, yet rhythmic movements*

**Audio: brief repeated sequence of reverberation and layered pattern of notes with rise in timbre of the banjo increase the intensity level creating a staging of dynamic anticipation*

10) 01:34-01:36 Cut to a direct on, close-up of a small fire composed of the logs and flickering triangular tin foil pieces imitating fire with a blended triangular yellow clay with a red center giving colour, cut to emblematic opening scene now a fire of triangular foil pieces and logs is burning. This contextualizes the hand rubbing in front of heat. Fire can be interpreted as the shot object and situates itself as the central contact of the Hobo Clown’s gaze. And another symbolic synecdoche image of the staging.

**Visual: close-up composition of log fire, mid-screen framing*

**Audio: reverberation carries through*

11) 01:36-01:41 Cut to repeat full figure of Hobo Clown on the wooden box now seated in front of a fire looking down with an arched back and then up again. This shot/counter shot or match cut designates the fire as the object of the Hobo Clown’s gaze and meditation as a follow of the eye line completing a series of match-ups between the character and the fire as the object of concentration.

**Visual: repeated emblematic scene of full body seated in a hunched, dropped shoulder gesture appearing to be gazing into the fire*

**Audio: repeated loud pluck/strum of banjo and or acoustic instruments push the scene*

12) 01:41-01:43 Cut to foreground medium shot of Hobo Clown centrally positioned at waist to top of hat below center of the frame (bottom edged half body shot). Framed from directly in front of the figure that has a slight three quarter turn, lighting consistent, looking off to the left towards the floor lasting several seconds of frontal eye contact or outward gaze at viewer. Odd cue shot distancing viewer from Hobo Clown and placing viewer as an observer.

**Visual: distanced medium shot, exaggerated isolation, as the figure is surrounded with staging environment of dark stain painted backdrop*

**Audio: instrumentation is combined with synthesized sound carrying a drama of eerie, anti-melodious tone*

13) 01:43-02:16 Cut to medium close-up same as opening. Eyes begin a dramatically altered eye sockets swirling with clay painted colours beginning after a closing over of the black eye sockets, pushing outwards in swirling, colourful masses of clay that collapse topologically inward to start layer upon layer of new colour expanding in metamorphic transitions of concentric circles while also drooping in gravity pulled extensions of eye sockets and mouth. Cue break with realism as abstracted interpretive form. The dynamics of the sound track synced with rhythm of movements. The colour appears to originate from an interiority surfacing as pulses that correspond to the slow musical rhythm. The cause of transformation unknown.

**Visual: head and shoulders, metaphoric eyes, 4th repeated composition, significant difference between this play of the grotesque transformation of the eyes occurs as the deeper socket produces broader surfaces of circular colour appear more blended and tend to move back to the center closing over in painted play to then begin again, enlarged*

**Audio: the metamorphosis begins with a white sound resembling a radio frequency that drops below keynote with a series of bass notes to rise with reverberation after a banjo strum, pattern repeated*

14) 02:16-02:28 Cut to extreme close-up of face and swirling colours within enlarging eye socket disproportionate to face. The colour appears to originate from an interiority surfacing as pulses that correspond to the musical rhythm. The shot is now close cropped from mouth to forehead with a volume consuming the screen with enlarged and exaggerated swirls of painted colour moving out from the eyes to eventually transition swirled colour into a unified space or fade in of white modeled clay. The finger prints of the artist are noticeable and the scale of the strokes shifting the modeling clay correspond to the movements of clay mass, here suggesting further abstracted experimentation as self-referenced presence of the artist along with the redefined body of the Hobo Clown.

**Visual: metamorphic eyes seen with enlarged surfaces of textured and blended, raised surfaces of clay applied as both semi-circular lines around the edge and then circular central additive colour that emerge and fall into the center as black and then a small white center grows to engulf the entire frame to white clay*

**Audio: the pace of extended lingering notes accompany the rhythm of sequences of colour during the eye metamorphosis perceived as articulating a subconscious association with the fingering of the acoustic instrument with the clay manipulation*

15) 02:28-02:32 Transition to reversing white clay moves inward to expose black clay edges, brief colourful dynamic of multi-coloured clay collapse inwards to multiple pushed fingering of clay smear directed in rays to the center. Bright total white fade in.

**Visual: transition to flat surface from transformed clay painting circle of rays, resembling a single surface seen in both eye metamorphoses and is engrossingly sculptural in its 3-Dimensional presence, cue transition*

**Audio: sound cue, break in convention of pacing separating drawn out notes with synthesized white sound not matching or parallel with movement staging counter-point*

16) 02:32-02:33 Cut to fade in total bright field of colour, white screen. Potentially, moment of enlightened transcendence from meditating on the fire as inner thoughts manifest as colour and intensity. Counter-point is completed from the dark staging. Cue new staging.

**Visual: white screen fade in*

**Audio: brief duration with enough time to include a banjo pluck*

17/18) 02:33-02:36 The second sequence begins from the white fade in and reverberating sound turned to an expanded note beats from 2:35 to 2:55 extends over six cuts. The opening scene from white is a field of perspective looking down as an aerial perspective at a white ground covered with colourful artificial flowers including daisies, roses, poppies and yellow and blue flowers. Two ground cover compositions lasting a second each cuts to an almost complete three quarter figure, frontal scene of a starkly white with horizontally applied white tinted colours, layered in an order of gradated green, yellow and red streaks from vertical top to bottom completed with a white out of any reference to a distinct horizon line where the roll of the painted backdrop meets the horizontal surface the Hobo Clown is standing (feet and legs to mid-calf extend below bottom edge of frame).

**Visual: extreme close-up crop surface of naturalistic artificial flowers against a white ground, some flower notables include yellow and pink with a red rose top left corner*

**Audio: banjo strum and synthesized pause*

02:36-02:37

**Visual: second ground shot of flowers, extreme close-up crop, naturalistic artificial flowers against a white ground, notable pink rose in the center of the screen frame*

**Audio: repetition of a piano note pause blends to a synthesized stretched reverberation*

19) 02:37-02:43 Cut to ‘American Shot’ Hobo Clown character is dressed in white coat and pants with a pink patch on the right knee. A markedly reduced flatted white hat with only several red roses; red rose buttoner has changed to a salmon pink rose with the scarf looking consistent with the previous scene is now blue strips and slightly blued white strips distinguishes it from the white coat and pants.

**Visual: foreground flower rack shot to ‘American Shot’ Hobo Clown in background*

**Audio: rhythmic E keynote two above middle C is tapped out in a 1/4 beat producing an elongated gaze between character looking out and to the flowers. “Feels” more uplifting.*

20) 02:43-02:46 Cut to full body shot mid-staging horizon at the one third point with the Hobo Clown standing with its eyes in the middle of the screen (cross lines from corner to corner).

**Visual: distant full body surrounded by the match-up of flowers as the objects of gaze*

**Audio: continuation of the methodical rhythm*

21) 02:46-02:49 Cut to medium shot, waist up with slight turn to right looking at distance. Next shot is a pull back situating a deeper perspective on the Hobo Clown contextualized in a garden, full figure, standing in bare feet. Casting a shadow to the left as it is darkened across the front of the slightly turned body to the left, although the lighting mostly uniformly day. The head turns to the right in a half motion to transition to a close-up, half figure completing the motion and a paused of five beats where the garment surface displays clay impression changes. Hair and eye movements of the Hobo Clown are the only other noticeable movements.

**Visual: medium shot (90% top of hat to upper edge of frame)*

**Audio: continued rhythm*

22) 02:49-02:52 A transition to an extreme close-up of flowers with poppy swaying to and fro.

**Visual: extreme close-up of poppy*

**Audio: continued rhythm*

23) 2:52-02:53 Cut to a medium close-up shoulders head shot potentially a shot/counter shot between the object of point of view, poppy, and the forward facing Hobo Clown looking back at the flower. As a counter shot or match cut to the flower this is an internal continuity or as an engagement with the viewer the Hobo Clown is using gaze to assert 'self'. Clearly now wearing a white hat and featuring white facial forms while the eye sockets have become more colourful painted clay blend and the eyes are incrementally larger resembling rolled clay and well defined mouth 'make-up' of a white rotund roll of clay modeled with sad downward outer (rounded) corners. Pixillated movements of the hair and surfaces imitate slight garment movement and potential illusion of air movement.

**Visual: head and shoulders medium close-up, outward gaze, eye sockets now a clay painted mix of colour, eyes formally perceived as with beads are now clay slightly larger, clay circles with the center holes dimensionally seen with shadowed centers (Note: second appearance of rotund lines of clay ending with bulbous knob, two white unknown forms above each eye on either side of the head, above the eye socket/brows)(See, opposite at cut number 8), nose and its bridge is almost non-descript as it has widened and flattened, one artificial flower on left side of smaller white hat and two red clay flowers*

**Audio: continued rhythm volume of synthesized or under layer of with radio static growing in loudness*

24) 02:53-02:57 Cut to rack focus, fore grounded extreme close-up of a flower composition with out of focus Hobo Clown half figured medium shot deep in the background mid-frame to almost the top edge. The shot moves to focus on the background Hobo Clown. The artificial flowers and stare environment suggest another worldly atmosphere sympathetic with the melodic sounds mimicking the artificial sound of radio or broadcasted white sound fade out. The use of artificial flowers mimics the reality of a garden but references an experimental mixed mode of animation challenging the notion of an orthodox sense of real unity.

**Visual: rack shot, flower land feature with medium shot of Hobo Clown, red rose fore grounded in the center and bottom edge*

**Audio: quirky dial sounds of broken frequency and burst of layered rhythm now includes instruments of acoustic and percussion increasing tonal and tempo of back and forth*

pace using ¼ notes of different timbre, one ¼ note is a wooden percussion tap marking the sequence

25) 02:57-03:01 Cut to head close-up. The sound track begins a layered mix of rhythmic notes and the Hobo Clown shot is a repeat of earlier close-up with hat exceeding upper frame boarder and shoulders out of the frame and white background.

**Visual: close-up of Hobo Clown face, gaze potentially straight ahead or down and to the right, movement of facial surface seen as facial gesture and pixillated hair movement describe a realistic environment*

**Audio: continued melody developing a prolonged anticipation cue*

26) 03:01-03:12 Cut reveals fore grounded flowers and an entrance from the Hobo Clown from the right moving across the screen in focus across the middle ground partially covered from the waist down by the foreground flowers. The music has picked up its pace accordingly to the walk of the character. The Hobo Clown stops at the center of the garden landscape to stand partially concealed by the rise in landscape covered in flowers to less than half figured. The white garmented Hobo Clown picks what is perceived to be a pink rose flower.

**Visual: Hobo Clown moves in a cumbersome stride walking to the beat in a parallel unity from behind flowers and across feature, stops when centered, picks rose (potential match cut however, looking right is countered with walking to left)*

**Audio: tonality higher than keynote with singularly plucked, climbing tone, acoustic (bass or guitar) continuing to be marked by the wooden tap ¼ note*

27) 03:12-03:14 Cut bringing the flower up to its face to smell the flower and as the arm is lowered the flower the cut is a half figure close-up of the Hobo Clown holding a pink, with purple center, rose that immediately begins to change its composition into an interiorly outward flowing form that appears to melt with metamorphosis. Rose now resembling ice cream.

**Visual: medium shot (90%), repeated*

**Audio: continued melody, low tonality with striking wooden tap rise*

28) 03:14-3:16 Cut to a shot of metamorphosis where the chest, arm and flowing tinted pink, purple yellow and orange streaks of smeared forms resembling drips.

**Visual: synecdoche shot of left arm and rose, rose transforming*

**Audio: lingering reverberation of melody, rising initial note and final note of 1/4 wooden tap with 2 softer drum sweeps (brush) in between*

29) 03:16-03:18 Cut to extreme close-up of morphing, stream of streaked colour enveloping the hand and rose. The abstracted sequence is demonstrative of a merging of human and the botanical redefining the body as an experimental and non-continuity example of the stories as interpretive form.

**Visual: extreme close-up of melting rose*

**Audio: consistent timbres and paced rhythm*

30) 03:18-03:24 Extreme close-up increases its outward morphology as a fade in of clay painted circle of finger smears as radial markings of colour (colourful rays or bursts of pink, brown and then yellow) forming a circle. White clay smearing field of colour becomes an entire screen of predominately white clay with hint of surface inconsistency

by slight shadows.

**Visual: extreme close-up of clay painting to full screen white fade in*

**Audio: continued rhythm and pace as colour variations out pace musical dynamics*

31) 03:24-03:26 Cut to third sequence is a flat screen surface of moving painted clay emanating from a center an emergence of an extreme face filling the entirety of the frame.

**Visual: white screen with smeared yellow streaks in corners*

**Audio: drawn out reverberations slower than the counter-point of the ongoing metamorphosis*

32) 03:26-03:36 Forms from the subsurface of the clay. As the swirling, undulating colours abstract to two sockets of layered rings of blended changing colour the mouth drops out of the bottom frame and the nose is not a prominent feature. As this transformation becomes more exaggerated a layer of voice accompanies the sound track with nearly inaudible words (speculated as resembling “Go away now”).

**Visual: transforming face from flat surface*

**Audio: cumbering drum beat with high, low, low, high melody continues to prod the metamorphic images from image to image sequence, murmuring voice appears to have replaced some instrumentation*

33) 03:36-03:36 The eyes swirl to black and the entire frame becomes a blacked field of colour.

**Visual: black clay flat surface transition*

**Audio: continued melody and low tone reflected in the nearly inaudible voice and (speculated) lyrics repeated, first replacement of wooden tap with metallic note*

34) 03:36-03:39 Cut to black fade out opens on a head form. The head is mostly white exaggerated black eye sockets, blackened mouth and nose resembling a skull although the mouth has two small front teeth just visible. Top of the head extends beyond upper boarder of frame (top of head not visible). The head begins a rotation to the right and upon one rotation that shows a minimally formed head without texture of hair or distinguishing features.

**Visual: first minimal head abstracted features rotate to right*

**Audio: the voice-over lyric continues in to sequence and the beat of music voice (speculated) stops*

35) 03:39-03:52 Cut now introduces a second more developed head with pin point eye whites and black pupils (beads), slight projecting hair, evolving red nose and red lipped mouth. Visible full head now topped with a squared white hat with several flowers including a pink rose. The head rotates once more to the right, stops, demonstrates more manipulations of the features, particularly the eyes again become abstracted after a blink of clay eyelids opening with clay eyes loosing the dimension of whites and pupils after morphing changes then the head begins to rotate to the left once and then moves forward.

**Visual: second head with more detail, rotates right then left*

**Audio: whether a bass or drum beat of ¼ notes patterning a melodic ta, dum, dum, ta the rotation soft the heads now synched with the music, a wooden tap is replaced with a high metallic high note (triangle or synthesized), 4th note landing on a blinking head with multicoloured eye lids and yellow teeth 03:42, eyes change to clay and as the melody extends in a pause the white and black blend in clay painted drip*

36) 03:52-03:56 Cut to a full head and neck form that is abstracted again. A skull form with pronounced cheekbone structure and orifices of eye socket, nose and mouth is topped not with hair or hat and flower, but an exaggerated tapered cone all in white. For three seconds the head metamorphic-izes as it appears to bleed or melt as if affected by gravity, significantly, a small amount of red accompanied by yellow oozes from its eye socket.

**Visual: third head, abstracted with open orphisms, melting metamorphic*

**Audio: as the melody has slowed its pace and tone has dropped off to faint (speculated) lyrics repeated 03:55*

37) 03:56-03:56 The head fades out to a black surface of clay.

**Visual: black clay flat surface transition*

**Audio: melody of murmuring voice has created a tonality of deeply forlorn mood as the harmonized tone of melancholy*

38) 03:56-04:00 Cut to opposite repeat of a distorted face emerging from the depth of a white clay is imitated by a brief two eye shapes, nose and clown mouth (enlarged by make-up smile shape) appear and then the marbled coloured white beneath spreads to become the field of colour on the surface. A painted clay total abstraction moves in streaked blends to cut to a downward perspective of the white garden ground as a reversal of the metamorphosis.

**Visual: metamorphic pinched black face with white interiors to orifices roll outwards to reveal white subsurface transitioning to white/colour burst screen transition, abstract painted clay smear blended flat from center*

**Audio: continued melody*

39) 04:00-04:04 The fourth sequence cued by clay painted surface. Aerial shot of the coloured painted abstraction is a circle approximately five-ish feet in diameter in relation to the scale of the Hobo Clown's bare feet extended down from the top of the frame just below the waist forearms and hands visible; flowers on the ground. For five seconds the circular painted form occupies an aerial perspective where the circle, painterly, flows outwardly until it almost reaches the feet of the Hobo Clown. This is a marked display of an evolution of material technique.

**Visual: aerial shot of clay painted circle on the ground at Hobo Clown's feet resembling previous screen framed abstract*

**Audio: brief parallel between new scene and drawn lull in the melody create rise/fall combination of tone*

40) 04:04-04:08 Cut to repeat of medium shot of the Hobo Clown suggests the character is a counter shot or match cut to the circle as Hobo Clown looking at this phenomena at its feet.

**Visual: repeated medium shot (90% of frame filled)*

**Audio: strumming taking a high tone to the generally low centre of gravity throughout the metamorphoses sequences (cue new dynamics)*

41) 04:08-04:15 Cut to an almost flat screen topology of the expanding circle with only corner flowers become overlapped by the clay that spreads to completely fill the frame as voice becomes part of the sound. Rippling solid colour presents an unstable reality of ambiguous contraries. "Why don't you do any dishes,.. why?" proceeds over three shots.

*Visual: full screen flat moving clay painted circle, *lyrics begin at 4:09 min.*

*Audio: 4/4 voice cadence is broken with 2/4 extended beat on dishes

42) 04:15-04:16 Cut to the next shot appears to build on the flow of medium as a shoreline tide encroaching upon the flowers on the ground.

*Visual: *extreme close-up of diagonal rolling edge and flowers on the ground*

*Audio: *emphasizing elongated empty reply 2/4 beat, "why"*

43) 04:16-04:19 Cut to the Hobo Clown standing behind the circle of clay obscuring the feet of the Hobo Clown as it displays movements from fingered rays. The raised circle one third the diameter of the extended circle corresponds with the original painted clay circle that transitioned from the fade out of the third sequence. It appears to resemble a crater impact with ridge and outward spread with a duration of two seconds.

*Visual: *full body, white clothed Hobo Clown with 3x circle covering feet, rising middle third inner circle resembling crater*

*Audio: *carried over lyrics, guitar plucked cords (note) drop from centre of gravity (E keynote)*

44) 04:19-04:23 Cut to a four second repeat of close-up of the Hobo Clown looking once again as a counter shot or match cut to the phenomena at its feet includes the slight manipulation of the eye brows and surface impressions that register finger prints as tool marks.

*Visual: *close-up head repeat of counter shot (See, 23 Close-up description)*

*Audio: *four cords drop carried over through to rise of a reverberating synthesized lofting metallic bell like note (see previous cue for transition description at 33)*

45) 04:23-04:24 Cut to painted clay field of colour slight rolling towards the center upon itself from the top left.

*Visual: *rolling edge of left side of circle*

*Audio: *reverberation cord drawn out*

46) 04:27-04:27 Cut to same left side of painted clay field of colour. Greater diagonal rolling towards the center upon itself from the top left.

*Visual: *closer shot of rolled left edge smeared to the right, blending tapper*

*Audio: *reverberating note*

47) 04:27-04:31 Cut to right side of painted clay circle rolling upon itself to the center from the top right and as it rolls exposing a white rose beneath the clay. Arch of the rolled clay moves almost to the far left edge of the frame. Line of roll a diagonal from lower right to upper left. Rose set diagonally almost at center, rose head higher in frame while the second line of lyric is sung. "I always clean up the [...]"

*Visual: *close-up right edge rolls back to reveal rose*

*Audio: *"I always clean up the" using the words as 1/4 notes*

48) 04:31-04:32 Cut to close-up of a repeated directed stare by the Hobo Clown down upon the last shot as a counter.

*Visual: *close-up of head, 3rd repeat, subtle changes in facial, hair, eye gesture in synch with melody*

*Audio: *1/4 beat for voiced lyrics, "Ki[...]"*

49) 04:32-04:35 Cut to an extreme close-up shot of a spiralling column of clay that raises from the surface to collapse in an ‘splash’ of expanding white tinted red clay (variations of red/pink blend) centrally located in the frame with blended edges feathering towards the upper right corner of the frame.

**Visual: Rising swirl from circle collapses in a splat of expanding red clay, pace counter to melody melancholy*

**Audio: continued melody and voice, “[...]chen”*

50) 04:35-04:50 Cut to close-up repeated shot of Hobo Clown with full frontal gaze directed towards the viewer, speculatively. The immediately face-to-face with the third repeated frame of a close-up Hobo Clown locates the bulbous nose at approximately the center of the frame (white tinted red clay nose exhibits the same variations of red/pink blend, roseasa) shows the eyes with expand black pupils suggesting an awe or amazement at the witnessed phenomena. The eyes cycle through transformations in a metamorphosis that abstracts the eye sockets to proportions engulfing the entire frame. The reversal of the outwardly expanding, flared eyes, begin to retract and as the form contracts the nose is compressed slightly more as it elongates. Last vocal, “Fine.” Note: fingerprints visible
**Visual: cut to close-up of head, 4th repeat, eyes metamorphic to fill frame with a clay painted flat screen of predominately white with blended colours streaking outwards to eventually resemble wings engulfing the frame in its entirety*

**Audio: carry over of lyrics end with a 2/4 drawn out pace at “Fine” and synthesized drawing out of guitar notes to reverberated eerie resonance as lower center of gravity is synthesized to static white sound behind dropping 1/4 notes resembling “ta da” soft final.*

52) 04:50-04:57 Cut to medium shot repeat of white dressed Hobo Clown against muted streaked background. Distorted head resembles a rough block topped with the same hat and flowers. The white coat, blue striped scarf (difference between blue background and strips less pronounced although this may be because of an adjustment in lighting, distance of camera etc.) and lapel peach pink (salmon) rose, is now somewhat shaded by a surface discolouration on the right side, yet is blended as is the colours layered in the blocked head; more strata. Background of staging becomes brighter. The Hobo Clown is stationary but for looking to the left and right then back to center. The eye sockets grow green round eye shapes that shift into pointed ovals on a diagonal with pointed edge directed to the upper edge of ears (or where ears might be). Resemblance to a bird head or insect head with eyes having evolved less human and more animal creature.

**Visual: medium shot (90% of the screen filled), 4th repeat, head abstracted block shape with hat*

**Audio: reverberating synthesizes note slowly descending, lingering through*

53) 04:57-04:59 Cut to repeated medium shot locating the figure of the Hobo Clown with distorted block head and green eyes now more blended at the edges in the center of the bottom edge of the frame. The head of the Hobo Clown is seen as an abstracted block of distorted proportions. The coat appears dirty rather than shaded and the still figure appears looking left and slightly downward. This shot ends the film with this abstracted head, eyes and nose/mouth resembling a bird or bird head, or insect head. Similar shot seen with the dark staging where the distanced image is surrounded by environment and the spectator is positioned as gazing on the isolated figure (See, 12).

**Visual: distant Medium shot with head resembles bird head or insect head with bright green pointed oval large eye shapes*

**Audio: drifting fade of synthesized reverberation lingering after last notes now continued through the three last scenes and last scene final guitar notes*

54) 04:59-05:04 Cut to extreme close-up of the garden floor with flowers and rolled edge of clay painted edge superimposed black capital printing of credits and Schulnik's copyright ends in black 5:10 min.

**Visual: still of white ground with detail of rolled clay painted edge and flowers overlaid with hand printed capital lettered black marker credit*

**Audio: sound has ended*

55) 05:04-05:10 Fade out

**Visual: black screen*

**Audio: no sound*

**Total running time of downloaded version from Allison Schulnik's web page, with black screen 5:03 min. not including the black screen.*

**Total perceived edits 55, including introduction and end black screen shot.*

**Five sequences selection based on the existence of total white or near white fade outs as transitions between staging of subject and actions.*

**First significant collection of sequences: 00:00-02:33 (Shots 1-16) Duration of 153 seconds or 49% of animation*

**Second significant collection of sequences: 02:33-03:24 (Shots 17-30) Duration of 51 seconds or 16.5% of animation*

**Third significant collection of sequences: 03:24-04:00 (Shots 31-38) Duration of 36 seconds or 12% of animation*

**Fourth significant collection of sequences: 04:00-04:50 (Shots 39-51) Duration of 50 seconds or 16% of animation*

**Fifth significant collection of sequences: 04:50-5:10 (Shots 52-55) Duration of 20 seconds or 6.5% of animation*

**The number of frames per second varies on whether the production is a film or video. According to animator, Richard Taylor, film for cinema runs at 24 frames per second and video broadcasts longer at 25 frames per second which, when calculated over minutes can change the duration by numerous seconds effecting the synchronization of music scores. Schulnik describes the animation process as shot in one's and two's or approximately 18 frames per second.¹⁹⁶*

¹⁹⁶ Richard Taylor, *Animation Techniques*, 103. See, Grizzly Bear, "Granny Diner," 2007. compact disc, 4:49 min. See, Tom Christie, *Exclusive Interview*. In 2009, after *Hobo Clown* and a second production, Schulnik discussed using 24 frames a minute animating in one's and two's (referring to the number of frames 'shot' per incremental movement) suggesting a 4:30 film would be composed of 9,000 frames at 18 frames per second. The difference between 4:49 and 5:03 min. running time may have been compensated by an adjustment between the bar chart of the music and dope sheet of action perhaps through an extended introduction sound of a vinyl record starting to play where white sound or scratchy noise indicates a record player needle is moving through the groove.

Appendix B.

Annotated Discography

This discography discusses the works made by or featuring Allison Schulnik. The selection of these works has been based on a contribution to this paper and the historiography of Allison Schulnik's educational and independent animation production. The musical selections are integral to Schulnik's films.

- Barfth. "barfth's at heath's." Digital video, 0:53. Posted by 'garaco p. Fleshy' on 24May2012. <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BNslMzsoS0l>. Described as "Sings putred [sic] filth called Chunk." A well-lit stage records slow transitions between horizontal to vertical screen positions and features an outdoor performance of Rock-Noise, complete with stage fire pit of concrete foundation block. Allison Schulnik plays bass in the foreground... fireside.
- _____. "Sea Bitch." YDGH Productions, High Definition Digital Online music video, 3:44. Posted 3December2013. Posted by TDGN Productions with credits for Directing and Editing to Matt Hewitt and cinematography to Kinsey van Ost and Nate Bernot. A backyard performance intensely lit with coloured gels is juxtaposed with sequences of Medieval riverside beheading execution by an axe wielding knight. More ritual than persecution; the half skull filled with brains looks to real intension of a shamanic performance with the forces of sublime nature and Rock- Noise the center of power. <http://vimeo.com/33646265>. Also posted by YDGN Productions 14December2011 to <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=rknkZ9mhgMK>. Also posted by 'Turkey Buzzard' on 2March2013 no <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dxnLrpUcyOE>.
- _____. "Taxidermied Alive." YDGN Productions, High Definition Digital Online music video, 4:10. Posted 30October2011. This posting includes an opening title page of collaged anatomy pictures resembling online pornography. The Hercule-Savinien Cyranode Bergerac (1619-1655 dramatist and duellist) nose on band member Jonah Olson is an exaggerated phallic. Schulnik, Olson and fellow band member Alyssa Dressman bring to life the lyric, "no one can fuck my friend" with this futuristic encounter by prehistoric figures of a roasted chicken, via a heating duct birthing from eight feet above the ground; the climatic and bloody amputation of an arm penetrating the canal of birth drips of blood and grossness. Directed by Nate Bernot with Cinematography by Matt Hewitt. <http://vimeo.com/31342469>. An alternative posting by YDGN Productions followed 31October2011. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=sZUVQO1HD3E>. Also, Fred Abercrombie. *Ünnecessaty Ümlaut*. Posted 31October2011. <http://www.unnecessaryumlaut.com/?p=8726>.
- Corich, Nicholas. "Character Study: Allison Schulnik & Daniel Gordon." *Vimeo* Online High Definition Digital video, 8:27. Posted by Polivision 29August2012. <http://vimeo.com/48462434>. Accessed July 30, 2013. Produced out of Los Angeles, California in 2012, its billed as an inside look into the studios of artists building "upon abstract armatures to create particular characters." Schulnik is in Los Angeles (studio in Lincoln Heights) and Daniel Gordon in New York City. Gordon's practice involves the construction and photography of 2 and 3-dimensional found images collage. Schulnik's artistic practice is also explained with interview commentary and images of the studio, reference materials and examples of Schulnik's diverse creative output;

- painting, sculpture, works on paper, and film. A subsequent posting by VIP Art 17September2012 at <http://vimeo.com/49613306>.
- Grizzly Bear. "Granny Diner." Written and performed by Christopher Robert Bear, Daniel Raphael Rossen, Christopher M. Taylor, and Edward Doste. Recorded November 7, 2007, on *Friend*, Warp Records, LC 02070, 2007, compact disc.
- _____. "Ready, Able." Written and performed by Grizzly Bear with string quartet arrangement by Nico Muhly and performed by the Acme String Quartet. Recorded May 26, 2009 on *Veckatimest*, Warp Records WAROCD182., compact disc.
- Olson, Aaron M. "Eager." Released January 10, 2014, on *Eager*, Digital Album. <http://aaronmolson.bandcamp.com/album/eager>.
- Roth, Eli. *The Rotten Fruit*. Stop-motion animation.12:00. Studio, City, CA: Billy Kuhloff Productions, 2003. Television series. A dark comedy about fruit gone bad. Billed as the most popular band in the world this vial collection of foul mouthed fruit exhibit sociopathic and violent behaviour as they drink, shag, rock and murder their way to fame. Allison Schulnik is credited as an animator. The title of the episode is unknown.
- Schulnik, Allison. *Allison Schulnik*. Facebook.com/pages/Allison-schulnik/27084111591. _____ . *Allison Schulnik*. Internet website, <http://www.allisonschulnik.com>. Accessed July 23, 2014
- _____. *Eager*. 2014. 8:30. NTSC colour DVD. Clay stop-motion animation, puppet, clay painting with mixed media. Aaron M. Olson sound track, Allison Schulnik wrote and directed the film in 2014 with cinematography by Helder K. Sun. The song, *Eager*, 8:29, was composed for Schulnik by Aaron M. Olson. An abstract tale of movement in metamorphoses formed with clay puppet and clay stop-motion, clay painting animation. The cycle of life emerges from the birth, growth and death metaphors presented in the film settings of a forest, dance stage, mixed media montage of flower stills and live performance still montage to present a grotesque Neo-Romantic vision of a spiritual journey. This 'fantasia' filled transforming union between human and non-human forms takes on a monoecious autogamy of regeneration. There is no death in this cycle, only completeness. Awarded *Best Abstract Animation* at the 2014 Ottawa International Film Festival.
- _____. "Eager." *Vimeo* Online High Definition digital Online video, 8:30. Posted 4January2014. <http://vimeo.com/83390470>. This version of Allison Schulnik's production was up loaded by 'garaco taco' prior to Schulnik's exhibit at ZieherSmith in New York, January 9th to February 22nd, 2014. A subsequent posting on by 'garaco p. Fleshy' on 12January2014 at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YbKasfNak4U>. Formatted to download immediately.
- _____. *Forest*. 2010. NTSC colour DVD, 4:32 min. Clay stop-motion animation, puppet, clay painting and free form with mixed media. Grizzly Bear sound track. Lighting credits are attributed to Helder K. Sun. This work can be called an official music video as it represents collaboration between animator and the Brooklyn New York Indie-Rock band, Grizzly Bear. See, <http://grizzly-bear.net/videos/ready-able-official-music-video/>. The "Ready, Able" Grizzly Bear song from the May 26, 2009 album *Veckatimest*. The importance of the song's pulsing rhythm as a non-diegetic sound bridge between the montage images that link together an abstracted narration as the Hobo Clown (Long Haired Hobo Clown) dressed in white ascends into an 'other' world. Sound cues from the song construct stingers for sequences where the main character's encounter of a mirrored self across a water feature, creatures, green men,

faces and environments of transforming metamorphoses alternate within juxtaposed settings. This experimental film includes images of moon stills lasting only flash duration on screen. A final vision of three alive miniature heads upon the crown of the Hobo Clown figure suggest a playful story has been told with the potential for allegorical deep meaning.

_____. "Forest." *YouTube* Online digital video, 4:32. Posted 14 January 2010 by Mark Moore Gallery. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pDxiXCNSdc>. The work was also uploaded onto Vimeo the same day by Marshall W, 14 January 2010, 4:31. <http://vimeo.com/8748931>. And again by 'FIBRA' 26 March 2010, 4:31. <http://vimeo.com/10459766>.

_____. *Hobo Clown*. 2008. NTSC colour DVD, 5:10 min. Clay stop-motion animation, puppet, object and clay painting. The Grizzly Bear song "Granny Diner" is the sound track from the *Friend* album, 2007. The film features a transforming Hobo Clown character. The metamorphosis of the Hobo Clown from pathos of dark back alley setting wearing black to a white dressed wanderer in a bright garden of flowers ultimately becomes a distorted figure of incomplete description. This experimental, abstracted narration depicts is interpreted as a journey of self-interiority.

_____. "HOBO CLOWN, Copyright 2008." *Allison Schulnik*. Internet website. http://www.allisonschulnik.com/FILM/HOBO_CLOWN.html. Instructions are as follows, "ALLOW MOVIE TO LOAD 3-10 minutes DEPENDING ON COMPUTER SPEED BEFORE VIEWING."

_____. "Hobo Clown." *YouTube* Online digital video, 5:11. Posted 9 August 2009. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_M8ejo974vk. by Grizzly Bear Band followed by an Online High Definition video, 5:10, on Vimeo, posted 8 January 2010 by Guernica Magazine. <http://vimeo.com/8619794>. This production is identified as released 4 September 2008 on IMDb, http://imdb.com/title/tt1399272/releaseinfo?ref_=tt_dt_dt#releases.

_____. *Mound*. 2011. NTSC colour DVD, 4:23 min. Clay stop-motion animation, puppet, clay painting. The sound track musical credit is Noel Scott Engel (stage name Scott Walker) for "It's Raining Today" from the album *Scott 3* 1969. The film is interpreted as a collection of concentric settings; each inserted within the other. A cast of characters assembled all in values of white intermingle and transform seemingly magically. Forest fungi and owls and the dark woods is the exterior to an ensemble of fantastic people in an enchanted clearing. At the film's heart is a mound of humanity moves in unity to the mystic music as a metamorphoses of changing dynamics. Finally, the dancers that perform choreographed movements thread a unity between a magic of place and a greater presence suggested by the *Mound* and five dancers' enigmatic faced garments.

_____. "Mound." *Vimeo* High Definition digital Online video, 4:23. Posted 25 October 2011 by 'garaco taco' at <http://vimeo.com/83390470>. A following online posting by 'vebiification' at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dtdWM6ISCFs>. And again 'v4itel' posted on 31 March 2012. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1tN3NOmZWwg>.

_____. "Vedma." *12 Angry Women: By filmmakers for filmmakers*. Hollywood, CA: Crest National, 2003. DVD, 101 min. Listed with *WorldCat* where this compilation is described as the best independent short films from 2000-2002 screened at the *Slamdance Film Festival*. Schulnik's *Vedma* 2000, 5 min. film is included in this archive.

- _____. "Vedma." *The Dirty Dozen. IV, 12 Angry Women*. Park City, Utah: Slamdance Film Festival, 2003. Videodisc, 101 min.
- _____. *Vedma*. Valencia, CA: Allison Schulnik, 1999. 16 mm, 5:30 min. Experimental, stop-motion animation. The folk figure, Vedma, is associated with Eastern European tales of a witch. In Schulnik's film the court jester is desperate to impress the witch of the castle. The jester's provoking humour displeases the witch who, once provoked, explodes the jester slimming the castle and realm with what ultimately produces the demise of the witch. See Film Threats review, <http://www.filmthreat.com/reviews/147/>.
- _____. "Vedma, Experimental, Stop-Motion animation, 5:30." *CalArts School of Film/Video showcase 1999 Animation Program*. Valencia, CA: California Institute of the Arts, School of Film/Video, 1999. DVD, 90 min.
- _____. *Pistachio*. Valencia, CA: Allison Schulnik, 1998. 16 mm., 7:00 min. Experimental, stop-action animation. A description of film unknown.
- _____. "Pistachio, 16 mm experimental, stop-motion animated." *Character animation show*, 2000: open show. 2 videodisc, DVD, sd., Col.; 4 ¾ in. Valencia, CA: California Institute of the Arts, School of Film/Video, 2000, 7:00 min.
- _____. "Vedma, Stop-Motion, 5:30 min." *Jules Engel Collection*. Valencia, CA: California Institute of the Arts, School of Film/Video, 1999. 1 Videocassette : sd., col. ; ½ in. VHS, 80 min.
- _____. *The Slaying*. Valencia, CA: Allison Schulnik, 1997. 16mm. Live action and stop-motion animation. Unknown duration. A description of the film is unknown.
- The Vermont Studio Center*. "Allison Schulnik Speaks at The Vermont Studio Center." Lecture presentation by Allison Schulnik, Filmed January 23, 2014. Online High definition digital, 38:06. Posted 12February 2014. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=eDncuLL2Bo4>. Accessed December 30, 2014. A poor sound quality recording of a slide presentation of studio practice that includes diverse media and examples of gallery installations. Two animation projects: Mound 2012 and Eager 2014 begin this detailed journey into the artist's career. Also, www.youtube.com/channel/UC7dQp8FPyKNJNqJKR3t96JA. Posted one year ago (January 2014)
- Visual Creatures. "Allison Schulnik Studio Visit." *Beautiful/Decay Magazine* and *Visual Creatures*, Online High Definition digital, 4:08. Posted 11July2013. <http://vimeo.com/45596562>. Accessed July 30, 2013. A soft spoken Allison Schulnik is interviewed in situ within Schulnik's studio while describing the influences of family and the experience of finding objects and observing people upon the numerous media that represent a diverse artistic practice. Music by Black Iris.
- Walker, Scott. "It's Raining Today." Written by Scott Walker (born, Noel Scott Engel) for *Scott 3*, Philips Records, Smash Records, March 1969, 33 ½ vinyl.
- Yahnker, Eric. *Big City Fish*. Valencia, CA: California Institute of the Arts, 2000. DVD, 8:00 min. Black and white animated short. The description on *IMDb* tells of a band of Trail Elves dressed in uniforms of appliance boxes that descend upon the city for the annual door-to-door sale of folding chairs to benefit charity. A group of tough characters ready themselves to resist giving a single penny to the Trail Elves even in a clash of "movie-showdown clichés." The question for audiences is whether the Trail Elves are a menace or sweet innocents. Allison Schulnik is a voice of an Elf. This production was presented at the Palm Springs International Film Festival in 2000.